MARY ELLEN WAITHE / EDITOR

A History of Women Philosophers

Volume 1 / 600 BC - 500 AD

Distributors

for the United States and Canada: Kluwer Academic Publishers, P.O. Box 358, Accord Station, Hingham, MA 02018-0358, USA
for the UK and Ireland: Kluwer Academic Publishers, MTP Press Limited, Falcon House, Queen Square, Lancaster LA1 1RN, UK
for all other countries: Kluwer Academic Publishers Group, Distribution Center, P.O. Box 322, 3300 AH Dordrecht, The Netherlands

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Ancient women philosophers, 600 B.C.-500 A.D.
(A History of women philosophers ; v. 1)
Bibliography: p.
Includes index.
1. Women philosophers. 2. Philosophy, Ancient.
I. Waithe, Mary Ellen. II. Series.
B105.W6A53 1986 180'.88042 86-8675

ISBN 90-247-3348-0 (Hardback)
ISBN 90-247-3368-5 (Paperback)

Copyright

© 1987 by Martinus Nijhoff Publishers, Dordrecht.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without the prior written permission of the publishers,
Martinus Nijhoff Publishers, P.O. Box 163, 3300 AD Dordrecht, The Netherlands.

PRINTED IN THE NETHERLANDS

Contents

Introduction to the Series IX

I. Creating the Project on the History of Women in Philosophy; II. Criteria for Selection of Women Philosophers; III. Research Methods and Materials

Acknowledgements XXIII

Chronological Table 1

Introduction to Volume 1 5

1. Early Pythagoreans: Themistoclea, Theano, Arignote, Myia, and Damo, *by Mary Ellen Waithe* 11

I. Themistoclea, Arignote, and Damo; II. Theano of Crotona; III. Myia; Notes.

2. Late Pythagoreans: Aesara of Lucania, Phintys of Sparta, and Perictione I, *by Mary Ellen Waithe, with translations and additional commentary by Vicki Lynn Harper* 19

I. Aesara of Lucania: (1) Text of *On Human Nature*, (2) The Nature of Law and Justice, (3) Aesara on Moral Psychology, (4) Aesara and Physical Medicine, (5) A Note about Feminism, (6) The Principled Structure of the Soul; II. Phintys of Sparta: (1) Text of *On the Moderation of Women*, Fragment I, (2) Women and Virtue, (3) Women and Justice in the Home, (4) Phintys' *On the Moderation of Women*, Fragment II, (5) Women and Religious Observances; III. Perictione I: (1) Translation of the Text, (2) Relationships and Moral Obligation, (3) Moral Pragmatism and Faithful Wives, (4) Physical Beauty and the Moral Disorder of Women, (5) Virtue, Power, Class and Oppression, (6) Idealism versus Pragmatism; Comments by Vicki Lynn Harper, (7) Women and Piety, (8) Translation of the Text; Notes.

Material com direitos autorais

3. Late Pythagoreans: Theano II, and Perictione II, *by Mary Ellen Waithe, with translations and additional commentary by Vicki Lynn Harper*. 41

I. Theano II: (1) Theano II to Euboule, (2) Theano II to Nikostrate, (3) Theano to Kallisto; Commentary by Vicki Lynn Harper, (4) Spurious Texts; II. Perictione II: (1) Text of *Sophias*, (2) Wisdom and Morality; Notes.

4. Authenticating the Fragments and Letters, *by Mary Ellen Waithe, with additional commentary by Vicki Lynn Harper* 59

I. The Forgery Hypothesis: (1) In Favor of the Forgery Hypothesis, (2) Consequences of the Forgery Hypothesis; II. The Pseudonymy Hypothesis: (1) Consequences of the Pseudonymy Hypothesis: The "Female Authority" View, (2) Consequences of the Pseudonymy Hypothesis: The Dissident Archytan View; III. The Eponymy Hypothesis: (1) The Problem with Names, (2) The Doric Language, (3) Perictione I's Ionic Prose, (4) Phintys' *On the Moderation of Women*, (5) Aesara of Lucania's *On Human Nature*; Summary; Notes.

5. Aspasia of Miletus, *by Mary Ellen Waithe* 75

I. Background; II. The *Menexenus* and Pericles' Funeral Oration; III. Two arguments about the *Menexenus*; IV. Aspasia and Sophistic Rhetoric; Conclusions; Notes.

