### THE

# "Orphic" Gold Tablets and Greek Religion

FURTHER ALONG THE PATH



EDITED BY

RADCLIFFE G. EDMONDS III

CAMBRIDGE

Material com direitos autorais

### CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Dubai, Tokyo, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521518314

© Cambridge University Press 2011

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2011

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-0-521-51831-4 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

### Contents

List of contributors		page vii
Ack	knowledgements	viii
No	te on abberivations	X
PAI	RT I THE TABLET TEXTS	I
Ι	Who are you? A brief history of the scholarship Radcliffe G. Edmonds III	3
2	apparatus and tables	
	Radcliffe G. Edmonds III	15
PAI	RT II TEXTS AND CONTEXTS	51
3	Text and ritual: The Corpus Eschatologicum of the Orphics Fritz Graf	53
4	Are the "Orphic" gold leaves Orphic? Alberto Bernabé and Ana I. Jiménez San Cristóbal	68
5	"A child of Earth am I and of starry Heaven": Concerning the anthropology of the Orphic gold tablets  Hans Dieter Betz (translated by Maria Sturm)	102
6	Common motifs in the "Orphic" B tablets and Egyptian funerary texts: Continuity or convergence?  Thomas M. Dousa	120
7	Center, periphery, or peripheral center: A Cretan connection for the gold lamellae of Crete  Yannis Z. Tzifopoulos	165
	I william Zi. I sijopomios	10)

vi Contents

PART III SEMIOTIC AND NARRATIVE ANALYSES		201
8	Funerary gold lamellae and Orphic papyrus commentaries: Same use, different purpose Claude Calame (translated by Sarah Melker)	203
9	Initiation – death – underworld: Narrative and ritual in the gold leaves  Christoph Riedweg	219
10	Sacred scripture or oracles for the dead? The semiotic situation of the "Orphic" gold tablets  Radcliffe G. Edmonds III	257
II	Dialogues of immortality from the <i>Iliad</i> to the gold leaves Miguel Herrero de Jáuregui	271
12	Poetry and performance in the Orphic gold leaves Dirk Obbink	291
13	Rushing into milk: New perspectives on the gold tablets Christopher A. Faraone	310
Con	mpiled Bibliography	331
Ina	Index	
Index locorum		375

### Contributors

- ALBERTO BERNABÉ, Catedrático de Filología Griega, Universidad Complutense de Madrid.
- HANS DIETER BETZ, Shailer Mathews Professor of New Testament Studies (emeritus), University of Chicago.
- CLAUDE CALAME, Directeur d'études en littérature grecque et société à l'École des Hautes Études en Sciences Sociales, Paris.
- THOMAS M. DOUSA, doctoral student, Graduate School of Library and Information Science, University of Illinois, Urbana-Champaign.
- RADCLIFFE G. EDMONDS III, Associate Professor of Greek, Latin & Classical Studies, Bryn Mawr College.
- CHRISTOPHER A. FARAONE, The Frank Curtis Springer and Gertrude Melcher Springer Professor in the Humanities and in the College, University of Chicago.
- FRITZ GRAF, Professor of Greek and Latin, The Ohio State University.
- MIGUEL HERRERO DE JÁUREGUI, Investigador Contratado Ramón y Cajal, Departamento de Filología Griega y Lingüística Indoeuropea, Universidad Complutense de Madrid.
- ANA I. JIMÉNEZ SAN CRISTÓBAL, Profesora Titular de Filología Griega, Universidad Complutense de Madrid.
- DIRK OBBINK, Professor of Classical Studies, University of Michigan.
- CHRISTOPH RIEDWEG, Professor of Classics/Greek Literature, University of Zürich, currently Director of the Swiss Institute in Rome.
- YANNIS Z. TZIFOPOULOS, Associate Professor of Greek and Epigraphy, Aristotelian University of Thessaloniki.

### Acknowledgements

In some sense, this volume represents the thoughts that emerged, not from a single conference, but from a series of conferences. The first was a conference, "Roads Not Taken: Explorations of the 'Orphic' Gold Tablets," which, under the guidance of our mentor, Christopher Faraone, I put together with Sarah Cohen in 1997 at the Franke Institute for the Humanities at the University of Chicago while we were both graduate students. At that conference, Hans Dieter Betz presented an English version of the paper he was preparing for the festschrift for Walter Burkert that was published the subsequent year. Fritz Graf presented an overview of the tablets and their place within Orphic eschatological literature, ideas which were subsequently adapted and published in an Italian collection. Thomas Dousa, then a graduate student at the Oriental Institute at Chicago, presented a version of the paper he has expanded and revised for this volume. The second conference was the Vergilian Society's Symposium Cumanum "The Cults of Magna Graecia," in June 2002, where I first met Alberto Bernabé and Ana Jiménez and began our long, stimulating, and fruitful dialogue about the nature of Orphic materials. The third conference was "Orfeo y el orfismo: nuevas perspectivas," organized by Bernabé and his colleague, Francesc Casadesús, in Mallorca, Spain, in February 2005. At this conference I met Christoph Riedweg and Miguel Herrero, and began to formulate the idea of putting together this volume, including the papers that Herrero and I presented at that conference.

Some additions have been made to the papers that grew out of these conferences, notably the seminal article of Claude Calame, which was so influential for subsequent scholarship, and the work of Yannis Tzifopoulos. Dirk Obbink's paper had been presented at the APA in 1992, but was never published, although it was cited several times by members of that original audience. Christopher Faraone, whose essay also appears in this volume, was the one who suggested that I try to get it published, and I thank him

and Dirk Obbink for their efforts in bringing this nearly lost text back into the light.

None of these essays has appeared in quite the same form before, but some have been translated or otherwise adapted from previously published pieces. Fritz Graf's chapter, "Text and Ritual: The Corpus Eschatologicum of the Orphics" was originally published as "Text and Ritual: The Corpus Eschatologicum of the Orphics," in La letteratura pseudepigrafa nella cultura greca e romana, Atti di un incontro di studi Napoli, 15-17 gennaio 1998, ed. Giovanni Cerri, Naples, 2000, pp. 59-77. "Are the 'Orphic' Gold Leaves Orphic?" by Alberto Bernabé and Ana I. Jiménez San Cristóbal is an adapted translation from their 2001 volume, Instrucciones para el más allá. Las laminillas órficas de oro, now published in English as A. Bernabé and A. I. Jiménez San Cristóbal (2008) Instructions for the Netherworld. The Orphic Gold Tablets, Leiden, Boston, MA and Cologne. "A Child of Earth am I and of starry Heaven': Concerning the Anthropology of the Orphic Gold Tablets" by Hans Dieter Betz was originally published as "Der Erde Kind bin ich und des gestirnten Himmels': Zur Lehre vom Menschen in den orphischen Goldplättchen," from Ansichten griechischer Rituale: Geburtstags-Symposium für Walter Burkert, ed. Fritz Graf, B.G. Teubner: Stuttgart and Leipzig, 1998, pp. 399-419, and has been translated for this volume by Maria Sturm. Claude Calame's "'Orphic' Invocations and Commentaries: Funerary Transpositions of Religious Discourse" was originally published as "Invocations et commentaires 'orphiques': Transpositions funéraires de discours religieux," from Discours religieux dans l'antiquité, ed. Marie-Madeleine Mactoux and Evelyne Geny, Annales littéraires de l'Université de Besançon, no. 578, Les Belles Lettres: Paris, 1995, pp. 11–30, and has been translated for this volume by Sarah Melker. Christoph Riedweg's "Initiation - Death - Underworld: Narrative and Ritual in the Gold Leaves" was originally published as "Initiation - Tod - Unterwelt: Beobachtungen zur Kommunikationssituation und narrativen Technik der orphisch-bakchischen Goldblättchen," from Ansichten griechischer Rituale: Geburtstags-Symposium für Walter Burkert, ed. Fritz Graf, B.G. Teubner: Stuttgart and Leipzig, 1998, pp. 359-398, but has been adapted and translated for this volume by the author, with the assistance of Andreas Schatzmann, incorporating material from Riedweg's "Poésie orphique et rituel initiatique: Éléments d'un 'Discours sacré' dans les lamelles d'or," Revue de l'histoire des religions 219: 459-481. My thanks to all of those involved in the laborious process of translation, adaptation, and editing of all these essays, and especially to Edward Whitehouse for his work on the indexes.

### The tablet texts

To explain these odd texts, the excavators called in the eminent classicist Domenico Comparetti, and Comparetti's explanation set the terms of the debate for the next century and a quarter. In his article in the 1882 *Journal of Hellenic Studies*, Comparetti linked the tablets from Thurii with another tablet, discovered in nearby Petelia nearly forty years earlier, in which the speaker claims to be the "child of Earth and starry Heaven."

You will find in the halls of Hades a spring on the left, and standing by it, a glowing white cypress tree;
Do not approach this spring at all.
You will find the other, from the lake of Memory, refreshing water flowing forth. But guardians are nearby.
Say: "I am the child of Earth and starry Heaven;
But my race is heavenly; and this you know yourselves.
But I am parched with thirst and I perish; but give me quickly refreshing water flowing forth from the lake of Memory."
And then they will give you to drink from the divine spring, And then you will celebrate? [the rites? with] the heroes.
This [is the ? . . . of Memory, when you are about] to die ...
?write this? . . . . . ].?? shadow covering around

The mention of the water of Memory had led the first editors to associate the tablet with the oracle of Trophonius described by Pausanias. The child of Earth and starry Heaven they naturally read as Mnemosyne, goddess of Memory, since all the deities of the pre-Olympian generation had Gaia and Ouranos as parents. Comparetti, however, proposed a different reading. He understood the "child of Earth and starry Heaven" to refer to the Titans, and he took the references to lightning and unjust deeds in the Thurii tablets to refer to murder by the Titans of the infant Dionysos, for which they were blasted by Zeus' lightning.

Drawing on the account in the Neoplatonist Olympiodorus, Comparetti postulated an Orphic doctrine of original sin, founded on the shared guilt of mankind as descendants of the Titans. The tablets, he argued, provide evidence for "the main principles of the Orphic doctrine on psychogony and metempsychosis", since the Olympiodoran myth of anthropogony from the remains of the Titans furnishes mankind with a Titanic element, mixed in with the pure divinity of the soul. "This Titanic element is the original guilt for which the human soul is excluded from the community of the other gods and from her blessed abode, and is condemned to a succession of births and deaths." The anthropogony, attested explicitly only in the sixth CE

<sup>2</sup> Comparetti 1882: 116.

Goettling 1843: 8. The first publication of the Petelia tablet was in Franz 1836: 149-150.

You have wine as your fortunate honor.

And you go beneath the earth, celebrating rites just like the other blessed ones.

These texts share one salient feature with the tablets from Thurii, the peculiar slogan of an animal going into milk, but they are otherwise different from the other types of tablet. However, the prominent role for Dionysos, under the name of Bacchios, renewed the question of the relation of the tablets, and Orphism in general, to Dionysiac cult, especially since the Hipponion tablet promised that the deceased would walk along the sacred road with the other mystai and bacchoi.

Two recent publications of tablets from Pherai in Thessaly present something different yet again, raising further questions about the tablets' relations to Bacchic or Metroac mysteries. One tablet contains a mystic password – *Andrikepaidothyrsou*, along with an invocation of the goddess Brimo, a figure often identified with Demeter or Hekate.

Passwords: Male child of the thyrsos, Male child of the thyrsos; Brimo, Brimo;

Enter the sacred meadow. For the initiate is without penalty.

Another proclaims bearer's connection with the rites of Demeter and the Mountain Mother.

Send me to the thiasos of the initiates. I have [seen] the festivals, the rites of Demeter Chthonia and of the Mountain Mother.

In recent years, a number of even shorter tablets have been discovered in tombs in Thessaly and Macedonia, many containing simply the name of the deceased or the title, *mystes* – initiate. Clearly, these tablets too were designed for initiates in some mystery, or at least for those claiming the privileges of the initiate. Other tablets convey a greeting to Plouton or Persephone from the deceased, but none of these shorter tablets shares the single uniting feature of all the other gold tablets, a narrative of the soul's journey to the underworld. Such brevity makes drawing the line between "Orphic" gold tablets and, for example, protective amulets on gold lamellae very difficult. While these shorter tablets may come from the same sort of religious context as the other tablets, only the tablets with a narrative lend themselves to the sort of semiotic analysis that has been one of the more fruitful tools for illuminating the enigmatic tablets in recent years.

The discovery of new types of tablets and the continued uncovering of new examples has once again sparked debate over the nature and contexts of these enigmatic documents. Despite the fact that the images of lightning and unjust deeds appear confined to the tablets of Timpone Piccolo at

- 1 BJ, Ζ "Ερχομαι ἐκ κοθαρῶ«ν» κοθαρά, : PC "Ερχομαι ἐκ κοθαρῶ«ν», κοθαρά.
- 4 BJ, Z άλκλεά με Μοκίερ' (α) έδάμασκο (καὶ άθάνατοι θεοὶ ἄλλοι) καὶ: GJ άλά με Μοκίερα έδάμασε καὶ άθάνατοι θεοὶ ἄλλοι καὶ άσστεροβλῆ τα κκεραυνῶι, Colli άλκλεά με Μοκίερ' (α) έδάμασκο καὶ άθάνατοι θεοὶ ἄλλοι καὶ άσστεροβλῆ τα κκεραυνῶι, BJ, Z κκεραυνῶι: lam. Comparetti, Kern, GJ κκεραυνόν, TG, PC, Dieterich, O κκεραυνῶν, Kaibel κκεραυνός.
- 8 ΒΙ {ιμερτοδαπεβανστεμανοποσικαρπασιμοισι}: GΙ ἱμερτοῦ δ' ἐπέβαν στεφάνου ποσὶ καρπαλίμοισι, Kern, Colli, PC, TG ἱμερτοῦ δ' ἀπέβαν στεφάνου ποσὶ καρπαλίμοισι.

EPXOMAIEKKO@APOKO@APAX@ONIBA ΣΙΛΕΙΑΕΥΚΛΗΣΕΥΒΟΛΕΥΣΤΕΚΑΙΑ ΘΑΝΑΤΟΙΘΕΟΙΑΛΛΟΙΚΑΙΓΑΡΕΓώΝ ΥΜώνγενοσολβιονεύχομαι ΕΙΜΕΝΑΛΑΜΕΜΟΡΑΕΔΑΜΑΣΕ ΚΑΙΑΘΑΝΑΤΟΙΘΕΟΙΑΛΛΟΙΚΑΙΑΣ ΣΤΕΡΟΒΛΗΤΑΚΕΡΑΥΝΟΝΚΥΚΛΟ ΔΕΖΕΠΤΑΝΒΑΡΥΠΕΝΘΕΟΣΑΡΓΑ ΛΕΟΙΟΙΜΕΡΤΟΔΕΠΕΒΑΝΣΤΕΦΑ ΝΟΠΟΣΙΚΑΡΠΑΛΙΜΟΙΣΙΔΕΣΣΠΟΙ ΝΑΣΔΕΥΠΟΚΟΛΠΟΝΕΔΥΝΧΘΟΝΙ ΑΣΒΑΣΙΛΕΙΑΣΙΜΕΡΤΟΔΑΠΕΒΑΝ ΣΤΕΜΑΝΟΠΟΣΙΚΑΡΠΑΣΙΜΟΙ ΣΙΟΛΒΙΕΚΑΙΜΑΚΑΡΙΣΤΕΘΕΟΣΔΕ ΣΗΙΑΝΤΙΒΡΟΤΟΙΟΕΡΙΦΟΣΕΣΓΑΛΕΠΕΤΟ N

As Rome, 2nd century CE (65 × 24 mm) OF 491

Pure she comes from the pure, Queen of those below the earth,

Eukles and Eubouleus, child of Zeus. But receive
this gift of Memory, famed in song among men.

"Caecilia Secundina, come, having become a goddess by the custom."

"Ερχεται ἐκ καθαρῶν καθαρά, χθονίων βασίλεια, Εὔκλεες Εὐβουλεῦ τε Διὸς τέκος∙ ἀλλὰ δέχεσθε Μνημοσύνης τόδε δῶρον ἀοίδιμον ἀνθρώποισιν. Καικιλία Σεκουνδεῖνα, νόμωι ἴθι δῖα γεγῶσα.

- 1 ΒJ, Ζ καθαρών καθαρά, : PC καθαρών, καθαρά.
- 2 BJ, GJ, West Διὸς τέκος· ἀλλὰ δέχεσθε: Z, PC, TG Διὸς τέκος ἀγλαά· ἔχω δὲ, Colli Διὸς τέκος. ἀγλαά ἔχω δὴ, Murray ὅπλα δ' ἔχ' ὧδε Μνημοσύνης. = hic recipe Memoriae arma.
- 4 BJ, Z, PC νόμωι ἴθι δῖα γεγῶσα: Colli νόμωι ἴθι θ‹ε›ία γεγῶσα, Murray νόμωι ἴθι θῖα γεγῶσα.

ΕΡΧΕΤΑΙΕΚΚΑΘΑΡωΝΚΑΘΑΡΑ ΧΘΟΝΙωνβασιλειαευκλεεσευβου Λευτεδιοστεκοσαγλααεχωδεμνημο συνηστοδεδωροναοιδιμονανθρω ποιδινκαικιλιασεκουνδείνανομωι Ιθιδιαγεγωσα

B3 Eleutherna, 2nd–1st century BCE (56 × 10 mm) OF 478

I am parched with thirst and I perish. But give me to drink from the everflowing spring on the right, where the cypress is. "Who are you? From where are you?" I am the son of Earth and starry Heaven.

Δίψαι αὖος ἐγὼ καὶ ἀπόλλυμαι· ἀλλὰ πιέ‹ν› μοι κράνας αἰειρόω ἐπὶ δεξιά, τῆ‹ι› κυφάρισσος. τίς δ' ἐσσί; πῶ δ' ἐσσί; Γᾶς υἱός ἠμι καὶ ὑρανῶ ἀστερόεντος.

- 1 BJ: PC, Comp. πιέ<μ> μοι; Ο, Colli πιέ μοι.
- 2 BJ, Comp. τῆ<ι> : GJ, TG, Z τῆ; BJ, Colli κυφάρισσος: PC κυφάριζος, Ο κυφάρισος.
- 3 BJ, Colli τίς δ' ἐσσί; πῶ δ' ἐσσί; PC τίς δ' ἐζί; πῶ δ' ἐζί; Ο τίς δ' ἐσί; πῶ δ' ἐσί;

ΔΙΨΑΙΑΥΟCΕΓωκαιαπολλυμαιαλλαπιεμοι Κραναcαιειροωεπιδεξιατηκυφαρίζος Τισδεζιπωδεζιγασυίοσημικαιωρανω αστεροέντος

B9 Thessaly?, 4th century BCE (22 × 37 mm) OF 484

I am parched with thirst and I perish. But give me to drink from the ever-flowing spring. On the right is a white cypress. "Who are you? From where are you?" I am the son of Earth and starry Heaven. But my race is heavenly.

Δίψαι αὖος ἐγὼ κ‹αὶ› ἀπόλλυμαι· ἀλλὰ πίε μου κράνας αἰειρόω. ἐπὶ δεξιὰ λευκὴ κυπάρισσος τίς δ' ἐσί; πῶ δ' ἐσί; Γᾶς υἱός εἰμι καὶ Οὐρανοῦ ἀστερόεντος αὐτὰρ ἐμοὶ γένος οὐράνιον.

- 1 ΒΙ πίε μου: Cassio πίε<ν» μου.
- 2 BJ ἐπὶ δεξιὰ: Gallavotti ἐπιδεξιὰ.

ΔΙΨΑΙΑΥΟΣΕΓωΚΑΠΟΛΛΥΜΑΙ ΑΛΛΑΠΙΕΜΟΥΚΡΑΝΑΣΑΙΕΙΡΟω ΕΠΙΔΕΣΙΑΛΕΥΚΗΚΥΠΑΡΙΣΣΟΣ ΤΙΣΔΕΣΙΠωδεΣΙΓΑΣΥΙΟΣΕΙΜΙ ΚΑΙΟΥΡΑΝΟΥΑΣΤΕΡΟΕΝΤΟΣ ΑΥΤΑΡΕΜΟΙΓΕΝΟΣΟΥΡΑΝΙΟΝ

αὐτὰρ ἐ[μοὶ γένος οὐράνιον· τόδε δ' ἴστε καὶ αὐτοί. καὶ τοὶ δὴ[ ἐρέουσιν ὑποχθονίωι βασιλῆι καὶ τοτὲ τ[οι δώσωσιν τῆς Μνημοσύνης ἀπὸ λίμνης καὶ τοτὲ δ[ὴ σύμβολα φ[ καὶ φε[ σεν[

- Ι ΒΙ ἐπεὶ ἄμ μέλ]ληισι θανεῖσθαι: Frel ἐπεὶ ἄμ μέλ]ηνίοιν θανιεσθαι, Riedweg Μνημοσύνης τόδε ... ἐπεὶ ἄμ μέλ]ληισι θανεῖσθαι.
- 2 Riedweg μ]εμνήμε «ν»ος ἥρως: Frel ]ἐμνήμεος ἥρως.
- 3 Riedweg ἀμφικαλύψας: Frel ἀμφικαλύψαι
- 4 Riedweg εὐρήσεις δ' Ἀΐδαο δόμοις, ἐπὶ ]δεξιὰ λίμνην: BJ ἐπὶ ]δεξιὰ λίμνην, Frel ἐστ' ἐπὶ ]δεξιὰ λίμνην.
- 5 Riedweg έστη]κῦαν: Frel έστη]κῦαι.
- 11 Riedweg σκότο]ς όρφ{ο}νήεντο<ς>: Frel σκότος?] μου φονηεντά.
- 13 Riedweg δότε μμοὶ: Frel δοτεμμοὶ.
- 15 Riedweg αὐτὰρ ἐ[μοὶ γένος οὐράνιον· τόδε δ' ἴστε καὶ αὐτοί.: Frel αὐτὰρ ἐ[μοὶ γένος οὐράνιον·
- 17 Riedweg καὶ τοτὲ τ[οι δώσωσιν τῆς Μνημοσύνης ἀπὸ λίμνης: Frel καὶ τοτὲ τ[οι πιεῖν ὕδωρ πρόρεον.
- 18 Riedweg: καὶ τοτὲ δ[ἡ: Frel καὶ τοτὲ τ[οι δώσωσιν τῆς Μνημοσύνης ἀπὸ λίμνης.

D2 Pelinna, ca. 275 BCE (35 × 30 mm) OF 486

Now you have died and now you have been born, thrice blessed one, on this very day.

Say to Persephone that Bacchios himself freed you. A bull you rushed to milk.

A ram you fell into milk.

You have wine as your fortunate honor.

νῦν ἔθανες καὶ νῦν ἐγένου, τρισόλβιε, ἄματι ‹τῶι›δε. «ε›ἰπ[ε]ῖν Φερσεφό«ναι σ'› ὅτι Βά«κ»χιος αὐτὸς ἔλυσε. ταῦρος ἐςς γάλα ἔθορ«ε»ς. κριὸς ἐς γάλα ἔπεσεςς. οἶνον ἔχεις εὐδ«αί»μον«α» τιμήν.

5 BJ, GJ εὐδ‹α›ίμονα τιμὴ‹ν›: PC εὐδ‹α›ίμον τιμὴ‹ν›, ΤΡ εὐδ‹α›ίμον, ἄτιμο‹ν›.

ΝΥΝΕΘΑΝΕ ΚΑΙΝΎΝΕ ΓΕΝΟΥΤΡΙΟΟΛ ΒΙΕΑΜΑΤΙ ΔΕΙΠΕΙΝΦΕΡ CΕΦΟΟΤΙΒΑΧΙΟ CAYΤΟCΕΛΎCΕ ΤΑΥΡΟCΕΓΑΛΑΕ ΘΟΡΟΚΡΙΟCΕΟΓΑΛΑ ΕΠΕCΕΟΙΝΟΝΕ ΧΕΙCΕΥΔ

-----

MON TIM HN

D3 Pherai, 4th century BCE OF 493

Passwords: Man-boy-thyrsos, Man-boy-thyrsos. Brimo, Brimo. Enter the sacred meadow. For the initiate is without penalty.

σύμβολα· Ἀν<δ>ρικεπαιδόθυρσον. Ἀνδρικεπαιδόθυρσον. Βριμώ. Βριμώ. εἴσιθ<ι> ἱερὸν λειμῶνα. ἄποινος γὰρ ὁ μύστης. ΓΑΠΕΔΟΝ

2 lam.: BJ ex Hordern 2000 ὑπέδυν.

Table 2.2 GROUP A - Lamellae with "Pure from the Pure" formula

	Provenance	Date	Gender	Shape	Position in grave	Coin	Burial and grave-goods
Az	Thurii, Italy	IV C. BCE	not known	rectangular unfolded	close to hand	no	Inhumation. A tumulus of three strata: in the first more than ten persons carelessly interred; in the second fragments of pottery; in the third gravel mixed with sand and lime. In this lower third, three graves were found (Az-A3). In the four corners of the chamber of cist-grave 1 small hollows filled with ashes of bones and plants, indications of funeral sacrifice; no mention of a coffin; no other offerings
A2	Thurii, Italy	IV C. BCE	not known	rectangular folded once	close to hand	по	Inhumation. Under the tumulus (A1 above) cist-grave 3: no mention of a coffin; no other offerings
A3	Thurii, Italy	IV C. BCE	not known	rectangular unfolded	close to hand	no	Inhumation. Under the tumulus (A1 above) cist-grave 2: no mention of a coffin; no other offerings
A4	Italy	IV C. BCE	male?	rectangular folded nine times and placed inside no. C1 (table 2.4) which was folded like an envelope	near the cranium	no	Inhumation (partial cremation). Above the grave: a tumulus of eight strata, each consisting of ashes and carbon and burnt pottery sherds topped by earth above, indication of rituals and sacrifices and worship of the dead inside as a hero. Ouside the grave: a few small black vases. Inside: bronze locks of the coffin, two silver medallions on the chest decorated with female heads, similar to the ones of Persephone on Apulian vases, a few small pieces of gold from the dress's decoration, two small wooden boxes with inlaid palmettes. The cremation took place in situ and the remains were simply covered by a white sheet which disintegrated when touched by the excavators
A5	Rome, Italy	II C. CE	female	not known	not known	not known	not known

Bro	Hipponion, Italy	са, 400	female?	rectangular folded four times	on upper part of chest (hung by perishable material?)		Inhumation in tile-covered grave. Outside: a clay lamp and two skyphoi, one of them with a graffito. Inside: to the right of cranium a small clay jug and to the left bronze fragments of a ring with an incised representation; at the right elbow a hydria and a bronze semi-sphere with a hole of a bell(?); on the pelvis a skyphos; at the left hand a gold finger-ring, a clay lamp, a hydria and two clay lekythoi to the left and right of the left thighbone
Bit	Entella?, West Sicily	III c.?	not known	rectangular	not known	not known	not known
B12	Sfakaki, Crete	II-I C.	not known	rectangular unfolded	not known	not known	Inhumation in looted tile-grave above no. B 10. Thirty-two clay unguentaria, fragments of glass, a bronze mirror, small bronze and gilt fragments

Table 2.4 GROUP C Lamella with "Orphic" text

95	Provenance	Date	Gender	Shape	Position in grave	Coin	Burial and grave-goods
Cı	Thurii, Italy	IV C. BCE	male?	above no. A4 (table 2)	above no. A4 (table 2)	above no. A4 (table 2)	above no. A4 (table 2)

Table 2.5 GROUP D Lamellae with Dionysos and Persephone (and/or Demeter) and other deities

	Provenance	Date BCE	Gender	Shape	Position in grave	Coin	Burial and grave-goods
D1/2	Pelinna, Thessaly	Cal. 275	female	ivy-leaves	two on chest	danake in mouth with gorgon; coin of Antigonos Gonatas	Inhumation in marble sarcophagus: in the cranium a wreath of lead stem, clay gilt berrie and gilt bronze myrtle leaves with gold ornament; near the cranium: a clay aryter, a clay bowl, two gold spirals ending in snakeheads; near the feet clay aryter with a lamp inside, clay unguentarium, two bowls, a shallow skyphos; by the feet bronze lebes with bones of a neonate. On the cover slab of marble sarcophagus: two clay bowls and fragments of a third, clay feeder and clay figurine of comic actor sitting on an altar
$D_3$	Pherai, Thessaly	са. 300	not known	rectangular	on chest?	not known	not known
$D_4$	Amphipolis, Macedonia	320-280	female	rectangular	folded on chest	silver coin Philip II	Inhumation in stone sarcophagus looted. Gold ring and finger-ring; stone-constructed exedra for funeral rituals
D5	Pherai, Thessaly	ca. 300	not known	rectangular	not known	not known	Cremation? in marble osteotheke cylindrical(?) with few bones and ashes

Table 2.6 GROUP E Lamellae and epistomia with chaire-formula to Plouton and/or Persephone

	Provenance	Date BCE	Gender	Shape	Position in grave	Coin	Burial and grave-goods
Er	Agios Athanasios, Macedonia	ш с.	female	rectangular	not known	not known	Not known if Macedonian tomb looted. Trapezoid construction at the entrance for the funeral supper; gold earrings, Illyrian type pin, clay figurines
E2	Eleutherna, Crete not known	п-т с.	not	known	rectangular	not known	not known
E3	Aigai (Vergina), Macedonia	111-1 c.	female	not known	not known	not known	Cremation under tumulus looted? Hellenistic pottery
E4	Pella, Macedonia	са, 300	male	myrtle? (laurel)	on bench of the grave's W side	no	Many glass and bone fragments from the decoration of the wooden bier and its legs with incised representation of griffin tearing a deer; iron fragments from bier or small box part of iron strigil, iron pin; gilt clay myrtle-berries from a wreath. On the bench of the grave's W side: forty-one gilt clay pebbles in the shape of acorn; forty-six bone astragalo and a bone pebble; fragment of alabaster, and a clay fragment of female figurine
Es	Sfakaki, Crete	20 BCE- 40 CE	male(?)	'mouth'	mouth	bronze on chest	Inhumation in cist-grave. Clay and bronze prochous, clay unguentarium, lekythion, two glass phialae, a bronze strigil obsidian flake

Table 2.7 (cont.)

	Provenance	Date BCE	Gender	Shape	Position in grave	Coin	Burial and grave-goods
	5074 82 00	8	56 7007	70700 - 107 - 4-4-5		2000 20 88	bone fragments from a small wooden box in which bronze folding mirror, iron tweezers, iron scissors, clay unguentarium, clay pyxis
F8	Pydna, Pieria	336–300	female	gold coin of Philip II	in the mouth	gold coin of Philip II	Inhumation in cist-grave with pit-grave (F9) immediately to the S: ivory fragments from the bier, bronze ladle, bronze bell, a lead pyxis and seven clay vases
Fg	Pydna, Pieria	336–300	male	gold coin of Philip II	in the mouth	gold coin of Philip II	Inhumation in pit-grave immediately to the N of cist- grave (F8): ivory fragments from the bier, two bronze-gilt wreaths and four clay vessels
F10	Europos	са. 300	male	rectangular	not known	not known	Inhumation? in cist-grave looted. Glass eyes, bone fragments and bronze nails from bier's decoration; clay vases, alabasters, Phoenician vase, iron strigils, bronze gilt wreath with berries. Outside to the NE: trapezoid construction for funeral supper with pottery fragments and fragment of kantharos, bones, and shells; traces of enagismos in later times NW of the construction, bronze gilt wreath with clay gilt berries, bronze coin badly worn, red-figure pelike with amazon, griffin, and youths in gymnasium
F11	Pella, Macedonia	ca. 300	small girl	leaf	not known	not known	Inhumation in cist-grave. Gold finger-ring with incised animal; gold earrings of Cupids
$F_{12}$	Dion	ca. 300?	male	small disc	not known	small disc?	Not known from Macedonian tomb V.
F13	Daphniotissa, Elis	Late IV, early III c.	?	olive leaf	not known	not known	Inhumation in rectangular cist-grave, near a funerary monument, with gold ring, bronze mirror, several clay pots, one with pine resin and beeswax residue inside.

- Lloyd-Jones, H. (1985) "Pindar and the after-life," in *Pindare. Entretiens* sur l'Antiquité Classique 31, Vandoeuvres/ Geneva (Fondation Hardt): 245–279.
- Luppe, W. (1978) "Abermals das goldblättchen von Hipponion," ZPE 30: 23–26.
- Marcovich, M. (1976) "The gold leaf from Hipponion," ZPE 23: 221-224.
- Merkelbach, R. (1975) "Bakchisches goldtäfelchen aus Hipponion," ZPE 17: 8–9.
- Murray, G. (1908) "Critical appendix on the Orphic tablets," in J. E. Harrison, Prolegomena to the Study of Greek Religion, 2nd edn. (1908): 659–673.
- O Olivieri, A. (1915) Lamellae aureae orphicae. Edidit, commentario instruxit A. Olivieri. Bonn.
- PS Parker, R. and Stamatopoulou, M. (2004) "A new funerary gold leaf from Pherai," AE 143: 132.
- Pugliese Carratelli, G. (1974) "Un sepolcro di Hipponion e un nuovo testo orfico," Parola del Passato 29: 19–26.
- PC Pugliese Carratelli, G. (1993, rev. edn. 2001) *Lamine d'oro 'Orfiche'*. Milan. Ricciardelli Apicella G. (1992) "Le lamelle di Pelinna," *Studi e Materiali di Storia delle Religioni* 58: 27–39.
- Riedweg, C. (1998) "Initiation Tod Unterwelt: Beobachtungen zur Kommunikationssituation und narrativen Technik der orphisch-bakchischen Goldblättchen," in Fritz Graf (ed.), Ansichten griechischer Rituale: Geburtstags-Symposium für Walter Burkert. Stuttgart and Leipzig: 359–398.
- Sacco, G. (2001) "ΓΗΣ ΠΑΙΣ ΕΙΜΙ. Sul v. 10 della laminetta di Hipponion," ZPE 137: 27–33.
- Torjussen, S. (2008) "An inscribed gold leaf from Daphniotissa, near Elis," ZPE 166: 151–152.
- TG Tortorelli Ghidini, M. (2006) Figli della Terra e del Cielo stellato. Testi orfici con traduzione e commento. Naples.
- TP Tsantsanoglou K. and Parássoglou, G. M. (1987) "Two gold lamellae from Thessaly," *Hellenika* 38: 316.
- Tzifopoulos, Y. (2010) Paradise Earned: The 'Bacchic-Orphic' Gold Lamellae of Crete. With contributions on the archaeological context by Irene Gavrilaki, Stella Kalogeraki and Niki Tsatsaki, Popi Galanaki and Giorgos Rethemiotakis, Matthaios Bessios. Center for Hellenic Studies, Hellenic Series 23. Washington DC and Cambridge MA.
- Verdelis, N. M. (1950–51) "Χαλκὴ τεφροδόχος κάλπις ἐκ Φαρσάλων," ΑΕ 89–90: 80–105.
- West, M.L. (1975) "Zum neuen goldblättchen aus Hipponion," ZPE 18: 229–236.
- Wieten, J. H. (1915) De tribus laminis aureis quae in sepulcris Thurinis sunt inventae, Diss.phil. Leiden. Amsterdam.
- Z Zuntz, G. (1971) Persephone: Three Essays on Religion and Thought in Magna Graecia. Oxford.

# PART II

# Texts and contexts

## CHAPTER 3

# Text and ritual The Corpus Eschatologicum of the Orphics

## Fritz Graf

## INTRODUCTION

The books ascribed to Orpheus must have been legion already in the fifth century. The Euripidean Hippolytus, whom his father regards as a vegetarian and an ecstatic, is said to have Orpheus as a Lord, "to rave and to follow the smoke of many writings"; and Plato knows religious specialists who made use of "a hubbub of books by Orpheus and Musaeus." Much later, in the prologue of his own Argonautika, Orpheus gives an impressive list of what he is about to sing - a theogony, starting from Chaos, Nyx, and Phanes, followed by the narrations about Demeter and Persephone, her relationship to Zeus and her μέγα πένθος, about the myths and the cults of Cybele, the Corybants and the Cabiri, of Praxidice, Aphrodite and Adonis, Isis and Osiris, and the oracles of Nyx about Bacchus,3 but also about divination through dreams and signs, purification, "supplications of gods and gifts to the dead";4 finally a report of what he himself had seen in his travels, his descent into Hades and his visit to Egyptian Memphis, which must mean eschatology on the one hand, magic or theurgy on the other. This sounds impressive, and in some respects enigmatic - and that is just Orpheus' intention: all these, he says, are "frightful songs for mortal men, secrets without fear only to the initiates": Orpheus is the Great Initiator. The list sketches what the Imperial Epoch knew as the most salient topics of Orpheus' poems - mythology,

Originally published as Fritz Graf, "Text and Ritual: The Corpus Eschatologicum of the Orphics," in Giovanni Cerri (ed.), La letteratura pseudepigrafa nella cultura greca e romana, Atti di un incontro di studi Napoli, 15–17 gennaio 1998, Naples, 2000: 59–77. [For this second printing, I added the fragment numbers in Bernabé 2004–07 and some more recent bibliography, besides changing minor stylistic matters; the bibliographical additions are in square brackets. FG]

' Eur. Hipp. 952-954; 953f. Όρφέα τ'ἄνακτ' ἔχων βάκχευε πόλλων γραμμάτων καπνούς.

<sup>2</sup> Pl. Resp. 364a βίβλων ὅμαδον παρέχονται Μουσαίου καὶ Ὁρφέως.

3 Orph. Arg. 12-35. See on the prooemium Luiselli 1993.

4 Orph. Arg. 35-40. 5 Orph. Arg. 40-46.

<sup>6</sup> Orph. Arg. 10–11. φρικώδεα κῆλ' ἐπίφασκον, θνητοῖς ἀνθρώποισιν ἄκη, μεγάλ' ὄργια μύσταις.

Thus, the testimonies of several authors before Plato – Herodotus, Hippias of Elis, Critias, Ion – present a rather coherent picture of what Orpheus can stand for in the fifth and very early fourth century: poems of eschatological content which must have played a role in the mystery rites of the ecstatic Dionysos and whose doctrinal content was so close to Pythagorean doctrines that some authors assumed that Pythagoras or some early Pythagoreans were the real authors. If pressed to make a guess about these Pythagorean doctrines, the most plausible one is the doctrine of reincarnation. Titles are not mentioned at all – if again one might make a plausible guess, there must certainly have been a *Katabasis into Hades*. Orpheus' descent into Hades is attested in fifth century sources.<sup>22</sup> Such an eyewitness account is the most natural vehicle for eschatological contents, as Orpheus explicitly says in the prologue of the *Argonautika*.<sup>23</sup>

## THE TESTIMONIES OF PLATO

Among the testimonies about Orpheus and his poems, Plato, as we all know, plays a crucial role: he is the first preserved author to openly and verbatim cite from them. In Kern's edition, there are nineteen fragments which come from the corpus Platonicum;<sup>24</sup> Colli and Bernabé, whose editions make no distinction between testimonies and fragments, have considerably more,<sup>25</sup> underlining even more the crucial importance of Plato for our knowledge of Orpheus.<sup>26</sup>

When we try to bring order into these texts, we can distinguish several topics. The list comes close to the much longer one at the beginning of the *Argonautika*:

(1) One topic is theogony. Some items of information look rather traditional – in the Cratylus, Plato cites two hexameters which talk about Oceanus and Tethys as having performed the first marriage (ἦρξε γάμοιο): the couple is Homeric, new is the emphasis on the "first marriage."<sup>27</sup> Other things are less current; according to another hexameter, the Orphic theogony ended with the sixth generation, which gives

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> See my "Orpheus: A Poet among Men" (Graf 1987). Bernabé, in his introduction to F 707–711, lists the sources, starting with Aeschylus' Bassaridae; see also West 1983: 12.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> See above n. 4. <sup>24</sup> F 3-F 21.

Colli 1977: 4 [A 10]-4 [A 52] (43 texts). [Bernabé, whose unpublished index I could use (for which I thank its author), has 44 references.]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> See the *mise au point* by Masaracchia 1993.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Cra. 402bc = (OF 15 Kern = Colli 4 [A35] = F 22 Bernabé), cf. Hom. Il. 14.201.

58 FRITZ GRAF

two more than the Hesiodic account, from Gaia to Ouranos to Kronos to Zeus. 28 Plato is silent about the details while later authors offer diverging accounts, although they agree in putting Nyx "Night" somewhere before Ouranos and in adding Dionysos after Zeus. 29 And finally, when talking about Kronos swallowing his sons and castrating his father, Euthyphro hints at "much stranger things which the many do not know" – things clearly not in Hesiod, but in poems read only by a more or less closed group of people. 30

(2) A second topic is eschatology. In the Cratylus, Socrates proposes different etymologies for σῶμα, "body" – from σῆμα "tomb" ("because soul is buried in it") or from σώζειν "imprison" ("because the soul is punished, and the body is its prison").31 This latter etymology (and not the much-cited σῶμα σῆμα) is given by the people around Orpheus (οἱ ἀμφὶ Ὀρφέα) – either poets like him (that is Musaeus) or people using his poems. Plato's expression allows both interpretations, though the plural seems rather to argue against the first one. But if we concentrate on the second one, Plato's expression forbids the assumption that he read this etymology in a poem by Orpheus;<sup>32</sup> it is given by the people using his poems. Which could mean that it is an interpretation of something read in Orpheus. Orpheus must have sung about the punishment of souls, but not necessarily that our life is such a punishment (which would presuppose reincarnation – as we all know, an Empedoclean doctrine). He might have sung only about the punishment awaiting our soul after death, in a prison in afterlife, and his allegorical expounders, οἱ ἀμφὶ Ὀρφέα, read this in the Pythagorean, allegorical way.

We have another instance of such allegorizing in Plato's writings. In the *Gorgias*, he tells a myth "invented by a clever man from Italy or Sicily": as a punishment after death, the souls would have to pour water into a bottomless barrel, using sieves; another man, a wise one, had explained this as an allegory of human stupidity. This time, the eschatological doctrine is contained in the text to be allegorized which Plato cites in the context of a discussion that life really might be death and death life, and he ascribes the myth to people who are holding the  $\sigma \tilde{\omega} \mu \alpha \sigma \tilde{\eta} \mu \alpha$  doctrine: reincarnation thus seems present, and we are not dealing with Orpheus,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Philebus 66c = (OF 14 Kern = Colli 4 [A45] = F 25 Bernabé).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> OF 101 and 107 Kern = F 168 and F 169 Bernabé. See also West 1983: 118.

<sup>30</sup> Euthyphro 5e-6b (OF 17 Kern = Colli 4 [A27] = F 26 Bernabé).

<sup>31</sup> Cra. 400c (OF 8 Kern = Colli 4 [A34] = F 430 Bernabé).

<sup>32</sup> See Linforth 1941: 147. 33 Grg. 493ac.

but, given the Italian localization, with some sort of Pythagorean mythology. Thus, while the Pythagorean myth allegorized in the *Gorgias* contains reincarnation, the myth told by Orpheus does not necessarily do so.

Eschatology, stories about the life after death, is connected with Orpheus in the iconographic tradition as well. On the one hand, there are the well-known huge Italiote vessels representing the Netherworld and its inhabitants, among whom we sometimes perceive Orpheus as a visitor.34 But more interesting than those attestations of a well-known myth are some less orthodox representations. On an Apulian crater in Basel, the singing Orpheus stands in front of a seated old man who holds a book scroll in his right hand.<sup>35</sup> Orpheus, the traveler to the Beyond, is a patron of the deceased, and his protection expresses itself in a text - presumably a Katabasis or an extract from one, like the texts on the gold tablets. Similarly, a terracotta group of Orpheus whose song overcomes the Sirens from an Apulian tomb must be read as expressing the same protection - this time, however, in an allegorical reading of an episode in the epic Argonautika where Orpheus must have been depicted as the poet whose song outdid the Sirens.<sup>36</sup> And finally, a recently published Apulian vase in the Art Museum of Toledo (Ohio) depicts Hades and Dionysos shaking each other's hand: the handshake presumably confirms an agreement which they concluded on behalf of the initiates of Dionysiac mysteries.37

(3) Eschatology leads to a third topic, ritual. Euthyphro's reference to "things which the many do not know" sounds like a reference to mystery cults and their iεροὶ λόγοι, their "sacred texts." For Plato, Orpheus is firmly connected with mystery cults. While "Homer, Hesiod, and Simonides" have to do with poetry, the followers of Orpheus and Musaeus are busy with initiations (literally: rituals, τελεταί) and oracular verses (χρησμωδίαι).<sup>38</sup> Since in all texts of the fifth century, Musaeus is firmly established as a chresmologue whose oracles, according to Herodotus, were collected by Onomacritus,<sup>39</sup> one might feel tempted to assign the rituals to Orpheus. And Aristophanes confirms this in his list of poetical

35 Basel, Antikenmuseum S 40, see Schmidt, Trendall, and Cambitoglou 1976: 32-37.

<sup>34</sup> See Schmidt 1991.