6. Diotima of Mantinea, *by Mary Ellen Waithe* 83

I. Distinguishing Diotima from Plato and Socrates: (1) Diotima's Concept of Beauty, (2) Diotima's Concept of Immortality, (3) The Independence of *Eros* from Reason, (4) Summary; II. The Tradition of Diotima as a Fictitious Character: (1) The "Plato is Feminizing Philosophy" Argument, (2) The "Socratic Wit" Argument, (3) The "Plato as Novelist" Argument, (4) The "No Ancient Evidence" Argument, (5) Objections to Arguments; III. The historical Diotima: (1) Evidence from Plato, (2) The Archeological Evidence, (3) The Written Testimony, (4) Two Modern Opinions on the Historicity of Diotima; IV. In Support of Thesis B: (1) Immortality, Transmigration, and Personal Identity, (2) *Eros* and Reason, (3) The Idea of Beauty, (4) Summary; Notes.

7. Julia Domna, *by Beatrice H. Zedler*. 117

I. Julia Domna's Biography; II. "The Philosopher Julia": (A) Who were the Members of Julia's Circle?, (B) Who were the Sophists?, (C) What Philosophy did Julia study?, (D) What Philosophy did Julia herself seem to Favor?; III. Conclusion; Notes.

8. Makrina, *by Cornelia Wolfskeel* 139

I. Biography; II. Makrina and the Spiritual Tradition: (1) The Unity and Immortality of the Soul, (2) Ascetism, (3) Gnosticism, (4) Gnosticism, Christianity, and the Inferiority of Women; III. Makrina and Woman's Soul: (1) Makrina on the Soul and the πάθη (Pathe), (2) The Traditional Views of Women's Souls, (3) Mary, the Mother of Christ in Patristic Literature, (4) Woman and Anthropomorphic Thinking about God; IV. Makrina on Creation, Reincarnation, and Resurrection: (1) Makrina and the Plotinian Tradition, (2) Makrina and the Porphyryian View, (3) Makrina and the Tradition of Philo of Alexandria, (4) Makrina and the Reincarnation Doctrines; Notes.

9. Hypatia of Alexandria, *by Mary Ellen Waithe* 169

I. Biography; II. Teaching; III. Works: (1) Commentary on Diophantus' *Arithmeticorum*, (2) Commentary to Book III of Ptolemy's *Syntaxis Mathematica*, (3) Other Works; Summary; Notes.

10. Arete, Asclepigenia, Axiothea, Cleobulina, Hipparchia, and Lasthenia, *by Mary Ellen Waithe* 197

I. Arete of Cyrene: (1) Pain and Pleasure, (2) Virtue and Hedonism, (3) Hedonistic Moral Psychology; II. Asclepigenia of Athens: (1) Background, (2) Metaphysics and Magic, (3) Plotinus, Plutarch, Proclus; III. Axiothea of Philesia; IV. Cleobulina of Rhodes; V. Hipparchia the Cynic; VI. Lathenia of Mantinea; Notes.

Bibliography 211

Index. 223

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

CHRONOLOGY OF ANCIENT WOMEN PHILOSOPHERS

600 500 400 300 200 B.C. 100

Themistoclea

Theano of Crotona

Diotima of Mantinea

Axiothea of Philasia

Damo

Aspasia of Miletus

Arignote

Aesara of Lucania

Theano II

Perictione II

?

Myia

Hipparchia

Cleobulina of Rhodes

Lasthenia of Mantinea

Arete of Cyrene

Phintys of Sparta

Perictione I

?

Pythagoras Socrates Plato Epicurus Didymus Cicero

Euclides Crates Aristotle Occellus

Aristippus

AND THEIR MALE CONTEMPORARIES

A.D. 100	200	300	400	500
Julia Domna		Makrina		
			Asclepigenia of Athens	
			Hypatia of Alexandria	
Antipater Numenius	Porphyry Plotinus	Plutarch Iamblichus	Proclus Themistius	
		Philostratus		