For the group, now in the J. Paul Getty Museum, see West 1983: 25 no. iii; for Orpheus and the Sirens see esp. Herodorus, FGrH 31 F 43a and Ap. Rhod. 4.891–911; Iacobacci 1993b; for a much earlier, though not undisputed iconographical attestation, see Groppengiesser 1977.

Johnston and McNiven 1996; Schauenburg 1995: 35–37; Schmidt 2000: 86–101.
 Pl. Prt. 316d = (OT 92 Kern = Colli 4 [A30] = F 549 Bernabé).
 Graf 1974: 9.

culture heroes in the *Frogs*: "Orpheus showed us rituals (τελετάς) and to abstain from murder, Musaeus the healing of illness and oracles." <sup>40</sup>

Plato, however, blurs the picture. In a key passage, *Republic* 364b-365a, he claims that seers and beggar priests,  $\dot{\alpha}\gamma\dot{\nu}\rho\tau\alpha$ 1 kal  $\mu\dot{\alpha}\nu\tau\epsilon$ 15 come to the doors of the rich and persuade them that they possess a power given to them by the gods through sacrifices and incantations and which allows them to heal with much joy and festivity any unjust deed which was committed by him or an ancestor; and they also promise that they would have the power to harm any enemy with binding spells. Somewhat later, after having cited Hesiod and Homer as witnesses to the gods' venality, Plato defines those practitioners: they rely on "a hubbub of books of Musaeus and Orpheus . . . according to which they perform their rites, and they persuade not only individuals, but entire towns that there are means of redemption and purification from [the consequences of] unjust deeds ( $\lambda\dot{\nu}$ 0015 TE kal  $\kappa\alpha\theta\alpha\rho\mu$ 01  $\dot{\alpha}\delta\nu$ 11 kg $\mu$ 12 through sacrifices and child's play . . . which they call Teleta(, rites, and which free us from evil over there; but horrible things await us if we would not sacrifice."

These ritual practitioners – wandering initiators as well as sorcerers – concern us here only in so far as they make use of books of Musaeus and Orpheus in order to perform their rites which Plato calls sacrifices,  $\theta \nu \sigma i \alpha i$ , but which they themselves simply call  $\tau \epsilon \lambda \epsilon \tau \alpha i$  "rites." The aim of these rites is protection against the consequences of evil deeds which await us after death, and they persuade not only isolated individuals, but entire cities. Plato repeats this statement a little later when he emphasizes the power that, in the eyes of the greatest cities, "the  $\tau \epsilon \lambda \epsilon \tau \alpha i$  have and the absolving gods ( $\lambda \dot{\nu} \sigma \iota \sigma i \theta \epsilon \sigma i$ ), according to the poets, the sons of the gods" – Orpheus and Musaeus again (366ab).

The dichotomy is important. Those practitioners – and presumably the poems of Orpheus and Musaeus which they use – persuade not only rich Athenians who are afraid of what awaits them after death (which would point to private initiations, in Plato's time especially to those of Dionysos), they have persuaded "the greatest cities," Athens among them. Rituals of Orpheus that interest entire cities are either cathartic or eschatological; and since cathartic rituals do not have any effect in the beyond, he must mean mystery cults connected with cities. The consequence seems obvious: the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> Ar. Ran. 1023f. Όρφεὺς μὲν γὰρ τελετὰς ἡμῖν κατέδειξεν φόνων τ' ἀπέχεσθαι, Μουσαῖος δ' ἐξακέσεις τε νόσων καὶ χρησμούς.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> 364b8 (θυσίαις τε καὶ ἐπωιδαῖς) 364e6 διὰ θυσιῶν; cf. 364e4 καθ' ἄς θυπολοῦσι, 365a3 μὴ θὺσαντας.

poems of Orpheus and Musaeus have also to do with the mysteries of Eleusis. 42

I shall not go into details of this Eleusinian connection; I tried to do so almost twenty-five years ago, isolating a specifically Athenian pseudepigraphical poetry under the names of Musaeus and Orpheus with the aim of giving expression to Eleusinian mythology and eschatology. Suffice it to point out that, in the light of this dichotomy, details about eschatology which Plato relates could refer either to Eleusis or to Bacchic mysteries. Let us follow instead the panhellenic thread which is indicated by the name of Dionysos and by the epic genre of theogony.

But before going into this, one detail of Plato's account, omitted until now on purpose, has to be cleared up. In his rendering of the practitioners' self-advertisement, Plato says "that there are means of redemption and purification from unjust deeds through sacrifices and child's play, on the one hand for those who still live, on the other hand for those who have died, which they call rites (τελεταί), which free us from the evil there."44 This literal translation is open to different interpretations. It is obvious that Plato makes a pun: he derives τελεταί "rites", from τελευτάω "to die." Thus he might limit the use of τελεταί only to those rites which have to do with the afterlife, confronting us with two sets of rites: unspecified ones with an effect during this lifetime, and τελεταί with effect after our death. But this is not convincing, since the entire passage focuses solely on the afterlife. I would suggest that, despite the pun, τελεταί is the general name the practitioners give their rites, as do, much later, the theurgists. 45 Although the term τελεταί itself has still a very general meaning at this epoch, it must bear a special connotation in this context, like "initiations": after all, we have Τελεταί as title of a book by Orpheus.

There are still more possible readings of this text. The participles  $\zeta \tilde{\omega} \sigma i v$  and  $\tau \epsilon \lambda \epsilon \upsilon \tau \dot{\eta} \sigma \alpha \sigma i \upsilon$  could refer either to the same persons in two states, life and death, or to two groups of people. The first would translate as: "There are means for them, both when they are still alive and also after they have died." But this, I think, jars with the addressees of the advertisement, individuals and cities: individuals die and live on in the Netherworld, cities do not (nor

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> Seen already by Jowett and Campbell in their commentary on the passage. <sup>43</sup> Graf 1974.

<sup>44</sup> Resp. 364d5-365a2: ὡς ἄρα λύσεις τε καὶ καθαρμοὶ ἀδικημάτων διὰ θυσιῶν καὶ παιδιᾶς ήδονῶν εἰσι μὲν ἔτι ζῶσιν, εἰσὶ δὲ καὶ τελευτήσασιν, ἃς δὴ τελετὰς καλοῦσιν, αἳ τῶν ἐκεῖ κακῶν ἀπολύουσιν ἡμᾶς. See Johnston 1999: 144-145.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> Augustine, De trin. 28 pollicens etiam purgationem animae, per eas quas τελετάς appellant; CD 10.9 quasdam consecrationes theurgicas, quas teletas vocant.

a ἱερὸς λόγος – holy because it belongs to some cults. <sup>52</sup> Plato alludes to this verse in the context of βακχεία (albeit transformed into philosophical βακχεία) <sup>53</sup> – again, we deal with Dionysiac, Bacchic mysteries with which the theogonic poem cited in the Derveni Papyrus has an intimate relationship.

Theogony and connection with mystery rites are characteristics of Orpheus' poems in Plato as well. The Derveni text of Orpheus, evidently pre-dating the Derveni burial of about 320 and perhaps as old as the later fifth century, fits into a pattern. Orphic theogonies cannot be separated from Dionysiac mystery rites; they belong together. It is less easy to see how that might have worked – was the theogony recited during the mystery rites? Reading from the sacred books was part of later mystery rites, and the fresco of the Villa of the Mysteries attests this for Bacchic rites; <sup>54</sup> but we cannot know what that boy on the left hand side of the fresco was reciting from his scroll. Reading of theogonies belonged to Near Eastern healing rites where the symbolical reconstruction of the cosmos brought healing, illness being a disruption of the cosmos – could initiation be viewed as a similar symbolical reconstruction of a new wholeness for the initiate, resulting in a better status after death? There is simply no evidence for such a hypothesis, tempting as it might be.

Equally vexing is something else. The new columns of the Derveni text which precede the poem of Orpheus deal not only with mystery rites which they expound, they also deal with eschatology – "the terrors of Hades, why don't they believe in them?" Earlier, the text spoke about "the daimones who are under this mound," and more than once, it speaks about souls; it explains even the preliminary sacrifice of the initiates to the Erinyes by the theory that the Erinyes are souls; initiates thus sacrifice to souls – as do the *magoi*, who do so "just as if they were paying a penalty." The text does not make it clear how these concepts relate to the poem of Orpheus – is it just another riddle, like rituals and eschatological beliefs, or is there a more intimate connection? However that might be, the presence of eschatology, the third element of Orpheus' poetry in Plato, is very intriguing. 58

<sup>52</sup> See Baumgarten 1998; Henrichs 2003a and Henrichs 2003b. [See now Henrichs 2004.]

<sup>53</sup> Pl. Symp. 218b = OF 13 Kern = F 1 xviii and F 19 Bernabé; West 1983: 34, 82.

At least I still understand the boy reciting from a book scroll as pointing to a mystery context; see the reciting priest from the Iseum at Pompeii, pictured in Alla Ricerca di Iside, Naples (s.a.), 52 no. 1.46.

<sup>56</sup> col. III 7 [A problematical and much restored passage; the Greek edition has "the daimones under the earth."]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>57</sup> col. VI 5. <sup>58</sup> See Johnston 1999: 274–279.

### THE POEMS AND THE ORPHICS

Looking back at the evidence collected so far, two questions remain: can we find some clearer outline of the poems of Orpheus which we have to assume, and can we know more about the people behind them?

To repeat the obvious: the Derveni text refers to a theogonic poem in which Zeus and his way of establishing his power played a crucial role. There were several generations of kings before the accession of Zeus. He followed Kronos who followed Ouranos – Ouranos being explicitly called "who ruled first of all." He in turn is called *Euphronides*, son of Night. Thus, there was an earlier generation, dominated by Night, even though she was not a ruler. Orpheus talks also about "a reverend one, who first sprang forth into the aither" and whom Zeus swallowed as well; 60 and two columns further on, the commentator cites four hexameters: 61

of the first born king, the reverend one. And onto him all the immortals grew, blessed gods and goddesses, and rivers and lovely springs and everything else that had been born then . . .

The epithet αἰδοῖος connects the two passages: Orpheus just might talk about the same divine person. Some verses that Proclus cites from Orpheus can illustrate what is going on. According to Proclus, Zeus had swallowed the primary divinity Phanes, and:

with him, everything was formed anew inside of Zeus, the splendid height of the broad aither and of sky, the seats of the unfertile sea and of famous earth . . . rivers and the immense sea and everything else and all immortal and blessed gods and goddesses, everything that had been born. 62

<sup>59</sup> col. xɪv 6 Οὐρανὸς Εὐφρονίδης ὅς πρώτιστος βασίλευσεν.

col. ΧΙΙΙ 4 αἰδοῖος κατέπινεν ὅς αἴθερα ἔχθορε πρῶτος. There is a textual problem: P. Derv. reads αἴθερα ἔκθορε. R. Lamberton suggested αἴθερος in order to avoid hiatus, "out of the aither," which would have as a consequence that this divinity originated from aither. I follow the translation given in Laks and Most 1997: 15 (but see 15 n. 28). [Both Betegh and the Greek edition of the papyrus adopt Lamberton's conjecture; Burkert 2006: 102 argues both against this conjecture and against the general assumption that αἴθερα is an accusative of direction; he takes it as a regular object, "who first ejaculated the aether," and connects it with Aesch. fr. 13 Radt and Egyptian cosmogony. I find this reading highly attractive, but it does not affect my argument in the text.]

<sup>61</sup> col. xvi 3-6 πρωτογόνου βασιλέως αίδοίου, τοῦ δ' ἄρα πάντες | ἀθάνατοι προσέφυμ μάκαρες θεοὶ ἡδὲ | καὶ ποταμοὶ καὶ κρῆναι ἐπήρατοι ἄλλα τε πάντα | ὅσσα τότ' ἡγ γεγαῶτ' . . .

<sup>62</sup> OF 167 Kern = F 292 Bernabé.

The latter passage explains the former – which also can mean: the "reverend first-born king" might be different from "Ouranos who ruled first of all". Thus, we arrive at a sequence "first (nameless) power" > Nyx > Ouranos > Kronos > Zeus; when we add Dionysos, for which we have no testimony in the text at all but which could be plausible in view of the mystery connection, we arrive at the same six generations of which Plato had spoken. The fact that the key verse "Zeus the head, Zeus the middle, and from Zeus all things are made" is alluded to in a passage in the *Laws* thus might be more than just a coincidence: Plato knew an Orphic text which seems very close to the Derveni theogony. 63

Do we have a title for this text? Among the four titles mentioned by Epigenes - Katabasis into Hades, Hieros Logos, Peplos, and Physika - the Katabasis is immediately excluded, as perhaps is the Peplos if the title refers to Kore's weaving of a peplos. The Physika cannot be entirely excluded, given that the one fragment preserved from this poem gives the personal names of the Tritopatores and calls them "doormen of the winds" - such information might occur in a theogony. 64 However, I prefer Hieros Logos for two reasons: first, the so-called Rhapsodic Theogony bears in the Suda the title ἱεροὶ λόγοι ἐν ῥαψωδίαις εἴκοσι τέσσαρσι: at least this later theogony had such a title. And secondly, the Derveni commentator seems to allude to this title in the passage already cited, where he explains the first verse by "indeed, he is uttering a holy discourse", ἱερ[ολογ]εῖται μὲν οὖν. 65 Epigenes ascribes this poem to the same Pythagorean Kerkops to whom he also ascribes the Katabasis - we have no idea what made Epigenes do this, but we might assume that he noted a doctrinal closeness between the two, which once again brings eschatology and theogony in close contact. (Herodotus, by the way, knows a ίρὸς λόγος, a "Sacred Story" of the initiates of Dionysos which explains the taboo on wool in graves - it must be a different story, but the terminology is consistent.)66

Do we know more about the people behind these texts? Plato vaguely talks about "seers and beggar priests" who made use of the poems of Musaeus and Orpheus for their rites; these specialists thus are the consumers, not the producers. The Derveni papyrus in turn presents private initiators and seers – "people who make sacred things into their profession" (οἳ τέχνην ποιούμενοι τὰ ἱερά) <sup>67</sup> – they too make use of Orpheus'

67 col. xx 3. See also Janko 1997.

 $<sup>^{63}</sup>$  Leg.4 715e = OF 21 = Colli 4 [A 50] = F 31 iii Bernabé.  $^{64}$  OF 318 = 802 Bernabé.  $^{65}$  col. VII 7.  $^{66}$  Hdt. 2.81. On hieroi logoi above, n. 52.

poems by explaining them, presumably in the course of an initiation rite. In both cases, we meet professionals reading Orpheus. The only non-professional is a caricature – it is the Euripidean Hippolytus, the vegetarian and sectarian, in the distorted picture Theseus gives us; <sup>68</sup> but Plato too might be called a non-professional reader, were it not for the fact that he uses these texts in the course of his philosophy – all the other non-professional recipients, about whom we hear nothing, could have been at most passive listeners to such texts. No surprise then that the authors must have been professionals as well, skilled in ritual lore and in Pythagorean doctrines as well, remote and minor colleagues of the mighty Empedocles, "a god upon earth."

<sup>68</sup> Eur. Hipp. 952-954. See above, n. 1.

<sup>69 [</sup>See also our book on the Gold Tablets (Graf and Johnston 2007), where Sarah Iles Johnston argues that the producers of the Orphic mythology were professionals that worked as bricoleurs of mythology.]

### CHAPTER 4

# Are the "Orphic" gold leaves Orphic?

# Alberto Bernabé and Ana I. Jiménez San Cristóbal

# INTRODUCTION: THE DEBATE OVER THE RELIGIOUS CONTEXT OF THE LEAVES

When the first of the gold leaves, that of Petelia, was published in 1836, the studies on the history of religion considered the existence of Orphism a well-established fact, which led that leaf to be interpreted as Orphic, just as happened with the other gold leaves which appeared in subsequent years.

The hypercritical skeptical reaction started by Wilamowitz<sup>3</sup> questioned the Orphic character of these documents, and the authority of the illustrious German philologist meant that the issue was left aside for many years.<sup>4</sup> However, not even in the most skeptical times have the leaves been convincingly assigned to another known religious movement, and it has become usual to call them "Orphic" with resigned inverted commas.

There has been one attempt, by Pugliese Carratelli,5 to distinguish two types of leaves which would come from two different religious contexts:

This paper has benefited from the aid of the Spanish State (HUM 2006–09403/FILO). We are very grateful to Miguel Herrero for the translation of this paper into English and to Radcliffe Edmonds for his valuable suggestions.

We will use the following abbreviations: O(rphicorum)F(ragmenta) (ed. A. Bernabé 2004–07 etc.), O(rphei)H(ymni) (ed. G. Ricciardelli Apicella 2000a), O(rphei)A(rgonautica) (ed. F. Vian 1987); for the leaves: Aeg(ae), Amph(ipolis) (OF 496n), Eleuth(erna), Ent(ella), Her(aclea), Hip(ponion), Mal(ibu), Meth(one), Myl(opotamos), Pel(inna), Pell(a), Pet(elia), Phars(alus), Pher(ae), Rom(a), Thur(ii). In case there is more than one leaf in the same place (like Eleuth. or Thur.) the abbreviation will be followed by the number of OF. The numeration corresponding to the Edmonds edition in this book is indicated in parentheses.

Pet. (B1) in Franz 1836: 149–150. They were taken as Orphic by Dieterich 1893 and Harrison 1903, and so they were edited by Comparetti 1910 and Olivieri 1915. Comparetti 1910: 36, referring to the last line of Pet., thinks one should read "he (i.e. Orpheus) wrote this."

<sup>3</sup> Especially Wilamowitz 1931.

It is meaningful that Linforth 1941 does not even mention them, even though he analyzes thoroughly the Orphic evidence. Cf. also Dodds 1951 and Zuntz 1971. In the exhaustive book by West about the Orphic poems they do not deserve more than a couple of allusions and the comment "we have no warrant for calling the gold leaves themselves Orphic" (West 1983: 26).

<sup>5</sup> Pugliese Carratelli 1993: 11–16, maintained in 2003: 10–20.

Netherworld geography, but he is also capable of telling the deceased authoritatively what he must and must not do and what words he should pronounce. Such knowledge and authority could only be supposed either of an infernal deity or a visitor to Hades capable of revealing to mortals such precise information.

We should exclude the possibility that the author is an infernal deity, since the most important ones are mentioned in the leaves in the third person. If the speaker was Persephone, for instance, we should expect expressions like "tell me that Bacchus freed you" and not "tell Persephone that Bacchus freed you" (Pel. 2 (D1–D2.2)).

Concerning, on the other hand, the possibility that the speaker is a visitor to the Underworld, the most adequate frame to instructions such as those found in the leaves is a type of eschatological poetry, which usually assumes the form of a  $K\alpha\tau\dot{\alpha}\beta\alpha\sigma\iota\varsigma$ , in which the subject-matter would be the geography of Hades, the liberation of the soul from the cycle of metempsychosis and a special destiny for initiates, coming from the lips of somebody who had descended to Hades. In the Greek mythical tradition there are various characters who risked a journey to the Underworld; the best known are Odysseus, Theseus, Pythagoras, Heracles, and Orpheus. But of all these, only Orpheus is acknowledged as having poetical skills, and only to him is poetry about the Afterlife assigned, especially a hexametrical poem called *Descent to Hades*. 19

The fact that the name of Orpheus never appears in the leaves is not sufficient argument to deny that they are texts attributed to the mythical singer. To mention some better known parallels, neither Parmenides nor Empedocles mention their own names, in poems that have plenty of connecting points with the type of literature in which the leaves are sustained.

In these conditions, who would be, then, a better candidate for the authorship of the text of the leaves than Orpheus, the mythical Thracian singer, visitor of the Underworld, revealer of the Afterlife secrets, supposed

<sup>18</sup> Cf. Riedweg 2002.

The author of OA 40–42 refers to a work of this kind attributed to Orpheus. Clem. Al. Strom. I.21.131.3 quoting Epigenes, questions the real authorship of Orpheus of a poem called Descent to Hades, which indicates that the attribution to Orpheus was the most common one. Suda s.v. Όρφεύς (III 565, 20 Adler) and Const. Lascaris Προλεγόμενα τοῦ σοφοῦ Όρφέως 103 (36 Martínez Manzano) take it to be by Orpheus of Camarina, which is but trying to reconcile the attribution to Orpheus with the post-Homeric aspect of the poems (cf. Bernabé 2002b about this matter). About the Orphic katabasis, cf. Lobeck 1829: 373–374, 810–818; Dieterich 1893: 72–83, 128 and passim; Gruppe 1897–1902: III I. 1130–1132; Norden 1926: 5, 168–175; Guthrie 1935: 193; Ziegler 1942: 1391–1395; Turcan 1956: 137; Burkert 1972: 130; Schilling 1982: 369; West 1983: 6, 9–10, 12; Brisson 1990: 2915; Kingsley 1995: 115, 135–141, 282–283, 287.

author of a literary corpus about such subject-matters, and transmitter of the  $\tau\epsilon\lambda\epsilon\tau\alpha$ i in which useful information is given to confront death?

### GEOGRAPHY OF THE LEAVES

A second argument concerns the geography of the leaves; they have appeared in very specific places: Southern Italy (Hip., Pet., Thur., Ent. in Sicily), Thessaly–Macedonia (Phars., Pel., Pher., Pell., Amph., Meth., Her.; Mal. seems to come also from Thessaly), Crete (Eleuth., Myl.), Achaia and Lesbos (though we do not yet know the contents of the latter). That from Rome is exceptional and its contents are quite different from the others.<sup>20</sup>

Now the great majority of these places are connected with Orpheus or Orphism, either because some episode of the myth of Orpheus takes place in them, or because other documents with Orphic features have appeared in them. We will mention only the most relevant evidence:

In Southern Italy the Apulian pottery contains multiple representations of Orpheus in the Underworld (cf. below, section on Iconography).