Introduction to Volume 1

MARY ELLEN WAITHE

If we trace the history of philosophy to Hesiod, we know that philosophy, at least in its written form, was engaging men since at least the 8th century, B.C. Verbal philosophizing no doubt predates Hesiod, but without a record of that oral history, we do now know by how much. There is a record that Pythagoras received his aesthetic principles from a woman priestess-philosopher, Themistoclea, but there are no further details to be found about her. Theano of Crotona, wife of Pythagoras of Samos, was from an aristocratic, Orphic family. There is a document attributed to her, in which she discusses Pythagorean metaphysics, and there are records of her apothegems from which we can sketch her views on marriage, sex, women, and ethics. Little more is known about Theano, except that her daughters Damo, Myia and Arignote were also reputed to be among the original Pythagorean philosophers. Other women, including Phintys of Sparta, Aesara of Lucania, Perictione, Perictione II and Theano II were Pythagoreans, but they lived several centuries after the members of the original Pythagorean community.

The recent philosophic tradition has assumed that Diotima was not a historical person who held the dialogue with Socrates on the nature of erotic love that is reported in Plato's *Symposium*. This Platonic dialogue, however, has long puzzled Plato scholars because several of the views that are attributed to Diotima appear not to be consistent with Plato's own views. We introduce the textual and archeological evidence for a view that challenges traditional claims concerning Diotima's historicity, and trace the origins of the suggestion that Diotima was not a historical person to a 15th century humanist.

A History of Women Philosophers / Volume 1, ed. by Mary Ellen Waithe
©Martinus Nijhoff Publishers, Dordrecht – Printed in the Netherlands

The two surviving fragments from Phintys' *On the Moderation of Women* reflect the Pythagorean assumption that there are some essential differences between men's and women's natures. Phintys notes that although some virtues are common to both (courage, justice, and wisdom) temperance or moderation is more common to women. She acknowledges that the limitations on women's social roles reflect an understanding of the nature of women's souls. Thus, the normative principle of *harmonia* is to be satisfied within the context of the specific social roles permitted women.

The surviving fragment from Aesara of Lucania's *Book on Human Nature* presents a natural law theory which claims that through introspection into the nature and structure of the human soul we can discover the natural philosophical foundations for all of human law, including the technical structure of moral law and positive law. Her natural law theory concerns three applications of the moral law: individual, private morality, the moral basis of familial institutions, and the moral basis of social institutions.

Although two fragments from *On the Harmony of Women* and a fragment *On Wisdom* are both identified as authored by a woman named Perictione, it does not appear that both ought to be attributed to the same Perictione. And, although Plato's mother was named Perictione, we cannot know with confidence whether either author is Plato's mother. The fragments from *On the Harmony of Women* constitute an application of the normative principle of *harmonia* to the harsh realities of women's social roles. They give a realistic assessment of how a woman, faced with the fact that her freedom of action is limited by society, can fulfill her duty to act virtuously. The fragment *On Wisdom* provides a teleological analysis of the nature and purpose of philosophy, and distinguishes philosophy from other theoretical disciplines.

Two writings survive of Theano II: they are letters to Euboule, and to Nikostrate, both preserved by Theodoret in his *De Vita Pythagoras*. In her letter to Euboule, Theano II explains that because young children are unable to understand how to apply the principle of *harmonia*, they must be guided and disciplined. Theano II's assumption that the responsibility for this rests with the mother because it is woman's special virtue to be able to create justice and harmony in the home, is consistent with the views of womens' place expressed by Phintys and Perictione. The special

virtue of women obligates them also to behave justly towards their husbands, even when husbands treat them unjustly. This view is expressed in Theano II's letter to Nikostrate, and has its roots in her views of women's responsibility for maintaining harmony in a marriage. She notes that compounding one injustice with another is not the way to restore order and harmony, but the way to create further discord. Only by acting honorably and justly, can the woman demonstrate her moral superiority to the man and thereby set the example for him to emulate.

Successor to the school of philosophy originally founded by her father Aristippus, Arete of Cyrene headed the Cyrenaic school of hedonistic philosophy following his death. Since her father was present at Socrates' death, we may assume that Arete was a contemporary of Plato. This school of philosophy held that the most important human intellectual enterprise was the search for happiness. They rejected the scientific disciplines as irrelevant to that search. The sole criterion of morality was present experience of pleasure, a moral principle defended on both empirical and epistemological grounds. Philosophers were uniquely suited to the pursuit of pleasure because they were better suited to exercizing rational control of that pursuit. The hedonistic ethics which Arete and the other early Cyrenaics promoted was a philosophic hedonism, and not merely an advocacy of profligate living.