Macedonia is related to Orpheus in different ways:<sup>21</sup> the famous papyrus which constitutes one of the most important Orphic documents was found at Derveni;<sup>22</sup> on the other hand, according to Conon, Orpheus forbade the access of women to the mysteries he had founded in Libethras, where he lived, according to the Orphic *Argonautica* among other sources. In that very city there was an image of Orpheus, and Dio claimed that it was where Orpheus' death took place.<sup>23</sup>

The links of Orphism with Crete are as clear as they are numerous.<sup>24</sup> Thus, Diodorus maintains that Orphic τελεταί have their origin in the island<sup>25</sup> and an epigram of the second century BCE from a temple of the Magna Mater<sup>26</sup> has got a clear Orphic sound, as do some verses from Euripides' *Cretans* in which some priests appear with all the characteristic features of the Orphics.<sup>27</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> Cf. Bernabé and Jiménez San Cristóbal 2001: 179–182; 2008: 133–135. <sup>21</sup> Cf. Hatzopoulos 2002.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Laks and Most 1997, Janko 2002, Jourdan 2003, Betegh 2004, Bernabé 2004b: 149–186.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Cf. Conon FGrHist 26 F 1.45, OA 50–53, 1373–1376, Plut. Alex. 14.8, Diog. Laert. 1.5 (OF 1046 ii), Paus. 9.30.7 (OF 934 ii).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Cf. Kern 1916; Linforth 1941: 215, 232; West 1983: 50, 95–96, 131–133, 153–154, 166–168, 172–174 (who points out that the authors of the Orphic theogonies took many themes from Cretan myths); Casadio 1990b: 284–285; Pugliese Carratelli 1993: 46–48 (= 2001: 86–93; 2003: 87–93).

<sup>25</sup> Diod. Sic. 5.77.3 and 5.75.4; OF 529-530 and Bernabé 2000b: 48-49.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Guarducci 1935–50: 1 XXIII 3; Colli 4 [B 20]; Pugliese Carratelli 1993: 46 (= 2001: 87; 2003: 88); Tortorelli Ghidini 2000: 40–41; Tzifopoulos 2002: 164–167.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Eur. Cret. fr. 472 Kannicht (OF 567), cf. Casadio 1990, Bernabé 2004a.

Regarding Lesbos, several authors who treat the myth of Orpheus from Hellenistic times onwards, like Phanocles, Vergil, Ovid, Conon, and Lucian, relate that the head of Orpheus, which was thrown either into the Thracian river Hebrus or the sea, arrived at the island, where it was honored and went on dictating poems and oracles. Besides, archaic poetry gives evidence for the relation between Lesbos and Thrace, the mythical fatherland of Orpheus: Alceus, in a fragment of a poem which perhaps dwelt on Orpheus, praised the river Hebrus as the most beautiful of rivers and mentioned its mouth near Ainos. Since Ainos was a colony from Mytilene, it might possibly have been the vehicle to introduce Orpheus in the island.

Not only these coincidences are meaningful, but also the fact that there are constant thematic features in documents which are so far away from each other in space and time. This excludes the possibility that they are local traditions or religious movements. On the contrary, they suggest much more powerfully a coherent religious orientation which, though dispersed, is persistent through time and not integrated in the official religion. All these are features consistent with Orphism and not with any other movement known to us.

### THE FRAME OF A MYSTERY

## References to initiation

The religious movement to which the leaves belong is a mystery cult. In Hip. 16 (B10.16) we read that the initiates ( $\mu\dot{\nu}\sigma\tau\alpha$ 1) and the *bakkhoi* go forward in glory along the path which leads to Afterlife happiness. The knowledge of certain passwords ( $\sigma\dot{\nu}\mu\beta\sigma\lambda\alpha$ ) allows the initiate of Pher. (D3) to reach a meadow which represents eternal joy. In the leaves of Pell. (E4) and Aeg. (496c–e) (F4, F5, F2) in addition to the name of the deceased, the term  $\mu\dot{\nu}\sigma\tau\eta\varsigma$  is engraved, with the probable intention that, when presenting himself before Persephone, he may be identified as an initiate. There are various Orphic texts in which  $\mu\dot{\nu}\sigma\tau\eta\varsigma$  or the middle-passive participles

Phanocl. fr. 1.11–20 Powell (OF 1004, 1038 and 1054), Verg. G. 4.523–527, and Serv. ad loc. (OF 1054 iii and viii), Ov. Met. 11.50–60 (OF 1054 IV), Conon FGrHist 26 F 1.45.4–6 (OF 1039 and 1061), Lucian Ind. 11 (OF 1052), P Berol. 13426.16–19.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> We find the same topic in figurative representations; cf. Garezou 1994: nn. 68–70.

<sup>30</sup> Alc. fr. 45 Voigt.

Jiménez San Cristóbal 2002a: 127–133. Cf. Graf, Chapter 3 above and Graf and Johnston 2007: 137–164.
 Heraclit. fr. 87 Marc. (OF 587), Eur. Cret. fr. 472.10–15 Kannicht (OF 567), PDerv. col. v1 8–9 (OF 471), OH 43.10, 84.3, Diod. Sic. 1.23.7 (OF 327 iv), 5.49.5 (OF 521), Harp. Lex. s.v. ἀπομάττων, Plut. fr. 178 Sandbach (OF 594), Clem. Al. Prot. 2.16.2 (OF 589 i).

μυόμενος, μυηθείς or μεμυημένος appear in a similar context, in which initiation is linked to a way of life subject to rigid prescriptions and to the fulfilling of rites which grant access to a happy existence after death. The fact that in some of these cases the terms μύστης and βάκχος appear together, just as they do in Hip. 16 (B10.16), is also meaningful. In Orphism the term βάκχοι defines more precisely the term μύσται: only those initiates who have made a continuous and constant effort in βακχεύειν will reach the true union with the divinity and will go forward along the sacred way which leads to the paradise of the blessed.

The mention of the sacred way in Hip. 15–16 (B10.15–16) constitutes an indirect reference to initiation which supports the mysteric character of these texts, since the sacred way can be conceived as a reiteration of the initiation path in this world,  $^{36}$  or perhaps as a projection of an earthly model. The us not forget that the Hip. (B10) path is reserved to the  $\mu\nu\sigma\tau\alpha$  kai  $\beta\alpha$ kxol, since it is initiation that guarantees the promise of Afterlife blessing.

# The importance of doctrinal knowledge

However, why should we ascribe the leaves to Orphism, when, though one of the most important ones, it is not the only mysteric movement in Greece? In contrast to the Eleusinian mysteries or Dionysiac cults, Orphism can be defined as a mysteriosophic religion. In Dionysiac or Eleusinian cult, the initiate participates in an initiation rite which makes him familiar with the deity, but he does not gain a knowledge which transforms him. The concept of knowledge, on the contrary, is inherent to the nature of Orphic  $\tau \epsilon \lambda \epsilon \tau \alpha i$ , which are oriented to the aquisition of an eschatological wisdom which allows the initiates (and not only them) to know the nature of the soul, her situation in the world, and how to be freed from the mortal

<sup>33</sup> Heraclit. fr. 87 Marc. (OF 587); Eur. Cret. fr. 472.10-15 Kannicht (OF 567).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> Burkert 1975: 90–91 thinks that the μύσται καὶ βάκχοι are the initiates and especially those who got into real ecstasy. In this sense, καί would have the function of adding an expression which restricts or limits, cf. LSJ s.v. καί. About βάκχος and βακχεύειν, cf. Jiménez 2009.

<sup>35</sup> Vid. already Rohde 1898<sup>2</sup>: 11 128 n. 6; Guthrie 1935: 194ff.; Dodds 1944: 79 (v. 115); Bernabé 1998d: 82 and n. 164.

Feyerabend 1984. The relation between ritual practice and the itinerary of the souls of the initiates is witnessed also by Pl. Phd. 108a "He (Aeschylus) says that the way leading to Hades is straightforward, but I think it is neither straightforward nor single . . . but seems to have, on the contrary, plenty of branches and crossroads. My guess comes from the funeral rites and the usual funerary celebrations which take place there."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> Cf. Pugliese Carratelli 1990: 412. On sacred ways in antiquity cf. Rosenberg 1920 and above all Caerols 1995.

<sup>38</sup> Bianchi 1965: 154-155, 167-168.

condition. This conception is condensed in the introductory verse to the Orphic *Hieroi logoi*, which we know in two variants:<sup>39</sup>

- (a) I will sing to the understanding, close your doors, ye profane.
- (b) I will speak to those to whom it is right to speak; close your doors, ye profane.

Only the initiates know the necessary things to reach salvation and only they have the right to access to the knowledge that the poetry attributed to Orpheus provides.

In the leaves, emphasis on knowledge is attested by Mnemosyne's presence as the presiding deity, by the insistence on truth, by the questions of the guardians, whose mission is to prevent those who do not know the answers from having access to the place of blessing, and by the passwords  $(\sigma \acute{\nu} \mu \beta o \lambda \alpha)^{40}$  that they and Persephone must be told as a proof that one knows the truth.

## The importance of Mnemosyne and the insistence on truth

In the realm of myth, the coincidences of Mnemosyne with Orpheus are clear. Mnemosyne is a relative of Orpheus, she is his grandmother, since her daughter, the Muse Calliope, is Orpheus' mother. Like him, Mnemosyne comes from Pieria and is related to poetry and music, since she is mother of the Muses. Now, apart from this mythical relationship, which is after all superficial, there is a deeper relationship on the level of religion which concerns a system of beliefs. The text of the leaves is "the work of Mnemosyne," a goddess who is the personification of Memory and who ensures that the initiate remembers the instructions revealed to him when alive, thus becoming the protector of the souls and the guide of their journey. She prevents any undesired failing of memory when the initiate confronts the unavoidable questioning before the guardians. What is required of Mnemosyne is that she makes the initiates remember the ritual, probably the initiatic ritual. In the *Orphic Hymn* addressed precisely to Mnemosyne (*OH* 77.9–10) the function we suppose this goddess has in the leaves is made explicit:

Excite the initiates with the memory of the pious ritual and send oblivion away from them.

Taking into account that in Greek the concept of truth (ἀλήθεια) means etymologically "lack of oblivion" (λήθη), to remember turns out to mean

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> OF 1ab, cf. Bernabé 1996a. <sup>40</sup> Ent. 19 (B11.19), Pher. (D3).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> Hip. 1 (B10.1), Pet. 12 (B1.12), Rom. 3 (A5.3). There seems to be little ground for the idea of Gallavotti 1978–79: 339–340, who does not see the goddess in the leaves, but a mention of the substantive "memory."

drunk from the other fountain) and he knows he must drink from Mnemosyne's fountain.

## The declaration of purity

After having given the passwords correctly to the guardians, the initiate must present himself to the chthonian deities themselves and utter some other passwords. In the leaves from Thurii and, with some variants, in Rom., 55 somebody declares solemnly in first person addressing Persephone, Eucles (Hades), and Eubuleus (Dionysus), and the other gods:

I come pure from the pure.

The phrase implies that the speaker or his soul is defined as belonging to a united group, characterized by having a similar ritual situation most probably a ritual purity coming from having experienced initiation and having observed all his life the precepts of his religious group, which makes him worthy of a new life in the Underworld. The uttering of this formula is necessary for the divinities to acknowledge the deceased as an initiate and to admit him to the house of the holy. Plato, in a clearly Orphic context, opposes two groups: the "uninitiated and those not participating in the rites," who are condemned to the mud once they are dead, and the purified ( $\kappa \epsilon \kappa \alpha \theta \alpha \rho \mu \acute{\epsilon} \nu o \varsigma$ ) and participants in the rites ( $\tau \epsilon \tau \epsilon \lambda \epsilon \sigma \mu \acute{\epsilon} \nu o \varsigma$ ), who will dwell with the gods. Who will dwell with the gods.

# The painful cycle

In Thur. 488.5 (A1.5) the deceased declares to the infernal deities:

I went out flying from the painful cycle of deep grief.

With that statement he makes clear that his soul has left behind the cycle of reincarnations in the mortal world; that is to say, he has managed to get rid of the mortal life to which he was condemned for the fault committed by his ancestors the Titans. In other Orphic fragments, transmitted in the texts of

As it is expressed in Thur. 489–490.7 (A2–A3.7) ἔδρας ἐς εὐαγέ{ι}ων, cf. Bernabé and Jiménez San Cristóbal 2001: 155–156, 225–229; 2008: 115, 174–177. In Amph. (D4) the deceased declares εὐαγής ἱερὰ Διονύσου Βαχχίου εἰμι, cf. Hatzopoulos 2002: 25 n. 44, Jiménez San Cristóbal 2007.

Thur. 488–490.1 (A1–A3.1), Rom. 1 (A5.1). Cf. Bernabé and Jiménez San Cristóbal 2001: 137–143; 2008: 100–105. In Rom. (A5) it is not the dead who speaks, but a third person, who could be a guardian of Hades (Zuntz 1971: 334), or a "mediator from this world" or the leaf itself (Riedweg 1996: 479).

Pl. Phd. 69c (OF 434 iii). The Gurob Papyrus col. II 22 has θξεκκα[, a sequence for which Hordern 2000 proposes either, in comparison with Thur. 488–490.I (AI–A3.I) -θ' (perhaps αὐτόθι?) ἐκ κα[θαρῶν or in comparison to col. I 28 -θε ἐκ κα[λάθου. Kern (OF 3I) reads θ εικα.

neo-Platonist philosophers, we find the terms "cycle" (κύκλος) or "wheel" (τροχός) referring to the cycle of metempsychosis of the soul, in which it must reincarnate again and again until the guilt is expiated and she can enjoy being with the other blessed. 58

The eternal world which the soul longs to reach in the leaves is outside this "circle," and escaping from this cycle, characterized as "painful"  $(\dot{\alpha}\rho\gamma\alpha\lambda\acute{\epsilon}o\varsigma)$ , <sup>59</sup> is a liberation and a triumph. Besides, the expression of the leaf implies that the initiate conceives this life, or rather, the succession of lives the soul must go through, both as a cycle <sup>60</sup> and as a wheel, understood as a repeated and terrible punishment and as a metaphor of the wheel of fortune, <sup>61</sup> as terrible as the prison or even the grave which we find in other allusions to the Orphics in Plato. <sup>62</sup> All in all, it is a key expression within Orphic doctrines and fundamental for the fate of the deceased initiate. It seems logical that the initiates were taught these expressions in their ritual experiences, where they would have learned and repeated them. <sup>63</sup>

The interpretation of the  $\kappa \dot{\nu} \kappa \lambda o \varsigma$  of the Thurian leaf as the cycle of birth and death, not only has parallels in the Orphic fragments we have just quoted, but also helps to explain the phraseology of guilt and punishment which presents a consistent pattern in other leaves. <sup>64</sup>

# The primordial guilt and the punishment

According to the leaves, human beings bear a guilt which they must expiate to liberate themselves:

I have paid the punishment (ποινή) corresponding to impious actions (ἔργων ἕνεκα οὕτι δικα<ί>ων) (Thur. 490.4 (A3.4)). 65

<sup>58</sup> Procl. In Ti. 3.296.7 Diehl (OF 348 iii), In Ti. 3.297.7 (OF 348 i), Simpl. in Cael. 377.12 Heiberg (OF 348 ii).

Frocl. In R. 2.338 Kroll (OF 338 i) "Since human soul goes from one living being to another, interchanging according to the cycles of time."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>59</sup> Cf. Emp. fr. 187.8 Wright (B 115 DK; OF 449) "interchanging the painful paths of life." It is significant that Empedocles uses the same adjective ἀργαλέος in reference to the human life in a fragment in which he speaks precisely of a "Decree of Necessity" (Ἀνάγκη), who in Orphic texts (OF 77) is conceived as the principle which encircles and unites the world, companion of Time (Χρόνος), who also is seen as a winged and turning (ἐλικτός) snake, cf. Onians 1954<sup>2</sup>: 332.

<sup>61</sup> Cf. Harrison 1903: 592-593; Thomson 1945: 9.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>62</sup> The grave, in Grg. 493a (OF 430 ii); the prison, in Phd. 62b (OF 429 i); both images, in Cra. 400c (OF 430 i).

<sup>63</sup> Harrison 1903: 588–592 thinks even possible that κύκλος refers to a real cycle which was formed in an initiatic rite celebrated during the lifetime of the initiate. It could be a wheel, or a circle painted round the initiate who was to escape out of it. Cf. Psell. τίνα περὶ δαιμόνων δοξάζουσιν (Ἑλληνες p. 41 Boissonade, who recalls an old Bacchic rite in which daemons were expelled by jumping out of a fiery circle.

<sup>64</sup> Thur. 489-490.4. (A2-A3.4). 65 Cf. Santamaría 2005.

Payment and liberation are achieved through the τελετή, since in Pher. (D3) it is specified that the μύστης is free from punishment (ἄποινος), which implies that the uninitiated will be punished. We must suppose it is a general punishment over all of mankind, which Thur. 488.5 (A1.5) defines as a terrible cycle which only the initiates can escape. The only known relation between guilt and punishment paid through the τελετή and the exit from a cycle is the one expressed in the Orphic τελετή, in which the guilt is Titanic, the punishment (among others) is the metempsychosis, and the cycle one must get free of is the cycle of rebirth. The phraseology of the leaves is similar to other Orphic texts:

Take my present as expiation (ποινάς) of the impious deeds of my parents (πατ[έρων ἀθεμίστων). (Gurob Papyrus col. 1 4 = OF 578).

In the same way that unjust men (ἄδικοι) condemned to death (θα[νάτωι ζημιούμε]νοι). (Derveni Papyrus col. 111 8 = OF 472).<sup>66</sup>

This is why the magi do the sacrifice, with the idea that they are expiating a punishment (ποινὴν ἀποδιδόντες). (Derveni Papyrus col. vi 4–5).

We can perfectly imagine that it is a rite like the one described in the Derveni Papyrus which allows the *mystes* to declare in the Afterlife:

I have paid the punishment corresponding to impious deeds.

A great number of texts insist again and again on the same conceptual system:

- (a) A fragment of the *Rhapsodies* (*OF* 350.3) talks about the λύσιν προγόνων ἀθεμίστων "liberation from his unjust ancestors."
- (b) Pindar attributes to the τελεταί the liberation from toils, mentions the payment of a punishment and refers to the compensation which men owe to Persephone for an ancient grief.<sup>67</sup> It is obvious that men cannot have provoked Persephone's grief. It must have been their ancestors, the Titans, who did that.
- (c) A famous text of Plato recalls that, according to the Orphics, the soul is in the body to pay a punishment which must be paid. In another it is recalled that only the initiate and pure will dwell with the gods (which coincides precisely with the declarations of apotheosis of the *mystes* which we find in the leaves), while the uninitiated will have as punishment to lie in the mud.<sup>68</sup>

<sup>67</sup> Cf. Pi. fr. 131a Maehl. (OF 441) λυσιπόνων τελετᾶν, Ol. 2.58 (OF 445) ποινὰς ἔτεισαν, fr. 133 Maehl. (OF 443) ποινὰν παλαιοῦ πένθεος, Cf. Bernabé 1999a and Santamaría 2000.

68 Pl. Cra. 400c (OF 430 i), Phd. 69c (OF 434 iii).

We accept the reading proposed by West in Tsantsanoglou 1997: 96; Most 1997: 131–132 compares it with Thur. 489–490.4. (A2–A3.4).

(d) Aristotle<sup>69</sup> refers to what "the oldest" proclaim about humans living to expiate the greatest crimes. It is evident that if we "live to expiate" (ζῆν ἡμᾶς ἐπὶ κολάσει) we must expiate something preceding our own birth. "We" are the human beings, and this indicates that sin precedes our existence as a whole.

### The crown

In Thur. 488. 6 (A1.6) the reference to the "cycle of deep grief" is followed by the declaration

I rushed with swift feet to the desired crown.

In the Greek world we find crowns in contexts related to the banquet, the funerary world, the triumph of athletic competition and a number of mystical symbols which serve as tokens for recognition of the initiates. To All these values find an echo in Orphic testimonies which provide a solid context for the coherent interpretation of the crown of the Thurii leaf. But perhaps the most interesting texts in relation to the use of crowns are those about the rites which the Orphics fulfill in the Afterlife. In Plato's *Republic* the crown and the wine symbolize the eternal happiness promised to the initiates. The crown would be in relation to the banquet, since it is a perpetual banquet that is promised to a good *mystes*: The crown would be in relation to the banquet, since it is a perpetual banquet that is promised to a good *mystes*: The crown would be in relation to the banquet, since it is a perpetual banquet that is promised to a good *mystes*: The crown would be in relation to the banquet, since it is a perpetual banquet that is promised to a good *mystes*:

Musaeus and his son have a more excellent song than these of the blessings that the gods bestow on the righteous. For they conduct them to the House of Hades in their tale and arrange a symposium of the saints where, reclined on couches crowned with wreaths, they entertain the time henceforth with wine, as if the fairest meed of virtue were an everlasting drunk.

The same panorama is found in two passages of Aristophanes: a fragment<sup>73</sup> which refers to some crowned initiates taking part in a banquet in the Afterlife, and the parody of *Clouds*<sup>74</sup> in which Socrates, after alluding to a

<sup>69</sup> Iambl. Protr. 77.27 Des Places = Arist. fr. 60 Rose (OF 430 v).

<sup>70</sup> Cf. Bernabé and Jiménez San Cristóbal 2001: 165–173, 2008: 121–128, with bibl.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>71</sup> Dem. 18.260 (OF 577 i); Harp. s.v. λεύκη (OF 577 viii); Plut. Alex. 2.9 (OF 579); Clem. Al. Paed. 2.8.73.1 "those who celebrate Bacchus do not fulfill the rites without crowns, but, as soon as they feel it on their temples, they feel inflamed when they see the Τελετή."

<sup>72</sup> Pl. Resp. 363cd (OF 431 i).

Ar. fr. 504.6ss KA (OF 432 i) "And we would not be crowned, nor anointed (?) / if we did not go to drink once we arrive down there. / That is why they are called 'the blessed'. / For everybody says 'He has left, blessed he.' 'He is asleep, happy he, since he will not suffer any more.' / And we venerate them with sacrifices / like to gods, and we offer them libations, / we ask them to send goods to us up here."

<sup>74</sup> Ar. Nub. 254-60.

ceremony of enthronement of an initiate, offers him a crown because among them such is the usual practice with initiates.<sup>75</sup> The crown reappears as a symbol of afterlife blessing in a passage of Plutarch which describes the experiences that the soul suffers after death, taking as references those experienced by the *mystes* during the τελετή. <sup>76</sup> The funerary and the initiatic appear again united in a poem of unknown authorship from the mid-third century BCE<sup>77</sup> which echoes the language and the ideology of the leaves. The addressee of this poem is the tragic poet Philicus, whose head, in the moment he left for the Isles of the Blessed, is crowned with ivy, probably as a sign of his initiation in the mysteries. The symbolism of the funerary crown has ritual echoes because the crown is a sign of identity of the initiated deceased, as it had been for the members of the thiasoi described by Demosthenes and Plutarch. To sum up, obtaining a crown after death meant the triumph of the initiated over the cycle of reincarnations, signalling a culminating point. Thus, in the Orphic evidence the rite, the realm of death, and the destiny of the soul are implied in the metaphor of the crown, mystical, triumphal and sympotic at the same time. Orphism offers, then, the most adequate context for the right interpretation of the crown in the leaf of Thurii.

The wine and Dionysus

At the end of the leaves of Pel. 6 (5) (D1.6 = D2.5) we read:

You have wine, happy privilege.78

Wine may be alluded to either because it was part of an initiatic or funerary ritual, or as an expression of the otherworldly happiness that the deceased will enjoy. These three interpretations, which are not exclusive but may well be complementary, agree with some pieces of evidence and beliefs within the scope of Orphism. Demosthenes describes Aeschines helping his mother to officiate some rites in which wine is mixed. In the Gurob Papyrus

Of. Dieterich 1893 (who compares this ritual with the one described by Dem. 18.259), Méautis 1938, Burkert 1983: 268 n. 16, Freyburger-Galland 1992. See also the comments of Dover ad loc., 187–188, as well as Guidorizzi's, 224–227, where references can be found to the rites he caricatures.

Plut. fr. 178 Sandbach (OF 594). 77 SHell 980. Cf. Dickie 1995: 84–86, 1998.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>78</sup> The text presents some textual difficulties; see Bernabé ad loc. and Bernabé and Jiménez San Cristóbal 2001; 267–268, 2008; 256–258 for the various proposals.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>79</sup> Cf. Bernabé and Jiménez San Cristóbal 2001: 117–125, 2008: 84–89 with discussion and bibliography. This triple interpretation also explains the curious metrical structure of the text, cf. Riedweg 1998: 367–368.

Thus, an Italian vase (cf. M. Schmidt 1975: 134–135, fig. xv1), a relief from the Farnesina in Rome (cf. Graf 1991: 100), or one of the frescoes in the Villa dei Misteri in Pompeii (cf. Simon 1961, Sauron 1998, Ricciardelli Apicella 2000b: 279). On the ritual usages of wine, see Velasco López 1992: 216–220.

<sup>81</sup> Dem. 18.259 (OF 577 i). Cf. Wankel ad loc., 1135-1138.

This thiasos is undoubtedly the reunion of initiates in the Underworld, and the *mystes* makes "a claim of membership." <sup>96</sup>

On the other hand, Santamaría Álvarez<sup>97</sup> proposes the following reading for A4.2:

δεξιὸν ἐς θίασ<ον> δεῖ  $\{\xi\}$  <σ'> ἰ<έ>ναι You must go to the thiasos on the right,

according to which a thiasos appears also in the Thurii tablets.

# Reconstruction of a hieros logos

In the following paragraphs we will briefly explain how the underlying structure of the text also reflects the importance of an initiatic knowledge. It cannot be accidental that from the text of the leaves as a whole it is possible to reconstruct a hieros logos along the same essential lines as the one reconstructed from other Orphic fragments.98 In effect, Riedweg has argued that from certain expressions of the Orphic leaves it is possible to reconstruct the subject-matter of a ίερὸς λόγος about the fate of the soul in the Underworld, which would be transmitted to the initiates during the ritual. 99 We know that in Orphic cult the importance of knowledge results in the existence of ritual books with the keys to interpret that knowledge. 100 After all, Orphism is defined as a "religion of the book"101 with constant references to stories which sanction the rites and which contain the keys to have access to that doctrinal knowledge. The Gurob Papyrus (OF 578) constitutes doubtlessly the clearest and most complete piece of evidence of what must have been a ritual text, written over a handy material and containing the indispensable instructions for what must be done and said in the different moments of the celebration. In a way, the leaves can be considered an equivalent of the books used by the initiates in the ritual: they are brief because they have only the minimal contents which are indispensable to help the dead believer to remember all that is fundamental to overcome the passage through Hades, and are golden because, in contrast to

<sup>96</sup> Graf and Johnston 2007: 95.
97 Verbal communication.

Of. Bernabé 2003b. On Orphic Hieroi logoi cf. Baumgarten 1998, Henrichs 2003a and 2003b, Graf and Johnston 2007: 175–184.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>99</sup> Riedweg 1998: 387–389, 2002 and Chapter 9 below. According to Graf 1991: 98–101 the lines of Pel. (D1–D2) would be employed in a ritual which dramatized the death and resurrection of the initiate, in imitation of that of the god, followed by a makarismos with instructions for life and the promise of future happiness.

<sup>100</sup> Jiménez San Cristóbal 2002b.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>101</sup> The definition comes from Bianchi 1974: 131 (= 1978: 189); cf. Bernabé 1996a: 18 n. 15; 1996b: 67.

the ritual texts in papyrus which can be replaced, the leaves must last for ever. In a system of beliefs in which the  $\tau\epsilon\lambda\epsilon\tau\dot{\eta}$  is conceived as a preparation for corporeal death, it is logical to suppose that it served to instruct the initiate on aspects like the infernal geography or the fate of the soul in the Underworld, and it is not impossible to think that initiates and initiators alike used in the rite texts similar to those contained in the leaves, though these must have been inscribed on cheaper (and unfortunately perishable) materials. In any case, the Gurob Papyrus and the Orphic leaves are two instances of absolutely functional texts, which are used in two transcendental moments for the initiate: the  $\tau\epsilon\lambda\epsilon\tau\dot{\eta}$  and death.

The relevance of knowledge and doctrinal teaching which is inferred from the leaves makes it difficult to accept the proposal to ascribe them to Dionysiac circles, precisely because the constant usage of a text constitutes one of the differentiating features between Orphism and Dionysism. As we have seen, the concept of knowledge is inherent to the nature of Orphic τελεταί. In Dionysiac cult, on the contrary, the initiate participates in rites which make him familiar to the god and his events, but he has no access to a knowledge which transforms him. A tight link between Dionysiac doctrines and rites does not seem to have ever existed. <sup>102</sup>

### PURITY AND JUSTICE

Candidates to dwell in the *locus amoenus* declare themselves to be in a special condition of purity. The same purity is the condition for a better destiny in the Afterlife in texts which are undoubtedly Orphic such as the *Rhapsodies*, but this time in explicit opposition to the fate of those who lived unjustly: 104

Those who have been pure of under the rays of the sun, reach, once they have died, a sweeter destiny in the beautiful meadow, in the shores of deep-flowing Acheron ... Those who acted against justice under the rays of the sun, evil-doers, are carried down to the field of Cocytus, to the freezing Tartarus.

Clearly, the contrast between "those who have been pure" and "those who acted against justice" implies that the pure have acted according to justice and that to act against justice is an impurity. The same association and

See Festugière 1956; Dodds 1944: xi–xx; Daraki 1985: 63; Casadio 1994: 98 and n. 75, 119 and n. 12; Versnel 1990: 137–146.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>103</sup> Thur. 488-490.1 (AI-A3.1) " I come pure from the pure." OF 340.

<sup>105</sup> εὐαγέωσιν. The word εὐαγής is a term used in the leaves, cf. Thur. 489–490.7 (A2–A3.7) ἔδρας ἐς εὐαγέων, Amphip. (D4) εὐαγής ἱερὰ Διονύσου Βακχίου . . . εἰμί.

contrast of concepts is found much earlier in Plato, <sup>106</sup> who ironically states that Museus and his son (i.e. Orpheus) reward the just (δικαίοις) with a banquet of crowned and drunk pious folk (ὁσίων), the same prize which we have seen that awaits the initiates in Pel. (D1–D2). Instead, the impious and unjust (τοὺς δὲ ἀνοσίους αὖ καὶ ἀδίκους) are thrown into the mud and forced to carry water in a sieve. <sup>107</sup>

Justice (Dike) is a well-known deity within Orphic scope. In an ancient Orphic theogony she appears as a goddess who accompanies Zeus in watching over the unjust deeds committed by men so that Zeus may punish them, <sup>108</sup> while in a passage from a legal discourse one of the litigants tries to move the vote of the jury by alluding to the vigilance of Justice over the unjust, <sup>109</sup> postulated, he says, by Orpheus.

The pattern of the leaves also reflects a link between ritual purity and justice ( $\delta$ ikη) which coincides with the idea of justice related to the religious ideas and cultic practices which we found clearly developed in Orphism. Being just is equivalent to being free from punishment, ἄποινος, as the initiate declares in Pher. (D3). Through other Orphic passages we know that to pay the punishment implies to be initiated and to live with purity and rectitude, because the uninitiate will not be able to get rid of his impious and unjust condition and will have to expiate his faults again. It

### THE GODS IN THE LEAVES AND IN OTHER ORPHIC TEXTS

Some features of the gods mentioned in the leaves put them into relationship with the image of the same gods in other Orphic texts.<sup>112</sup>

# Primeval gods and elements

In the Great Leaf from Thurii (C) some divine names and some phrases of religious content can be read within a sea of senseless letters. In the first line three gods are mentioned:

<sup>106</sup> Pl. Resp. 363c-d. Cf. Plut. Comp. Cim. et Luc. 1.2.

Of. Pl. Resp. 330d, Phd. 69c, Grg. 493a—c. Justice appears also in the Apulian infernal iconography, which on some occasions is associated with Victory (Nike), cf. below, "Nike and Dike".

Pl. Leg. 716a (OF 32). Burkert 1969: 11 n. 25 points out rightly that the Platonic passage seems to paraphrase a similar verse of another passage in the Rhapsodies (OF 233).

<sup>109</sup> Ps.-Dem. 25.11 (OF 33). 110 Jiménez San Cristóbal 2005.

<sup>111</sup> Pl. Phd. 69c, Grg. 493a, Resp. 364e, Julian. Or. 7.25, Plut. fr. 178 Sandbach.

<sup>112</sup> For Derveni, cf. Most 1997, Betegh 2004: esp. 331-338.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>113</sup> Cf. Bernabé and Jiménez San Cristóbal 2001: 183–200; 2008: 137–150; Bernabé 2002a. Betegh 2004: 332–337 points out that the tablet shows undeniable points of contact with the Derveni text.

To the First-Born, to Mother Earth, to the Cybelean, daughter of Demeter.

Since Phanes does not appear in Orphism till much later, it seems most probable to think that the First-Born is here, as in the theogony of the Derveni Papyrus, Heaven, first son of Night.114 This idea agrees with the password in one group of leaves:115

I am a son of Earth and starry Heaven.

Heaven and Earth form the primeval couple. In the Derveni theogony, Night did not have a partner, as is clearly indicated in the fact that Heaven is qualified with a matronymic "son of Night"116 and not with the usual patronymic. Following the triad of the Thurian leaf, the Maid daughter of Demeter is Persephone, usually called Kόρη. The epithet Cybelean, "daughter of Cybele" is a tautology which insists on the identification of Demeter and Cybele. The name of Demeter is interpreted in the Orphic texts as Γῆ μήτηρ, 117 so Persephone is also daughter of Earth. The deceased addresses, then, his ultimate ancestors, Heaven and Earth, as well as Persephone, deity of the dead, who decides his fate in the other world.

In line 2 Zeus is identified with air, just as in the Derveni theogony. II8 But it is even more curious that in line 5 of the same leaf four gods are identified with four elements (similarly, but not identically, to Empedocles). Thus, we read:

ἀέρ | πῦρ | μᾶτερ | Νῆστι | νύξ |ἡμέρα

Air, in agreement with line 2, is Zeus, the fire is Dionysus (who has been identified with Sun in line 2); Mother is Earth, usually called "Mother Earth" in many texts, among others line 1 of this one, and is fused with Demeter as we have just seen. And the last element, which must be water (by process of elimination), appears with the same divine name Nestis, by which Empedocles used to call it. 119 As fundamental deities two masculine gods are mentioned, both of the above world of light, of the realm of the living (Zeus and Dionysus), and two feminine goddesses, from the lower world of darkness, from the realm of the dead (Demeter and Persephone).

116 OF 10.2 Οὐρανὸς Εὐφρονίδης.

<sup>114</sup> Burkert 1999, Bernabé 2002d, Betegh 2004, Janko 2002, against West 1983, Brisson 1990, Jourdan

<sup>115</sup> Hip. 10 (B10.10) etc., cf. section on "Sons of Earth and Heaven" above.

<sup>117</sup> Cf. e.g. Hymn to Demeter in P. Derv. saec. IV BCE col. XXII Δήμητερ [ P]έα Γῆ Μῆτερ <τε καὶ> Εστία Δηιοῖ.

<sup>118</sup> P. Derv. col. xvII (OF 14 i), cf. OF 14.3 (= 31.5) Ζεὺς πνοιὴ πάντων. 119 Emp. fr. 31 B 6 DK.

The mention of the four gods-elements is followed by references to  $\nu \iota \xi$  and  $\dot{\eta} \mu \dot{\epsilon} \rho \alpha$  "night" and "day," so the entire cosmic order is alluded to: the four elements, and identified with them the gods of above and the gods of below, of life and death, and in the last place, the basic elements of the temporal sequence, night and day, the first one being, besides, a primordial deity in Orphic traditions. <sup>120</sup>

Very similar sequences appear in other works of Orphic literature. The most interesting parallel is two verses of a Hymn to Zeus inserted in the *Rhapsodies* in which, to tell us that Zeus has within himself the whole Universe, the poet mentions four elements and the elemental temporal sequence: night—day, that is, the same six elements mentioned in the aforementioned line (*OF* 243.7–8):

an only royal body, in which all things fulfill their cycle, fire, water, earth and aither, night and day.

We do not believe possible that so close a coincidence could be the result of pure chance particularly since the same elements recur in the so called "Orphic Oath" (OF 619):

Indeed, for the parents of the immortals that exist for ever, Fire, Water, Earth, Heaven, Moon, Sun and great Phanes, and the dark Night as well.

Three elements reappear here called by their usual names: fire, water and earth. Then Heaven is mentioned (which substitutes for air as in Emped. fr. 25 Wright [22 DK] 2), then the two main heavenly bodies, Moon and Sun (which is another way of expressing the sequence day—night), and Phanes and Night, duplication in divine terms of the light of day and night. We find in this text fundamentally the same idea of the structure of the universe that we find in the leaf of Thurii.

### The Moira

In three leaves from Thurii we find an almost identical verse:

But Moira overcame me and he who strikes from the stars with his thunderbolt.

Either Moira overcame me or the thrower of thunderbolts. 121

Traditionally, Moira is the divine personification of destiny and death. <sup>122</sup> In Homer we find parallel expressions to those from the leaves, for instance:

Cf. Bernabé 1998b.
 OF 488.4, 489–490.5.
 Cf. Bernabé and Jiménez San Cristóbal 2001: 148–155; 2008: 109–114.

# Index

```
allegorical, 6, 58, 59, 62, 205
                                                         Derveni Papyrus, 4, 8, 11, 54, 62, 64, 66, 80,
amulets, 9, 127, 175, 187, 220
                                                              88, 90, 156, 203, 204, 207, 234, 254, 268,
anthropogony, 5, 6, 54, 77, 215, 233, 322
                                                              274, 309
Apulian vases, 41, 59, 72, 83, 87, 91, 93, 94, 95, 96,
                                                         dialogue, 13, 103, 105, 111, 112, 195, 219, 225, 227,
     97, 98, 99, 171, 176, 253
                                                              230, 232, 236, 244, 245, 247, 259, 272, 275,
  Italiote vessels, 59
                                                              281, 295, 300
                                                            dialogic, 13, 145, 148, 225, 236, 271
Bacchic, 79, 83, 214, 217, 223, 226, 228, 229,
                                                         Dionysiac, 56, 77, 296
                                                            cult, 9, 57
     254, 259
                                                            ecstasy, 210, 309, 318
   cult, 213, 319
                                                            liberation, 209
   initiation, 210, 214, 223, 311
                                                            mysteries, 8, 56, 59, 60, 64, 74, 86, 107, 108, 121,
  liberation, 214, 234, 253
   mysteries, 9, 61, 62, 64, 69, 108, 110
                                                               164, 172, 173, 181, 187, 215, 217, 218, 254, 272,
                                                              299, 308, 314
  Orphic-Bacchic, 122, 166, 174, 176,
                                                            myth, 47
     179, 189, 191, 197, 223, 238,
                                                            myths, 86, 95, 171, 173, 187, 188, 211, 281, 314,
     254, 310
  rituals, 210
                                                              318, 324, 329, 330
  tablets, 110
                                                            nature, 91, 109
  worshippers, 318, 320, 322
                                                            Orphic-Dionysiac, 108, 118, 119
Bakis, 260, 262, 263, 264, 266, 270
                                                         Dionysos, 6, 11, 13, 55, 58, 59, 61, 66, 82,
                                                              83, 88, 91, 92, 95, 96, 99, 100, 101,
banquet, &I, 84, 87, 95
Basel vase, 59, 95, 97, 100, 219, 253
                                                              110, 115, 116, 170, 171, 173, 176, 182,
bricolage, 146, 266
                                                               187, 188, 193, 195, 209, 210, 211, 213,
Brimo, 9, 11, 37, 244, 251
                                                               214, 215, 216, 217, 226, 253, 254, 256,
                                                              272, 277, 278, 281, 290, 291, 298, 299,
child of Earth and starry Heaven, 5, 8, 10, 22, 24,
                                                              300, 303, 313, 314, 316, 317, 318, 319,
     30, 261, 264, 265
                                                              320, 321, 322, 323, 324, 325, 326, 327,
Christianity, 6, 7, 12, 116, 118, 177, 226, 287, 313
                                                              328, 329, 330
crown, 4, 16, 81, 82, 98, 113, 171, 232, 234, 251, 276,
                                                            Bacchios, 9, 38, 55, 56, 92, 210,
     296, 367
                                                               218, 228
cypress, 3, 5, 22, 24, 25, 26, 27, 28, 29, 30, 32,
                                                            Eubouleus, 78, 92, 212
     34, 124, 128, 137, 138, 139, 151, 178, 179,
                                                            infant, 5
     191, 195, 196, 197, 219, 231, 242, 243, 250,
                                                            Lysios, 115, 209
                                                            son of Persephone, 63, 77, 91, 92,
     264, 265, 295
                                                              155, 226
deictic, 178, 181, 208
                                                            Zagreus, 7, 63, 77, 113, 181, 183, 216, 234, 273,
Delphi, 176, 184, 188, 193, 194, 260, 267, 318,
                                                               280, 304, 322, 324
     319, 326
                                                         dismemberment, 6, 116
Demeter, 9, 11, 38, 53, 56, 63, 88, 91, 156, 170,
                                                         Dodona, 267
     186, 187, 195, 206, 210, 216, 234, 299, 300,
                                                         drama, 195, 233, 291, 298, 299,
     303, 319, 324
                                                              300, 304
```

Index 373

Eleusinian, 61, 74, 91, 171, 206, 207, 210, 212, 213, 214, 215, 216, 241, 259, 296, 300, 308, 312, 325

Elysium, 103, 104, 105, 108, 116, 236, 299 enunciation, 204, 208, 213 enunciative, 204, 206, 207, 208, 209, 213, 218

Erinyes, 64, 94, 96, 99 eschatology, 6, 11, 53, 55, \$7, \$8, 60, 61, 62, 64, 66, 71, 74, 104, 105, 115, 117, 128, 129, 166, 167, 175, 176, 177, 195, 197, 198, 260, 270, 272, 273, 274, 278, 281, 289, 290, 297, 300, 305, 307, 309, 323, 325 esoteric, 103

fertility, 130, 131, 170, 183, 315, 328 forgetfulness, 75, 112, 129, 261, 289

guardians, 3, 5, 22, 24, 30, 32, <u>75,</u> 76, <u>78,</u> 94, 105, 107, 124, 140, 141, 142, 143, 151, 153, 163, 219, 225, 231, 243, 245, 247, 250, 264, 271, 272, 274, 279, 280, 281, 285, 295

Hades, 59, 74, 78, 92, 93, 94, 95, 96, 97, 99, 107, 110, 152, 176, 195, 217, 222, 240, 249, 287, 299, 308

realm of, 5, 22, 24, 30, 32, 53, 57, 64, 66, 71, 81, 84, 85, 93, 94, 96, 97, 105, 108, 141, 178, 206, 219, 228, 231, 237, 238, 243, 244, 247, 250, 253, 264, 268, 275, 288, 325

Hekate, 9, 98, 304

immortality, 83, 111, 112, 118, 266, 269, 272, 287, 289, 290, 299, 305, 308, 309, 323
initiate, 9, 30, 37, 38, 39, 53, 59, 64, 66, 69, 71, 73, 74, 75, 76, 77, 78, 79, 80, 81, 82, 83, 84, 85, 86, 87, 91, 92, 94, 96, 97, 98, 99, 100, 103, 104, 105, 106, 107, 108, 110, 112, 113, 114, 115, 116, 124, 128, 139, 140, 143, 144, 154, 155, 162, 174, 176, 181, 195, 207, 210, 212, 214, 224, 226, 227, 228, 229, 241, 249, 276, 279, 280, 281, 286, 287, 295, 296, 297, 298, 299, 300, 301, 302, 305, 308, 311, 312, 313, 314, 320, 322, 325, 329, 330

initiation, 62, 64, 67, 69, 73, 74, 76, 78, 82, 97, 100, 103, 111, 115, 116, 117, 162, 171, 183, 190, 195, 196, 207, 209, 210, 212, 213, 214, 215, 217, 218, 220, 223, 224, 226, 227, 228, 229, 230, 234, 235, 238, 239, 241, 243, 246, 247, 249, 253, 254, 255, 259, 279, 286, 287, 290, 293, 295, 296, 297, 299, 308, 311, 313, 325 ivy, 8, 42, 45, 56, 82, 169, 170, 171, 188, 207, 299, 309, 318

katabasis, 6, 13, <u>54</u>, <u>57</u>, <u>59</u>, <u>66</u>, <u>71</u>, 247, 260, 266, 273, 288 Kouretes, 183, 184, 192, 193, 317, 320, 326, 327, 328 kourotrophic, 323, 324, 326, 330

Lethe, 94, 105, 110, 184 libation, 132, 136, 157, 160, 161, 162, 229, 230, 239, 295, 307, 308 liturgical, 104, 294

Maenads, 96, 209, 217, 298, 299, 313, 318, 319, 324, 325, 327, 328, 329, 330

magic, 53, 108, 187, 257, 258

makarismos, 114, 115, 116, 210, 212, 222, 224, 225, 226, 228, 229, 232, 235, 239, 240, 255, 264, 301, 305

mantis, 62, 262

metempsychosis, 5, 71, 79, 80 milk, 4, 8, 9, 11, 16, 20, 36, 37, 139, 145, 158, 205, 206, 208, 209, 211, 212, 213, 222, 229, 230, 232, 240, 241, 294, 295, 307, 309, 310, 311, 312, 313, 314, 317, 319, 320, 321, 322, 323, 325, 327, 328, 329

Mnemosyne, 5, 6, 69, 75, 76, 77, 94, 181, 184, 191, 227, 261, 266, 289, 295

Memory, 5, 7, 21, 22, 24, 30, 32, 75, 94, 104, 124, 128, 140, 141, 143, 153, 154, 161, 162, 181, 216, 219, 231, 243, 250, 252, 253, 255, 261, 264, 289, 302, 306, 307, 308

Mountain Mother, 9, 38, 181 Musaeus, 53, 55, 58, 59, 60, 61, 66, 81, 253, 260,

mystery, 7, 9, 54, 55, 56, 57, 59, 60, 61, 62, 63, 64, 66, 69, 72, 73, 74, 82, 84, 96, 100, 102, 103, 105, 107, 108, 110, 111, 113, 118, 121, 153, 166, 167, 171, 175, 179, 181, 182, 183, 184, 189, 190, 191, 195, 197, 198, 206, 207, 209, 210, 212, 213, 214, 215, 216, 218, 228, 239, 241, 254, 267, 281, 296, 300, 302, 309, 312, 320, 323, 324, 325

Neoplatonic, 6, 190 Netherworld geography, 70

Olbia, 54, 55, 56, 97, 110, 215, 278, 291, 299
Onomacritus, 59, 266
oracle, 5, 13, 53, 59, 60, 62, 63, <u>73, 94, 157, 181, 182, 183, 184, 193, 206, 236, 259, 260, 261, 262, 263, 264, 266, 267, 268, 269, 270, 289, 293, 294</u>
original sin, 5, 7, 258
Orphism, 3, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 13, 68, <u>72, 73, 74, 82, 84, </u>

Orphism, 3, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 13, 68, 72, 73, 74, 82, 84, 85, 86, 87, 88, 97, 99, 100, 107, 109, 121, 173, 215, 216, 217, 221, 222, 223, 233, 254, 257, 258, 260, 270, 271, 289

374 Index

```
paradise, 74, 245
                                                         salvation, 75, 83, 84, 97, 115, 117, 118, 258, 277, 283,
Persephone, 9, 11, 41, 53, 63, 69, 70, 71, 73, 75, 77,
                                                               286, 287, 328
                                                         self-definition, 13, 105, 107, 108, 109, 110
     78, 80, 84, 88, 90, 91, 92, 94, 95, 96, 97, 98,
                                                         self-presentation, 10, 12, 103, 105, 107, 111, 112, 113,
     99, 100, 101, 109, 112, 114, 115, 116, 170, 171,
     175, 176, 178, 187, 191, 195, 196, 198, 209, 210,
                                                               117, 153, 154, 156, 162, 163
     211, 212, 213, 215, 216, 217, 218, 222, 225, 226,
                                                         semiotic, 12, 201, 257
     227, 228, 229, 230, 231, 234, 235, 236, 238,
                                                         soteriology, 117, 161, 288
     245, 247, 255, 272, 275, 276, 277, 279, 280,
                                                         speech-acts, 214, 297
     286, 287, 295, 300, 301, 302, 323
Phanes, 53, 65, 88, 89, 92
                                                         theogony, 11, 54, 57, 61, 62, 63, 64, 65, 66,
purity, 70, 78, 86, 87, 101, 113, 118, 236, 286,
                                                              90, 203, 204, 205, 213, 254, 274,
     301, 308
                                                              289, 322
Pythagorean, 8, 55, 56, 57, 58, 59, 66, 67, 69, 108,
                                                         thiasos, 9, 38, 84, 85
     110, 121, 123, 173, 181, 215, 223, 302
                                                         Thurii, 4, 5, 6, 8, 9, 10, 16, 18, 19, 20,
   Pythagoras, 56, 57, 71, 107, 108, 253, 269
                                                              35, 69, 70, 78, 81, 82, 85, 87, 89,
                                                               91, 95, 123, 206, 210, 211, 212,
reincarnation, 6, 56, 57, 58, 111, 129, 246, 288
                                                               213, 216, 259, 263, 264, 265, 272,
religion of the book, 85
                                                               275, 276, 277, 280, 281, 285,
rhythmical prose, 177, 222, 227, 230, 232, 239, 240,
                                                               292, 310, 311, 320, 323, 327, 329
                                                         Timpone Grande, 4, 10, 170, 211, 236
     242, 244, 245, 246
ritual, 13, 59, 63, 74, 75, 82, 85, 92, 104, 109, 115,
                                                         Timpone Piccolo, 4, 9, 211, 233, 235, 322
     117, 137, 152, 154, 162, 167, 172, 175, 181, 182,
                                                         Titans, 5, 77, 78, 80, 92, 109, 113, 215, 216,
     183, 187, 189, 190, 195, 196, 197, 204, 205,
                                                               217, 234, 273, 280, 281, 282, 285, 288,
     206, 213, 214, 215, 217, 220, 223, 224, 227,
                                                               304, 322
                                                         topography, 142, 177, 178, 191, 196, 197, 198, 237,
     235, 237, 238, 239, 241, 242, 244, 245, 254,
     261, 266, 267, 268, 272, 276, 279, 281, 290,
                                                               247, 253
     291, 293, 294, 296, 297, 301, 303, 304, 305,
                                                         Tritopatores, 66
     307, 309, 311, 312, 313, 314, 317, 320, 321, 323,
                                                         Trophonius, 5, 94, 261, 268
     324, 325, 326, 329, 330, 367
  funerary, 13, 54, 62, 82, 84, 153, 170, 173, 214, 217,
                                                         vegetarian, 53, 67, 203
     218, 223, 224, 228, 230, 237, 238, 239, 293, 296
                                                         water of Memory, 3, 5, 6, 151, 261
  initiation, 13, 75, 78, 79, 85, 210, 227, 235, 238,
                                                         wine, 9, 36, 37, 81, 82, 83, 84, 95, 165, 188, 208,
     239, 243, 247, 249, 287
  Orphic, 11
                                                               209, 210, 215, 217, 229, 239, 262, 276, 285,
  practitioners, 60, 67, 259, 265, 266
                                                              295, 307, 308, 309, 310, 311, 314, 315, 317,
  purification, 87, 229, 231, 234, 236, 301
                                                              320, 323, 327
```

# Index locorum

AESCHYLUS	Ran.
Eum.	85, 84
658-61, 316	1023f., 60
Fragments (Radt)	ARISTOTLE
13, 65	Poet.
Pers.	1447a, 274
611, 230	Rh.
614f., 229	3.8, 240
ALCAEUS	AUGUSTINE
fr. 45 Voigt, 73	De civ. D.
ALCMAEON OF CROTON	10.9, 61
24 B 1 DK = <i>OF</i> 1100 VI	De Trin.
Bernabé, 56	28, 61
ALCMAN	and the same of th
fr. 56 Page, 211	BACCHYLIDES
fr. 56 Page = Ath. 11.489f-99a, 319	17, 323
ANACREON	17.94, 323
fr. 357 Page, 319	BRONTINUS
fr. 929b PMG, 319	OF 1100 XI Bernabé = Alexander of
APOLLODORUS	Aphrodisias In Arist. Metaph, 821.32
Bibl.	Hayduck, 50
3.5.1, 314, 325	50.56. <del>*</del> 0.0580933. <del>***</del> 1
3.5.3, 300, 319	CALLIMACHUS
APOLLONIUS RHODIUS	fr. 43.117 Pfeiffer = OF 34 Bernabé, 63
Argon.	CICERO
4.891–911, 59	Div.
APULEIUS	1.43.95, 260
Apol.	Nat. D.
56, 228	3.41, 83
ARATUS	3.58, 63
Phaen.	CLEMENS ALEXANDRINUS
5, 282	Prot.
ARISTOPHANES	2.8.73.1, 81
$A\nu$ .	2.16.2 = OF 589 I Bernabé, 73
967-68, 971-73, 975, 977-79, 262	2.21-22, 213, 296
fr. 12 KA, 84	4.53.3, 164
fr. 504.6-14 KA = OF 432 I	21.2, 241
Bernabé, 84	Strom.
fr. 504.6ff. KA = OF 432 I Bernabé, 81	1.21.131.3 = OF 409, 707, 1018 III, 1106 II, 1124
Nub.	Bernabé, 71
254-60, 81	L2L131.5 = OF 1100 1 Bernabé, 54, 56

CLEMENS ALEXANDRINUS (cont.)	DIOGENES LAERTIUS
Strom. (cont.)	<u>1.5</u> = <i>OF</i> 1046 11 Bernabé, <u>72</u>
5.8.45.4 = OF 438 Bernabé, 288	6.1.4 = OF 203 Bernabé, 269
CONON	8.42 = <i>OF</i> 1100 v Bernabé, 56
FGrH 26 F 1.45, 72	8.55 = <i>OF</i> 1100 VII Bernabé, 56
<i>FGrH</i> 26 F <u>1.45.4–6</u> = <i>OF</i> 1039, 1061 Bernabé, <u>73</u>	DURIS OF SAMOS
CONST. LASCARIS	FGrH 76 F58, 321
Προλεγόμενα τοῦ σοφοῦ Ὀρφέως	
103 (36 Martínez Manzano), 71	EGYPTIAN TEXTS
CRITIAS	Book of the Dead
88 B 3 DK, 55	Spell 1, 145
120 7 0 7 0 7 0 0 0 0 0 0	Spell 17, 145
DAMASCIUS	Spell <u>25</u> , 129
in Pl. Phd.	Spell 37, 144
L11 (35 Westerink) = OF 232 Bernabé, 229	Spell 38, 144
L11 (35 Westerink) = OF 350 Bernabé, 84, 209	Spells 54–56, 150
DEMOCRITUS	Spell 57, 144, 149, 150
68 B 16 DK, 55	Spells 57–58, 149
DEMOSTHENES	Spells 57, 59, 135
18.259 = <i>OF</i> 577 1 Bernabé, <u>82</u> , 239	Spells 57–59, 160
18.260 = <i>OF</i> 577 1 Bernabé, 81	Spell <u>58,</u> 144, 147, 149, 150, 151,
21.52, 267	152, 163
$(25.11) = OF_{33}$ Bernabé, $87$	Spell <u>59,</u> 133, 136,
DIO CHRYSTOSTOMUS	149, 150
Or. 30	Spells 59–62, 150
10-24, 114	Spell <u>60</u> , 149
DIODORUS SICULUS	Spells <u>60–62</u> , 149
1.11.3, 164	Spell 62, 134, 136, 163
1.12.4, 164	Spell 63, 150
1.13.4, 156	Spell 81B, 145
1.23.2, 164	Spell 98, 146
1.23.2,7, 164	Spell 99, 146
1.23.7 = OF 327 IV Bernabé, 73	Spell 122, 144, 147, 150
1.27.5, 164	Spell 125, 152
1.69.3, 164	Spell 144, 142
1.69.3-4, 164	Spell 145, 141, 142
1.92.1-5, 151	Spell 146, 141, 142
<u>1.92.3,</u> 164, 272	Spell 147, 141, 142
1.96.1, 2, 164	Spell 148, 146, 153
L96. <u>I</u> , 164	Spell 149, 141
1.96.1-3, 164	Spell 152, 133
<u>1.96.2–5</u> = <i>OF</i> 55 Bernabé, 94, 97	Coffin Texts
1.96.4,5, 164	<u>I</u> , 56e–f, 134
1.96.4, 164	Spell <u>87</u> , 147
1.96.5, 164	Spell 118, 146
1.96.8, 151	Spell 225, 148
1.96, 152	Spell 227, 155
3.62.4 <u>-5</u> , 329	Spell 335, 146, 148
3.64.1, 63	Spell <u>357</u> , 163
4.3.3, 318	Spell 395, 144, 146, 147
5.49.5 = OF 521 Bernabé, 73	Spells 397–99, 146
5.50.2-5, 326	Spell 407, 145
5.75.4 = OF 530 Bernabé, 72	Pyramid Texts
5.77.3 = OF 529 Bernabé, 72	Spell 303, 146
50.2-5, 327	Spell 359, 146
WINDOWS CO. CONT. CONT. CO. CO.	PER THORN WITH THE STATE OF THE

GOLD TABLETS (cont.)	HARPOCRATION
Bio, 8, 69, 70, 73, 74, 75, 76, 88, 92, 93,	s.v. Άπομάττων (A 193 Keaney), 73
94, 106, 110, 121, 123, 124, 128, 140,	s.v. Λεύκη (Λ 11 Keaney) = <i>OF</i> 577 VIII
153, 177, 222, 223, 225, 228, 230,	Bernabé, 81, 234
231, 232, 233, 236, 242, 247, 248,	s.v. Τριτοπάτορες (T 32 Keaney) = OF 802 1
249, 250, 251, 252, 254, 264, 265,	Bernabé, 66
그 아이들 아이들 아이들 때문에 가장 아이들이 아이들이 아이들이 아이들이 아니다.	HERACLITUS
274, 276, 280, 281, 285, 289	- TO TO THE REPORT OF THE PERSON OF THE PERS
B10-11, 225	fr. 74 Marcovich (22 B 27 DK), 228
BII, 8, 69, 70, <u>75,</u> 76, 77, 93, 94, 124, 128,	fr. 87 Marcovich (22 B 14 DK) = OF 587
153, 177, 221, 222, 223, 225, 233, 236,	Bernabé, 73, 74
245, 247, 248, 249, 250, 251, 252, 254,	HERODORUS
255, 274, 279 P	FGrH 31 F 43a, 59
B12, 77, 167, 172, 173, 174, 175,	HERODOTUS
177, 178, 179, 191, 195, 196,	1.35.1, 282
197, 251	2.81 = OF 43, 45, 650 Bernabé, 66, 66, 215
B13-14, 167	2.81.2, 123, 228
C1, 4, 10, 39, 46, 76, 87, 91, 170, 171, 173, 300	2.154.2, 153
DI, 40, 94, 110, 121	4.78-80, 215
DI-2, 69, 70, 71, 82, 83, 84, 85, 87, 91, 92, 95,	5.90.2, 260, 266
222, 223, 225, 232, 235, 236, 238, 239, 241,	6.57.4, 260, 266
246, 247, 248, 249, 251, 255, 276, 277, 294,	7.6.3, 266
295, 296, 300	7.110-12, 193
D2, 41, 121, 169, 171, 173, 292	8.77, 264
D <sub>3</sub> , 41, 47, 73, 75, 80, 87, 92, 94, 98, 244,	HESIOD
245, 246, 247, 248, 249,	fr. 185.4 M-W, 90
251, 277	fr. 280.19 M-W, 90
D4, 42, 47, 78, 86, 92, 170, 173	Op.
D5, 84, 182, 247	98, 234
D6,	263, 561, 237
E1, 4, 42, 48, 167, 175, 176, 177	299, 282
E2, 5, 42, 48, 245, 246, 255	458-66, 262
E3, 42, 48, 169, 245, 249	597, 805, 294
E <sub>3</sub> -4, 176	Theog.
E4, 42, 48, 73, 167, 170, 171, 172, 173, 174, 175,	35, 185
176, 177, 249	45, 107, 293, 304
E5, 42, 48, 176, 245, 246	106, 107, 293, 304
E6, 42, 48, 92, 170, 245, 249	135, 77
FI, 42, 49, 171	154, 107, 293, 304
F2, 42, 49, 73, 169, 170, 173	376, 409, 191
F <sub>3</sub> , 42, 49, 171	421, 107, 293, 304
F4, 42, 49, 73, 169, 170, 173	768, 90
F5, 42, 49, 73, 169, 170, 171, 173	804, 295
F6, 42, 49, 169, 170, 171	913, 90
F7, 42, 49, 169, 170, 174	940ff., 300
F8, 42, 50, 174	1209ff., 289
F9, 42, 50, 174	HESYCHIUS
F10, 42, 50, 171	s.v. Έλευθερεύς (Ε 2022 Latte), 84
F11, 42, 50, 169, 170	s.v. Έρίφιος (Ε 5906 Latte), 211
	HIPPIAS OF ELIS
F12, 42, 50, 174	86 B 6 DK = <i>OF</i> 1146
F13, 39, 48	
G1, 169, 170, 171, 173	Bernabé, 55
G2, 167, 172, 173, 174	HOMER
G2-4, 167, 172, 173, 174, 175,	II.
vere vo D	a amm fals and
177, 198 G3–4, 167, 172	2.377, 6.365, 303 2.485–86, 302

	22.202 202 204
2.594–600, 302 2.597f., 287	21.183, 282, 284
	21.184-91, 284
3.298, 308, 18.116, 303	21.186, 282
5.171-73, 279	21.187, 303
5.243ff., 284	21.187-89, 279
5.311ff., 283	21.194-99, 284
6.121-236, 272	21.273ff., 284
6.122, 274	22.362, 234
6.127 = 2L.151, 284	22.460-61, 319
6.130-40, 321	22.482f., 93
6.133, 326	23.19, 179, 238
6.136, 18.398, 303	23.71, 228
6.145 = 21.153, 278	24.407, 278
6.146-49, 288	Od.
6.150-211, 279	1.18o, 278
6.151 = 20.214, 279	4.563ff., 299
6.211 = 20.241, 303	4.569f., 299
6.212, 283	5.128, 303
6.231, 283	5.131, 7.249,
8.181, 289	12.387, 303
8.477-81, 93	5.238-40, 196
9.457, 569, 90	5.450, 276
9.632-36, 216	6.291–94, 196
II.628f., 294	7.24, 303
11.631, 294	7.105-06, 196
11.640, 294	9.16-18, 274
11.812, 16.528, 303	9.140-42, 196
12.327 = 13.328, 287	10.491, 534, 566, 90
14.113, 303	10.509, 90, 305
14.201, 57	10.509–10, 196
15.117, 303	11.27, 229
15.610–14,	11.47, 90
16.342, 22.166, 303	II.61, 304
16.849, 233, 303, 304	11.184 = <i>Il.</i> 9.673, 302
18.11 = Hes. Op. 155, 305	11.189, 191, 302
18.41, 328	12.184-91, 302
18.119, 90, 233, 303, 304	14.53, 119, 303
18.497–501, 276	14.199, 204, 278
20.177-352, 272	14.204, 21.335, 303
20.178, 198, 275	15.276, 289
20.194, 283	16.62, 67,
20.195f., 283	16.67, 276
20.203, 274	17.208–10, 196
20.206-41, 283	19.172-73, 165
20.213-41, 279	20.64f., 93
20.300-09, 288	21.212, 278
20.302-08, 283	21.335ff., 279
20.347-49, 283	22.413, 90
20.349, 282	23.73, 110, 279, 290
20.389ff., 274	24.73-75, 290, 323
21.149-60, 182-99, 272	24.203f., 93
21.150, 274	24.531, 303
21.153, 274	HOMERIC HYMNS
21.157-59, 279	Hymn. Hom. Ap.
21.159-60, 279	544, 237
3 T TO	200.00

### Hymn. Hom. Cer.  20f., 302  174. 475, 479, 300  187, 303 368, 319  480-82, 210  480-83, 305  ### Hymn. Hom. Merc.  225, 303  ### Hymn. Hom. Merc.  225, 303  ### Hymn. Hom. Wen.  225, 303  ### Hymn. Hom. Ven.  227, 305  ### Hymn. Hom. Ven.  2410, 69 29.8, 92 29.10, 69 30.6, 92 31.1, 200  42-4, 52-2, 84 43.10, 73 32-4, 92 39.15, 90 31.15, 200  42-4, 52-2, 84 43.10, 73 32-4, 92 39.15, 90 30.15, 103, 105 306, 103, 105 307, 90-10, 69, 25  ### A3, 73  ### LICHUS  ### De comm. math.  ### B OF 1100 viii Bernabé, 56  ### Protr.  77-27 Des Places = OF 430 v Bernabé, 81  ### VP  ### 143, 228 ### 154f., 228  ### 154f., 226	HOMERIC HYMNS (cont.)	IC I.xii.1, 183
20f., 302 174, 475, 479, 300 187, 303 368, 319 480-82, 210 480-82, 210 480-85, 305 Hymn. Hom. Merc. 225, 303 450, 303 Hymn. Hom. Ven. 272, 305 HYMN. ORPH. 24,10, 69 29,10, 69 30.6, 92 29,10, 69 31.1, 200 42-4, \$22-2, \$84 43.10, 73 \$2.44, 92 \$99.18, 190 \$12.26, 69 \$7.99-10, 69, 25 \$4-3, 72 HAMBLICHUS De comm. math. 8 = OF 1100 VIII Bernabé, 56 Protr. 77, 27 Des Places = OF 430 v Bernabé, 81 VP 143, 228 154f., 228 27,132 = OF 1100 III Bernabé, 56 Protr. 77, 27 Des Places = OF 430 v Bernabé, 81 VP 143, 228 154f., 228 27,132 = OF 1100 III Bernabé, 56 Protr. 147, 228 1599, 306, 185 1992, 360, 185 1992, 360, 185 1992, 360, 185 1992, 360, 185 1992, 360, 185 1992, 360, 185 1992, 360, 185 1992, 360, 185 1992, 360, 185 1992, 360, 185 1992, 360, 185 1992, 360, 185 1993, 318, 185 CEG 195, 277 CIG II.1948, 92 DGE 792 Schwyzer = LSCGS 120 Sokolowski, 214 Epigr. Gr. 312,13ff. Kaibel, 84 Geist-Pohl 433, 106 434, 106 435, 106  JULIAN Or.	423 TO THE STATE OF THE STATE O	
T24, 475, 479, 300   IC   Laxii	* *	가게되었다
187, 303   368, 319   369, 313, 310	5 - 10 - 10 - 10 - 10 - 10 - 10 - 10 - 1	. 전기 입사는 - 이 지수에 전 - 18.4 전 및 전기 시작하다 때
368, 319 480-82, 210 480-85, 305 Hymn. Hom. Merc. 225, 303 450, 303 Hymn. Hom. Ven. 272, 305 HYMN. ORPH. 2410, 69 29.8, 92 29.10, 69 30.6, 92 31.1, 200 42-4, \$2-2, \$4 43.10, 73 \$2-4, 92 \$39.13f., 90 \$71.2, 69 \$7.99-10, 69, 75 \$4-3, 72 \$1AMBLICHUS De comm. math. 8 = OF 1100 vIII Bernabé, 56 Protr. 77.27 Des Places = OF 430 v Bernabé, 81 VP 143, 228 154f., 228 154f., 228 154f., 228 154f., 228 154f., 228 154f., 228 1599.3, 185 1996.334, 132, 185 1996.334, 132, 185 1996.334, 132, 185 1998.318, 185 CEG 195, 277 CIG II.1948, 92 DGE 792 Schwyzer = LSCGS 120 Sokolowski, 214 Epigr. Gr. 312.13ff. Kaibel, 84 Geist-Pfohl 433, 106 434, 106 434, 106 435, 106  FULLAN Or.  CILIxii.12, 187 III. ip [Praisos], 7A Line 14, 187 IG III.ii.21, 188 III.12, 187 III	이번 경기 위에 가게 되었다면 하다 하다 하나요.	이 보면서 보면 있습니다. 이 경험 경험에 보면 이 보면 되었다면 보면 되었다면 되었다면 보면 하다. 그리고 있다면 보다
480-82, 210 480-85, 305 Hymm. Hom. Merc. 225, 303 450, 303 Hymn. Hom. Ven. 272, 305 HYMN. ORPH. 24,10, 69 29,8, 92 29,10, 69 30.6, 92 31.1, 200 29,10, 69 30.6, 92 31.1, 200 21, 22, 84 43,10, 73 22,2, 84 43,10, 73 22,2, 84 43,10, 73 22,2, 84 43,10, 73 22,2, 84 43,10, 73 22,2, 84 43,10, 73 22,2, 84 43,10, 73 22,2, 84 43,10, 73 22,2, 84 43,10, 73 22,2, 84 43,10, 73 22,2, 84 43,10, 73 22,2, 84 43,10, 73 22,2, 84 43,10, 73 22,2, 84 43,10, 73 22,2, 84 43,10, 73 22,2, 84 43,10, 73 22,2, 84 43,10, 73 22,2, 84 43,10, 74 220, 105		
#80-85, 305  Hymn. Hom. Merc. 225, 303  450, 303  Hymn. Hom. Ven. 272, 305  HYMN. ORPH. 24,10, 69 29, 8, 92 29,10, 69 30.6, 92 31,1, 200 42,4, \$2,2, 84 43,10, 73 \$2,4, 92 \$9,15, 93  HAMBLICHUS De comm. math. 8 = OF 100 vII Bernabé, 56 Protr. 77,27 Des Places = OF 430 v Bernabé, 21  HYP  143, 228 154f., 228 27, 132 = OF 100 II Bernabé, 56 36 B 2 DK = OF 1144 I Bernabé, 56 36 B 2 DK = OF 1144 I Bernabé, 56 37, 17, 17, 18, 119 38, 106 38, 106 39, 107, 107 39, 105 30, 105 30, 105 30, 105, 111 255, 103, 105 30, 105, 101 255, 103, 105 30, 105, 101 255, 103, 105 30, 105, 101 255, 103, 105 30, 105, 101 255, 103, 105 30, 105, 101 255, 103, 105 30, 105, 101 255, 103, 105 30, 105, 101 255, 103, 105 30, 105, 101 255, 103, 105 30, 105, 101 255, 103, 105 30, 105, 101 255, 103, 105 30, 105, 101 255, 103, 105 30, 105, 101 255, 103, 105 30, 105, 101 255, 103, 105 30, 105, 105 30, 105, 101 255, 103, 105 30, 105, 101 255, 103, 105 30, 105, 101 255, 103, 105 30, 105, 101 255, 103, 105 30, 105, 105 30, 105, 101 30, 105 30, 105 30, 105, 105 30, 105 30, 105 30, 105 30, 105 30, 105 30, 105 30, 105 30, 105 30, 105 30, 105 30, 105 30, 105 30, 105 30, 105 30,		1 : 일반에게 1 : 1 : 1 : 1 : 1 : 1 : 1 : 1 : 1 : 1
### Hymn. Hom. Merc.  225, 303  450, 303  Hymn. Hom. Ven. 272, 305  HYMN. ORPH.  24,10, 69  29,8, 92  29,10, 69  30.6, 92  31.1, 200  30.6, 92  31.1, 200  31.1, 200  43.1, 23  22-4, 92  29,13, 69  77-9-10, 69, 75  84-3, 72  HAMBLICHUS  Be OF 1100 VIII Bernabé, 56  Protr. 77,27 Des Places = OF 430 v Bernabé, 81  VP  143, 228  27,132 = OF 1100 III Bernabé, 56  Protr. 77,27 Des Places = OF 430 v Bernabé, 81  VP  143, 228  27,132 = OF 1100 III Bernabé, 56  27,132 = OF 1100 III Bernabé, 56  199,2360, 185  1992,360, 185  1992,360, 185  1992,360, 185  1992,377  CIG II.1948, 92  DGE  792 Schwyzer = LSCGS 120  Sokolowski, 214  Epigr, Gr. 312,13ff. Kaibel, 84  Geiss-Pfohl  433, 106  434, 106  434, 106  435, 106  JULIAN  Or.		
225, 303 450, 303 450, 303 470, 303 470, 303 470, 305 470, 305 470, 305 470, 305 470, 305 470, 306 470, 306, 92 29.10, 69 31.1, 200 29.10, 69 31.1, 200 29.10, 69 31.1, 200 250, 103, 105, 111 250, 103, 105 250, 103, 105, 111 250, 103, 105 250, 103, 105, 111 250, 103, 105 250, 103, 105, 111 250, 103, 105 250, 103, 105, 111 250, 103, 105 250, 103, 105 250, 103, 105, 111 278, 103, 105 278, 103 287, 103, 105 306, 103, 105 453, 106 480, 106 481, 108 480, 106 481, 108 481,		: 10 1.1. 1.1. 1.1. 1.1. 1.1. 1.1. 1.1.
450, 303		
### ### ##############################		를 맞고 있는 것이 되었다. 이번 이 이 이 프로젝트의 하고 있어 이 중에 있게 하는 이 이 경기를 하고 있다. 이 이 이 이 이 이 이 이 이 이 이 이 이 이 이 이 이 이 이
272, 305 HYMN. ORPH.  24.10, 69 29.8, 92 29.10, 69 30.6, 92 31.1, 200 42.4, \$2.2, \$4 43.10, 73 52.4, 92 59.13f., 90 77.9-10, 69, 75 84.3, 73  IAMBLICHUS De comm. math. 8 = OF 1100 viii Bernabé, 56 Protr. 77.27 Des Places = OF 430 v Bernabé, 81 VP 143, 228 154f., 228 27.132 = OF 1100 iii Bernabé, 56 27.132 = OF 1100 ii Bernabé, 56 27.132 = OF 1100 iv Bernabé, 56 1NSCRIPTIONS 185 BÉ 1992.360, 185 1996.324, 332, 185 1998.318, 185 CEG 195, 277 CIG II.1948, 92 DGE 792 Schwyzer = LSCGS 120 Sokolowski, 214 Epigr. Gr. 312.13ff. Kaibel, 84 Geist-Pfohl 433, 106 434, 106 435, 106  PCR 208, 103, 103 209, 105 210, 103, 105 220, 106 230, 103, 105, 111 255, 103, 105 256, 103, 105, 112 257, 103, 105 306, 103,	1 H L L 1 T M C 1 T M L M C C C C C C C C C C C C C C C C C	
HYMN. ORPH.  24-10, 69 29.8, 92 29.10, 69 30.6, 92 31.1, 200 250, 103, 105, 111 24.4, \$2.2, \$4 43.10, 73 52-4, 92 259, 136, 90 77.9-10, 69, 75 84.3, 73  IAMBLICHUS De comm. math. 8 = OF 1100 VIII Bernabé, 56 Protr. 77.27 Des Places = OF 430 V Bernabé, 81 VP 143, 228 154f., 228 27.132 = OF 1100 III Bernabé, 56 27.132 = OF 1100 III Bernabé, 56 27.132 = OF 1100 IV Bernabé, 56 INSCRIPTIONS 185 BÊ 1992.360, 185 1998.318, 185 CEG 195, 277 CIG II.1948, 92 DEE 195, 277 CIG II.1948, 92 DEE 197. 275 CIG II.1948, 92 DEE 18 CESCS 120 Sokolowski, 214 Epigr. Gr. 312.13ff. Kaibel, 84 Geist-Pfohl 433, 106 434, 106 435, 106  Port. 200, 103, 105 220, 106 220, 103, 105 226, 103, 105, III 220, 105 246, 103, 105 304, 103, 105 304, 103, 105 304, 103, 105 306, 103, 105 3		
24.10, 69 29.8, 92 29.10, 69 30.6, 92 31.1, 200 320, 105 31.1, 200 250, 103, 112 250, 106 31.1, 200 250, 103, 105, 111 255, 103, 105 31.1, 200 250, 103, 105, 111 255, 103, 105 250, 103, 105 250, 103, 105, 111 255, 103, 105 250	(B. 1861) (B. 1873) (B. 1874)	
29.8, 92 29.10, 69 29.10, 69 31.1, 200 320, 103, 105, 111 255, 103, 105 42.4, 52.2, 84 255, 103, 105 278, 103 278, 103 287, 103, 105 287, 103, 105 287, 103, 105 287, 103, 105 287, 103, 105 304, 103, 105 306, 103, 105 451, 103,		
29.10, 69 30.6, 92 31.1, 200 210, 103, 112 220, 106 31.1, 200 250, 103, 105, 111 252, 103, 105 266, 103, 105, 112 278, 103 287, 103, 105 287, 103, 105 287, 103, 105 304, 103, 105 304, 103, 105 304, 103, 105 304, 103, 105 304, 103, 105 304, 103, 105 304, 103, 105 304, 103, 105 304, 103, 105 304, 103, 105 451, 103, 105 451, 103, 105 451, 103, 106 480, 106 480, 106 480, 106 480, 106 480, 106 480, 106 480, 106 480, 106 480, 106 480, 106 481, 105 31. 105 31. 105 32EG 26. 1139 = OF 474 Bernabé, 217 39.958, 186 41.743, 185 41.744, 186, 187 45.1239, 192 45.1238, 185 46.1206, 185 1992.360, 185 1996.324, 332, 185 1996.324, 332, 185 1998.318, 185 CEG 195, 277 CIG II.1948, 92 DGE 18ENAEUS Adv. haer. 1.21.5, 119 SOCRATES Bus. 28 (14 A 4 DK), 56 434, 106 434, 106 435, 106  JULIAN Or.		
30.6, 92 31.1, 200 42.4, \$2.2, \$84 43.10, \$73 52.4, \$92 59.13f., \$90 71.2, \$69 77.9-10, \$69, \$75 84.3, \$73 1AMBLICHUS De comm. math.  \$ = OF 1100 VIII Bernabé, \$6 Protr. 77.27 Des Places = OF 430 v Bernabé, \$1 VP 143, \$228 154f., \$228 27.132 = OF 1100 III Bernabé, \$6 27.132 = OF 1100 III Bernabé, \$6 27.132 = OF 1100 III Bernabé, \$6 1NSCRIPTIONS 185 BÉ 1992.360, 185 1998.318, 185 CEG 195, \$277 CIG II.1948, 92 DGE 792 Schwyzer = LSCGS 120 Sokolowski, \$214 Epigr. Gr. 312.13ff. Kaibel, \$4 Geist-Pfohl 433, 106 434, 106 435, 106  220, 106 230, 105, 111 225, 103, 105 304, 103, 105 306, 103, 105 451, 103, 105 451, 103, 105 451, 103, 105 453, 106 461.206, 185, 103 460, 106 266, 103, 105, 111 278, 103 266, 103, 105, 112 278, 103 287, 103, 105 306, 103, 105 451, 104, 105 450, 104, 105 450, 104, 105 451, 105 451, 1		
31.1, 200 42.4, \$2.2, \$8.4 43.10, \$73 255, 103, 105, 111 255, 103, 105 266, 103, 105, 112 278, 103 287, 103, 105 287, 103, 105 304, 103, 105 304, 103, 105 304, 103, 105 304, 103, 105 304, 103, 105 306, 103, 105 451, 103, 105 451, 103, 105 451, 103, 105 453, 106 454, 106 455, 106 455, 106 455, 106 455, 106 455, 106 455, 106 455, 106 455, 106 455, 106 455, 106 455, 106 455, 106 455, 106 455, 106 455, 106 455, 106 455, 106 455, 106 455, 107 450, 103, 105 451, 105 451, 103, 105 451, 103, 105 451, 103, 105 451, 103, 105 451, 103, 105 451, 103, 105 451, 103, 105 451, 103, 105 451, 103, 105 451, 103, 105 451, 103, 105 451, 103, 105 451, 103, 105 451, 103, 105 451, 103, 105 451, 104 451, 105 451		
42.4, \$2.2, \$4  43.10, 73  \$2.4, 92  \$9.13f., 90  71.2, 69  77.9-10, 69, 75  84.3, 73  IAMBLICHUS  De comm. math.  \$ = OF 1100 VII Bernabé, \$6  Protr.  77.27 Des Places = OF 430 v Bernabé, \$1  VP  143, 228  154f., 228  27.132 = OF 1100 III Bernabé, \$6  27.132 = OF 1100 IV Bernabé, \$6  27.132 = OF 1100 IV Bernabé, \$6  1992.360, 185  1992.360, 185  1998.318, 185  CEG  195, 277  CIG II.1948, 92  DGE  792 Schwyzer = LSCGS 120  Sokolowski, 214  Epigr. Gr.  312.13ff. Kaibel, 84  Geist-Pfohl  255, 103, 105  266, 103, 105, 102  278, 103, 105  304, 103, 105  305, 103, 105  306, 103, 105  453, 106  480, 106  Pfohl  Pfohl  Protr.  26.1139 = OF 474 Bernabé, 217  39.958, 186  41.743, 185  41.744, 186, 187  45.1239, 192  45.1258, 185  46.12206, 185, 193  49.703, 174  52.822, 185, 187  ION OF CHIOS  36 B 2 DK = OF 1144 I Bernabé, \$6  fr. 744 Page, 209  fr. 871 Page, 209  IRENAEUS  Adv. haer.  1.21.5, 119  ISOCRATES  Bus.  28 (14 A 4 DK), 56  433, 106  434, 106  435, 106  JULIAN  Or.		
43.10, 73 52.4, 92 59.13f., 90 71.2, 69 77.9–10, 69, 75 84.3, 73  IAMBLICHUS De comm. math. 8 = OF 1100 VIII Bernabé, 56 Protr. 77.27 Des Places = OF 430 v Bernabé, 81 VP 143, 228 154f., 228 27.132 = OF 1100 III Bernabé, 56 27.132 = OF 100 IV Bernabé, 56 27.132 = OF 100 IV Bernabé, 56 1992.360, 185 1996.324, 332, 185 1998.318, 185 CEG 195, 277 CIG II.1948, 92 DGE 792 Schwyzer = LSCGS 120 Sokolowski, 214 Epigr. Gr. 312.13f. Kaibel, 84 Geist-Pfohl 433, 106 435, 106  19ULIAN Or.		
\$\frac{52.4}{59.13f.}, 90\$ \$\frac{71.2}{12.6} \text{ 69}\$ \$\frac{77.9}{77.9} \text{ -10}, \text{ 69}, \frac{75}{58}\$ \$\frac{84.3}{73}\$ \$\frac{450}{304.} \text{ 103}, \text{ 105}\$ \$\frac{450}{310.} \text{ 105}\$ \$\frac{450}{310.} \text{ 105}\$ \$\frac{450}{310.} \text{ 106}\$ \$\frac{480}{310.} \text{ 106}\$ \$\frac{480}{310.} \text{ 106}\$ \$\frac{480}{480}, \text{ 106}\$ \$\frac{480}{480}, \text{ 106}\$ \$\frac{480}{480}, \text{ 106}\$ \$\frac{480}{480}, \text{ 106}\$ \$\frac{487}{480}, \text{ 106}\$ \$48		
\$\frac{59.13f.}{1,90}\$ \$\frac{71.2, 69}{77.9-10, 69, 25}\$ \$\frac{84.3, 73}{306, 103, 105}\$ \$\frac{304, 103, 105}{306, 103, 105}\$ \$\frac{450, 103, 105}{306, 103, 105}\$ \$\frac{450, 103, 105}{451, 105}\$ \$\frac{450, 103, 105}{		
71.2, 69 77.9-10, 69, 75 84.3, 73  IAMBLICHUS De comm. math. 8 = OF 1100 viii Bernabé, 56 Protr. 77.27 Des Places = OF 430 v Bernabé, 81 VP 143, 228 154f., 228 154f., 228 27.132 = OF 1100 iii Bernabé, 56 27.132 = OF 1100 ii Bernabé, 56 27.132 = OF 1100 ii Bernabé, 56 27.132 = OF 1100 ii Bernabé, 56 1992.360, 185 1998.318, 185 CEG 195, 277 CIG II.1948, 92 DGE 195, 277 CIG II.1948, 92 DGE 792 Schwyzer = LSCGS 120 Sokolowski, 214 Epigr. Gr. 312.13ff. Kaibel, 84 Geist-Pfohl 433, 106 433, 106 433, 106 435, 106  19ULIAN Or.		
77.9-10, 69, 75 84.3, 73  IAMBLICHUS  De comm. math.  8 = OF 1100 VIII Bernabé, 56  Protr.  77.27 Des Places = OF 430 v Bernabé, 81  VP  143, 228 154f., 228 27.132 = OF 1100 III Bernabé, 56 27.132 = OF 1100 IV Bernabé, 56 27.132 = OF 1100 IV Bernabé, 56 27.132 = OF 1100 IV Bernabé, 56 1992.360, 185 1998.318, 185  CEG 195, 277 CIG II.1948, 92 DGE 792 Schwyzer = LSCGS 120 Sokolowski, 214 Epigr. Gr. 312.13ff. Kaibel, 84 Geist-Pfohl 433, 106 433, 106 433, 106 435, 106  JULIAN Or.		
84.3, 73  IAMBLICHUS  De comm. math.  8 = OF 1100 VIII Bernabé, 56  Protr.  77.27 Des Places = OF 430 v Bernabé, 81  VP  143, 228  154f., 228  27.132 = OF 1100 III Bernabé, 56  27.132 = OF 1100 IV Bernabé, 56  27.132 = OF 1100 IV Bernabé, 56  27.132 = OF 1100 IV Bernabé, 56  1992.360, 185  1998.318, 185  CEG  195, 277  CIG II.1948, 92  DGE  792 Schwyzer = LSCGS 120  Sokolowski, 214  Epigr. Gr.  312.13ff. Kaibel, 84  Geist-Pfohl  433, 106  433, 106  433, 106  433, 106  435, 106  JULIAN  Or.		
AMBLICHUS		
AMBLICHUS	04.5, 🔼	
De comm. math.  8 = OF 1100 VIII Bernabé, 56 Protr.  77.27 Des Places = OF 430 v Bernabé, 81 VP  143, 228 154f., 228 27.132 = OF 1100 III Bernabé, 56 27.132 = OF 1100 IV Bernabé, 56  INSCRIPTIONS 185 BÉ  1992.360, 185 1996.324, 332, 185 1998.318, 185 CEG 195, 277 CIG II.1948, 92 DGE 792 Schwyzer = LSCGS 120 Sokolowski, 214 Epigr. Gr. 312.13ff. Kaibel, 84 Geist-Pfohl 433, 106 434, 106 435, 106  INSCRIPTION III Bernabé, 56 41.744, 186, 187 41.744, 186 41.743, 185 41.743, 185 41.743, 185 41.743, 185 41.743, 185 41.743, 185 41.743, 185 41.743, 185 41.744, 186 41.743, 186 41.743, 186 41.743, 186 41.743, 185 41.743, 185 41.743, 185 41.743, 185 41.744, 186 41.743, 186 41.743, 186 41.743, 186 41.743, 186 41.743, 186 41.743, 186 41.743, 186 41.744, 186 41.743, 186 41.744, 186 41.743, 186 41.743, 186 41.744, 186 41.743, 185 41.744, 186 41.743, 185 41.744, 186 41.743, 185 41.744, 186 41.743, 185 41.744, 186 41.743, 185 41.744, 186 41.744, 186 41.744, 186 41.744, 186 41.744, 186 41.744, 186 41.744, 18c 41.744, 186 41.744, 186 41.744, 186 41.744, 186 41.744, 186 41	IAMBLICHUS	
8 = OF 1100 VIII Bernabé, 56 Protr.  77.27 Des Places = OF 430 v Bernabé, 81 VP  143, 228 154f., 228 27.132 = OF 1100 III Bernabé, 56 27.132 = OF 1100 IV Bernabé, 56 1992.360, 185 1996.324, 332, 185 1996.324, 332, 185 1998.318, 185 CEG  195, 277 CIG II.1948, 92 DGE 792 Schwyzer = LSCGS 120 Sokolowski, 214 Epigr. Gr. 312.13ff. Kaibel, 84 Geist-Pfohl 433, 106 434, 106 435, 106  Pfohl 31, 105 SEG 36, 139 = OF 474 Bernabé, 217 39.958, 186 41.743, 185 41.744, 186, 187 41.744, 186, 187 45.1239, 192 26.1139 = OF 474 Bernabé, 217 39.958, 186 41.743, 185 41.744, 186, 187 45.1239, 192 11.744, 186, 187 45.1258, 185 46.1206, 185, 193 49.703, 174 52.852, 185, 187 ION OF CHIOS 36 B 2 DK = OF 1144 I Bernabé, 56 fr. 744 Page, 209 fr. 871 Page, 209 IRENAEUS Adv. haer. 121.5, 119 ISOCRATES Bus. 28 (14 A 4 DK), 56		
Protr.       31, 105         77.27 Des Places = OF 430 v Bernabé, &I       31, 105         VP       26.1139 = OF 474 Bernabé, 217         143, 228       39.958, 186         154f., 228       41.743, 185         27.132 = OF 1100 III Bernabé, 56       41.744, 186, 187         27.132 = OF 1100 IV Bernabé, 56       45.1239, 192         INSCRIPTIONS 185       46.1206, 185, 193         BÉ       49.703, 174         1992.360, 185       49.703, 174         1998.318, 185       1ON OF CHIOS         CEG       36 B 2 DK = OF 1144 I Bernabé, 56         195, 277       fr. 744 Page, 209         CIG II.1948, 92       fr. 871 Page, 209         DGE       IRENAEUS         Adv. haer.       1.21.5, 119         Sokolowski, 214       1.21.5, 119         Epigr. Gr.       312.13ff. Kaibel, 84       28 (14 A 4 DK), 56         Geist-Pfohl       28 (14 A 4 DK), 56         434, 106       JULIAN         435, 106       JULIAN		
77.27 Des Places = <i>OF</i> 430 v Bernabé, 81  VP  143, 228  154f., 228  27.132 = <i>OF</i> 1100 III Bernabé, 56  27.132 = <i>OF</i> 1100 IV Bernabé, 56  27.132 = <i>OF</i> 1100 IV Bernabé, 56  INSCRIPTIONS 185  BÊ  1992.360, 185  1998.318, 185  CEG  195, 277  CIG II.1948, 92  DGE  792 Schwyzer = <i>LSCGS</i> 120  Sokolowski, 214  Epigr. Gr. 312.13ff. Kaibel, 84  Geist-Pfohl  433, 106  434, 106  435, 106  Sokolowski, 216  Sokolowski, 216  Geist-Pfohl  433, 106  434, 106  435, 106  Sokolowski, 216  L21.3, 119  SEG  26.1139 = <i>OF</i> 474 Bernabé, 217  39.958, 186  41.743, 185  41.744, 186, 187  45.1239, 192  45.1258, 185  46.1206, 185, 193  49.703, 174  52.852, 185, 187  ION OF CHIOS  36 B 2 DK = <i>OF</i> II44 I Bernabé, 56  fr. 744 Page, 209  fr. 871 Page, 209  IRENAEUS  Adv. haer.  1.21.5, 119  ISOCRATES  Bus. 28 (14 A 4 DK), 56		
VP       26.1139 = OF 474 Bernabé, 217         143, 228       39.958, 186         154f., 228       41.743, 185         27.132 = OF 1100 III Bernabé, 56       41.744, 186, 187         27.132 = OF 1100 IV Bernabé, 56       45.1239, 192         INSCRIPTIONS 185       45.1258, 185         BÊ       46.1206, 185, 193         1992.360, 185       49.703, 174         1998.318, 185       10N OF CHIOS         CEG       36 B 2 DK = OF 1144 I Bernabé, 56         195, 277       fr. 744 Page, 209         CIG II.1948, 92       fr. 871 Page, 209         DGE       IRENAEUS         792 Schwyzer = LSCGS 120       Adv. haer.         Sokolowski, 214       1.21.5, 119         Epigr. Gr.       ISOCRATES         312.13ff. Kaibel, 84       Bus.         Geist-Pfohl       28 (14 A 4 DK), 56         433, 106       JULIAN         435, 106       JULIAN		
143, 228 154f., 228 27.132 = OF 1100 III Bernabé, 56 27.132 = OF 1100 IV Bernabé, 56 27.132 = OF 1100 IV Bernabé, 56  1NSCRIPTIONS 185  BÉ 1992.360, 185 1996.324, 332, 185 1998.318, 185  CEG 195, 277 CIG II.1948, 92 DGE 792 Schwyzer = LSCGS 120 Sokolowski, 214 Epigr. Gr. 312.13ff. Kaibel, 84 Geist-Pfohl 433, 106 434, 106 435, 106  39.958, 186 41.743, 185 41.744, 186, 187 45.1239, 192 45.1258, 185 46.1206, 185, 193 49.703, 174 52.852, 185, 187 ION OF CHIOS 36 B 2 DK = OF 1144 I Bernabé, 56 fr. 744 Page, 209 fr. 871 Page, 209 IRENAEUS Adv. haer. 1.21.5, 119 ISOCRATES Bus. 28 (14 A 4 DK), 56	그는 그들은 아이에게 있어야 하나 나를 보고 있다면 하는데 되었다. 그들은 아이에는 그들은 그들은 그들은 그들은 그들은 그를 보고 있다면 하는데 되었다.	
154f., 228 27.132 = OF 1100 III Bernabé, 56 27.132 = OF 1100 IV Bernabé, 56 27.132 = OF 1100 IV Bernabé, 56  10SCRIPTIONS 185  1092.360, 185 1996.324, 332, 185 1998.318, 185  CEG 195, 277 CIG II.1948, 92 DGE 792 Schwyzer = LSCGS 120 Sokolowski, 214 Epigr. Gr. 312.13ff. Kaibel, 84 Geist-Pfohl 433, 106 434, 106 435, 106  196 IIO III Bernabé, 56 41.744, 186, 187 45.1239, 192 45.1239, 192 45.1239, 192 45.1239, 192 45.1239, 192 45.1239, 192 45.1239, 192 45.1239, 192 45.1239, 192 45.1239, 192 45.1239, 192 45.1239, 192 45.1239, 192 45.1239, 192 45.1239, 192 45.1239, 192 46.1206, 185, 193 49.703, 174 52.852, 185, 187 ION OF CHIOS 36 B 2 DK = OF 1144 I Bernabé, 56 fr. 744 Page, 209 fr. 871 Page, 209 IRENAEUS Adv. haer. 121.5, 119 ISOCRATES Bus. 28 (14 A 4 DK), 56		
27.132 = OF 1100 III Bernabé, 56 27.132 = OF 1100 IV Bernabé, 56  1NSCRIPTIONS 185  BÉ  1992.360, 185 1996.324, 332, 185 1998.318, 185  CEG  195, 277  CIG II.1948, 92  DGE  792 Schwyzer = LSCGS 120 Sokolowski, 214  Epigr. Gr. 312.13ff. Kaibel, 84  Geist-Pfohl 433, 106 434, 106 435, 106  A5.1239, 192  45.1258, 185 46.1206, 185, 193 49.703, 174 52.852, 185, 187  ION OF CHIOS 36 B 2 DK = OF 1144 I Bernabé, 56 fr. 744 Page, 209 fr. 871 Page, 209 IRENAEUS Adv. haer. 1.21.5, 119 ISOCRATES Bus. 28 (14 A 4 DK), 56		
27.132 = OF 1100 IV Bernabé, 56  INSCRIPTIONS 185  BÉ  1992.360, 185 1996.324, 332, 185 1998.318, 185  CEG  195, 277 CIG II.1948, 92  DGE  792 Schwyzer = LSCGS 120 Sokolowski, 214  Epigr. Gr. 312.13ff. Kaibel, 84  Geist-Pfohl 433, 106 434, 106 435, 106  INSCRIPTIONS 185 45.1239, 192 45.1239, 192 45.1239, 192 45.1239, 192 45.1239, 192 45.1239, 192 45.1239, 192 45.1239, 192 45.1248, 185 46.1206, 185, 193 49.703, 174 52.852, 185, 187 ION OF CHIOS 62.852, 185, 187 ION OF CHIOS 68 2 DK = OF 1144 I Bernabé, 56 fr. 744 Page, 209 fr. 871 Page, 209 IRENAEUS Adv. haer. 1.21.5, 119 ISOCRATES Bus. 28 (14 A 4 DK), 56	[10] [10] [10] [10] [10] [10] [10] [10]	
INSCRIPTIONS 185	이 내 보는 바다 하는 이번에 얼굴에 가게 하다 나는 사람들이 하는 것이 없었다.	
BÉ       46.1206, 185, 193         1992.360, 185       49.703, 174         1996.324, 332, 185       52.852, 185, 187         1998.318, 185       ION OF CHIOS         CEG       36 B 2 DK = OF 1144 I Bernabé, 56         195, 277       fr. 744 Page, 209         CIG II.1948, 92       fr. 871 Page, 209         DGE       IRENAEUS         792 Schwyzer = LSCGS 120       Adv. haer.         Sokolowski, 214       1.21.5, 119         Epigr. Gr.       ISOCRATES         312.13ff. Kaibel, 84       Bus.         Geist-Pfohl       28 (14 A 4 DK), 56         433, 106       JULIAN         435, 106       JULIAN         Or.		
1992.360, 185 1996.324, 332, 185 1998.318, 185  CEG 36 B 2 DK = OF 1144 I Bernabé, 56 195, 277 CIG II.1948, 92 DGE 1RENAEUS 792 Schwyzer = LSCGS 120 Sokolowski, 214 Epigr. Gr. 312.13ff. Kaibel, 84 Geist-Pfohl 433, 106 434, 106 435, 106  JULIAN 435, 106  JULIAN 435, 106  JULIAN 435, 106		
1996.324, 332, 185 1998.318, 185  CEG  36 B 2 DK = OF 1144 I Bernabé, 56 195, 277  CIG II.1948, 92  DGE  792 Schwyzer = LSCGS 120 Sokolowski, 214  Epigr. Gr. 312.13ff. Kaibel, 84  Geist-Pfohl  433, 106 434, 106 435, 106  DIN OF CHIOS 36 B 2 DK = OF 1144 I Bernabé, 56 fr. 744 Page, 209 fr. 871 Page, 209 IRENAEUS Adv. haer.  1.21.5, 119 ISOCRATES Bus. 28 (14 A 4 DK), 56  JULIAN Or.		
ION OF CHIOS  CEG  36 B 2 DK = OF 1144 I Bernabé, 56  195, 277  CIG II.1948, 92  DGE  792 Schwyzer = LSCGS 120  Sokolowski, 214  Epigr. Gr.  312.13ff. Kaibel, 84  Geist-Pfohl  433, 106  434, 106  435, 106  ION OF CHIOS  36 B 2 DK = OF 1144 I Bernabé, 56  fr. 744 Page, 209  fr. 871 Page, 209  IRENAEUS  Adv. haer.  1.21.5, 119  ISOCRATES  Bus.  28 (14 A 4 DK), 56  JULIAN  Or.		
CEG       36 B 2 DK = OF 1144 I Bernabé, 56         195, 277       fr. 744 Page, 209         CIG II.1948, 92       fr. 871 Page, 209         DGE       IRENAEUS         792 Schwyzer = LSCGS 120       Adv. haer.         Sokolowski, 214       1.21.5, 119         Epigr. Gr.       ISOCRATES         312.13ff. Kaibel, 84       Bus.         Geist-Pfohl       28 (14 A 4 DK), 56         434, 106       JULIAN         435, 106       Or.	8 - TOTO 1 및 10 TOTO 1 (10 TOTO TOTO TOTO TOTO TOTO TOTO TOTO TO	
195, 277 CIG II.1948, 92 DGE TRENAEUS 792 Schwyzer = LSCGS 120 Sokolowski, 214 Epigr. Gr. 312.13ff. Kaibel, 84 Geist-Pfohl 433, 106 434, 106 435, 106  If. 744 Page, 209 fr. 871 Page, 209 IRENAEUS Adv. haer. 1.21.5, 119 ISOCRATES Bus. 28 (14 A 4 DK), 56  JULIAN Or.		
CIG II.1948, 92       fr. 871 Page, 209         DGE       IRENAEUS         792 Schwyzer = LSCGS 120       Adv. haer.         Sokolowski, 214       1.21.5, 119         Epigr. Gr.       ISOCRATES         312.13ff. Kaibel, 84       Bus.         Geist-Pfohl       28 (14 A 4 DK), 56         433, 106       JULIAN         435, 106       JULIAN         Or.		
DGE       IRENAEUS         792 Schwyzer = LSCGS 120       Adv. haer.         Sokolowski, 214       1.21.5, 119         Epigr. Gr.       ISOCRATES         312.13ff. Kaibel, 84       Bus.         Geist-Pfohl       28 (14 A 4 DK), 56         433, 106       JULIAN         435, 106       Or.		
792 Schwyzer = LSCGS 120		
Sokolowski, 214  Epigr. Gr. 312.13ff. Kaibel, 84  Geist-Pfohl 433, 106 434, 106 435, 106  ISOCRATES Bus. 28 (14 A 4 DK), 56  JULIAN Or.		1 N. 1 전에 열어 있다면 하게 해를 수 있다.
Epigr. Gr. ISOCRATES 312.13ff. Kaibel, 84  Geist-Pfohl 28 (14 A 4 DK), 56  433, 106 434, 106 435, 106  Or.		
312.13ff. Kaibel, 84  Geist-Pfohl  433, 106  434, 106  435, 106  DULIAN  Or.		To 12 (2004) 2 (10 (2007) T. J. L. S.
Geist-Pfohl 28 (14 A 4 DK), 56 433, 106 434, 106 435, 106 Or.		
433, 106 434, 106 435, 106 JULIAN <i>Or.</i>		
434, 106 435, 106 <i>Or.</i>		28 (14 A 4 DK), 56
435, 106 Or.	0.0300	
442, 106 7.25, 87		
	442, 106	7.25, 87

LACTANTIUS	6.1-11, 118
Div. inst.	6.4-11, 118
7.13, 268	6.10-13, 118
LUCIAN	6.23, 118
Ind.	6-8, 116
11 = OF 1052 Bernabé, 73	7.6, 118
Luct.	7.15-25, 118
19.16-20, 169	8.10, 117
25/10 201.105	8.15, 116
MACROBIUS	8.15f., 116
Sat.	8.16, 117
1.18.12 = OF 540.4 Bernabé, 92	8.29, 118
MARTIAL	12.1-2, 118
7.84, 298	14.7–8, 118
MIMNERMUS	14.7-6, 116 1 Thess.
fr. 2 West, 288	
II. 2 West, 200	5.23, 118 NONNUS
NEW TESTAMENT	Dion.
Acts	19.167–97, 83
17.28, 282	OLDIAN BONE TABLETS
1 Cor.	OLBIAN BONE TABLETS
15.12-57, 117	OF 463 Bernabé, 55
15.35-57, 118	OF 463–65 Bernabé, 215
15.42-55, 118	OF 464 Bernabé, <u>54</u>
15.47, 117	OLD TESTAMENT (LXX)
15.50, 118	Genesis
2 Cor.	2.7, 117
5.17, 117	2 Sam.
6.18, 104	7.8, 104
Gal.	ORAC. CHALD.
2.19-20, 118	148-49, 268
3.26-28, 104	149,
4.4-5, 117	ORIGEN
4.6, 116	C. Cels.
5.17, 118	6.31, 7.9, 119
6.15, 117	ORPH. $ARG$ .
Luke	IO-I, 53
6.23, 112, 114	12-35, 53
Matt.	35-40, 53
5.3-12, 114	40-42, 71
5.12, 114	40-46, 53
7.21-23, 112, 113	50-53, 1373-76 = OF 937 I-II Bernabé, 72
7.22, 115	OVID
Phil.	Fast.
1.21-26, 118	3.523-26, 83
2.6–11, 117	Met.
2.7, 117	11.50–60 = OF 1054 IV Bernabé, 73
2.7–11, 117	11.50 00 - 01 1054 17 Delliabe, [5]
	PAPYRI
3.10, 117	P. Anastasi II
3.20-21, 118 Rom.	6/6-7, 128
3.24–26, 117	P. Berlin 3022 = B, 158
4.25, 117	P. Berlin 3162, 135
<u>5.12</u> –21, 117	P. Berlin 10477, 135
5.18, 117	P. Berlin 10499 = R, <u>158</u>

PAPYRI (cont.)	col. XXII 7-16, 216
PBerol.	col. XXIII 2, 206
13426.16-19, 73	col. XXIII 5-6, 206
P. BM 9900, 142	col. XXVI 8-9, 206
P. BM 10002, 135	col. XXVI 9-12, 216
P. BM 10194, ll. 2-5, 155	P. Ebers 284-293, 158
P. BM 10470, 142	P. Gard. II, 155
12. 14.1 L. 12.1 L. 12.1 L. 13.1 T. 13.1 L. 14.1 B. 1	PGurob
P. BM 10730, ll. 4-7, 158	
P. Bologna 1094	col. I 4 = <i>OF</i> 578 Bernabé, 277, 288
2/5-7, 128	col. I 5, 91
P. Cairo 133 [= Papyrus of Her-Uben A], 136	col. I 10 = <i>OF</i> 578 Bernabé, 210
P. Cairo 531 & 40016 [= Papyrus Tashedkhonsu],	col. I 18, 92
136	col. I 20, 83
P. Cairo CG 58042 [= P. Boulaq 4],	col. I 22a, 92
17/4-17/6, 161	col. I 22a-b, 83
P. Cairo S. R. VII.10247 = Jd'É	col. I 23b, 92
339999, 136	col. I 25, 83
P. Cairo VII. 10223, 136	col. I 28, 78
P. Col. Aeg. 10207, 151	col. II 22, 78
P. Col. Aeg. 10207, 28/14, 145	P. Louvre 3074 (= Pc [Naville], 272
1950 P. 1950 J. 1960 J. 1960 J. 1960 P. 1960 P	이 어느님이 되었다. 이 경기를 살아가면서 아무리를 하면 수 있다면서 되었다면 하게 되었다면 하게 되었다.
P. Col. Aeg. 10207, 78/1–15, 143	P. Louvre 3081, col. 28, 135
P. Col. Aeg 10207, 78/7, 142	P. Louvre 3092, 163
P. Col. Aeg. 10207 [Saite],	P. Louvre 3279, 135
col. 32, 135	P. Louvre III, 93, 135
PDerveni	P. Louvre N. 3279, L-LII [= col. 4, 6-8], 160
col. II 4, 205	P. Louvre N. 3279, Il. XXX-XXXVI
col. III 7, 64	(= 3, I-6), I55
col. III 8 = OF 472	P. Louvre, Papyrus of Sutimes, 132
Bernabé, 80	P. MacGregor, 135
col. V 2-6, 268	P. Milan 1023, 135
col. V 4, 206	P. OIM 9787, CXIX/11, 143
col. V 6, 64	P. OIM 9787
col. V 9-11, 206	coll. 39-40, 41-48, 134
col. VI 4-5, 80	P. OIM 9787 [= P. Ryerson, 130
col. VI 5, 64	P. OIM 10486, 135
col. VI 8–9 = <i>OF</i> 471 Bernabé, 73	Papyrus of Neskhonsmes [= P. Kunsthistorisches
col. VI 9, 205	Museum, Vienna 3859], 135
col. VII 7, 66	Papyrus of Nesmin, 142
col. VII 9, 63	Papyrus of Nespakashuty [= P. Louvre
col. IX 2-3, 206	17401], 135
col. XII 3–5, 206	Papyrus of Nesytanebettaui [= P. Cairo
col. XIII $4 = OF 8$ Bernabé, 210	40017], 135
col. XIV 1–2, 210	P. Sallier I, 8/5, 158
col. XIV 6, 65	P Turin 1983 (= OAD T.1), II.
col. XV 5 = OF 10 II Bernabé, 88	36-43, 290
col. XVI 3-6, 65	PARMENIDES
col. XVII = OF 14 I Bernabé, 88	28 B 8.57 DK, 230
col. XVIII, 205	PAUSANIAS
col. XVIII–XIX, 90	1.2.5, 84
col. XIX 11, 156	2.2.6-7, 7.5-6, 215
col. XX 1 = <i>OF</i> 470 Bernabé, 55	2.20.4, 607
col. XX 1-3, 207	2.31.1, 191
	2.37.5, 319
COL X X 2 DO	6.27.12.2127
col. XX 3, 66	
col. XXI 3-4, 210 col. XXII, 88	2.37.5–6, 325 3.24.3–4, 317

SOCRATES OF ARGOS	SUPPLEMENTUM HELLENISTICUM
FGrH 310 F2, 327	980, 82
SOPHOCLES	SYRIANUS
El.	In Arist. Metaph.
895, 230	166.5 Kroll = <i>OF</i> 1100 x Bernabé, 56
Fragments (Radt)	183.1 Kroll = <i>OF</i> 1100 1X Bernabé, 56
837, 210	
959, 209	TABL. HERACL.
Fragments (TGF)	L103, 295
753, 305	TESTAMENT OF ORPHEUS
OT	OF <u>378.41</u> Bernabé, 237
1080, 107	THEOCRITUS
STELAE	Id.
S. Berlin 2118, 135	11.19-20, 321
S. BM 1027 (formerly 147), ll. 17-19, 160	11.36, 63–66, 321
S. Cairo 22136, Demotic text, ll. 6-8, 161	THEOGNIS
S. Cairo 22136 (Ptolemaic period?), 135	425ff., 289
S. Cairo 31120, 135	THEOPHRASTUS
S. Cairo 31120, Demotic inscription above	Char.
scene, ll. 2-3, 161	16 = OF 654 Bernabé, 55
S. Leiden V55, 159	Hist, pl.
STEPHANOS BYZANTIUS	3.3.4, 192
Ethnica	THEOPOMPUS
s.v. Σάτρα (557 Meineke), 192	FGrH 115 F 277, 317
STESICHORUS	THUCYDIDES
fr. 234 PMG, 323	2.8.2, 266
SUDA	210123
s.v. Θεανώ (Θ 83 Adler <i>OF</i> 1100 XIII	VERGIL
Bernabé), 56	G.
s.v. Λύσιοι τελεταί (Λ 867 Adler) = Heracleid.	4.523–27 = <i>OF</i> 1054 III Bernabé, <u>73</u>
Pont. fr. 155 Wehrli, 209	THE POLICE
s.v. Όρφεύς (Ο 654 Adler) = <i>OF</i> 1018 IV	XENARCHUS
Bernabé, <u>54</u> , 56	fr. 5 KA, 83
s.v. Όρφεύς (O 654 Adler) = OF 870, 937 VII	XENOPHANES
Bernabé, <u>71</u>	21 B 7 DK, 56
s.v. Ποίθιοι (Π 3078 Adler), 260	XENOPHON
s.v. Πυθαγόρας (Π 3120 Adler = <i>OF</i> 1100 XII	Hell.
Bernabé), 56	3.3.3, 266