Known throughout the Later Roman Empire as "The Philosopher Julia," this Roman Empress of the Severan dynasty devoted herself to the study of philosophy and sponsored a philosophical circle consisting of mathematicians, sophists, lawyers, physicians, historians, and other learned academicians. She is best known as a proponent of "the second sophistic," a school of philosophical rhetoric devoted to discussions of the philosophic treatment of subjects like justice, cosmology, as well as to discussions of neo-Pythagorean and neo-Platonic philosophies.

Makrina lived in Neocaesarea in the 4th century, A.D. Her deathbed discussion with her brother, Gregory, Bishop of Nyssa, on the nature of the soul was recorded by him in the dialogue *De Anima et Resurrectione* shortly following her death. Makrina came from a family in which both men and women were intellectuals, and was educated by her mother. A student of Greek philosophy, Makrina was also a Christian, and extremely knowl-

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

Asclepigenia of Athens was a younger contemporary of Hypatia, but while Hypatia applied her knowledge of Platonic and Aristotelian philosophy to the great mathematical and scientific questions of her day, Asclepigenia applied her knowledge of Plato and Aristotle to the great religious and metaphysical questions raised by Christian ethical theory. The pagan philosophers sought to understand the mysteries of the cosmos and to intervene with the gods to change human fate. Christianity on the other hand represented an acceptance, even a welcoming of tragedy and fate in this life and promised salvation and consolation in the next. It was in this context that the philosophy taught by Asclepigenia sought the greatest good. Pagan philosophers like Asclepigenia reacted to dissatisfaction with life's fates by understanding and mastering the "secret" principles of metaphysics which controlled the universe and applying magical and theurgic principles to affect those fates. Thus Asclepigenia stood in marked contrast to the philosophers of the Alexandrinian school of Hypatia who sought the Absolute through mastery of metaphysics, cosmology, mathematics, and science. The philosophers of the Athenian school, and in particular, Asclepigenia's pupil Proclus, sought the Absolute through contemplation of the mysteries of metaphysics, cosmology, mysticism, magic, and theurgy.

1. Early Pythagoreans: Themistoclea, Theano, Arignote, Myia, and Damo

MARY ELLEN WAITHE

Pythagoreanism represented an active and popular school of philosophy from the end of the 6th century B.C. through the 2nd or 3rd centuries A.D. The original or "early" Pythagoreans included the immediate members of his family and other successors who headed Pythagorean societies or cults in parts of Greece and southern Italy. Early Pythagoreans are to be distinguished from "late" Pythagoreans of the 4th and 3rd centuries B.C. and from the "neo Pythagoreans" of the 1st century B.C. through perhaps the 3rd century A.D. The early Pythagoreans included Themistoclea, Theano, Arignote, Myia and Damo. With the possible exception of Themistoclea, these women were members of Pythagoras' family. Late Pythagoreans, including Phintys, Aesara of Lucania, Perictione, (possibly) Perictione II, and Theano II can better be described as philosophers in the Pythagorean tradition. They probably lived *circa* 4th-2nd centuries B.C.[1]

I. THEMISTOCLEA, ARIGNOTE, AND DAMO

The ancient sources indicate that women were active in early Pythagorean societies and may have played a central role in the development of early Pythagorean philosophy. Diogenes Laertius[2] reports that:

> Aristonexus asserts that Pythagoras derived the greater part of his ethical doctrines from Themistoclea, the priestess at Delphi.

A History of Women Philosophers / Volume 1, ed. by Mary Ellen Waithe
©Martinus Nijhoff Publishers. Dordrecht – Printed in the Netherlands

Early Pythagoreans viewed the cosmos or universe as orderly and harmonious. Everything bears a particular mathematical relationship to everything else. Harmony and order exist when things are in their proper relationship to each other. This relationship can be expressed as a mathematical proportion. One of the "sacred discourses" is attributed to Pythagoras' daughter, Arignote.[3] According to Arignote:[4]

> ... the eternal essence of number is the most providential cause of the whole heaven, earth and the region in between. Likewise it is the root of the continued existence of the gods and daimones, as well as that of divine men.

Arignote's comment is consistent with one attributed to her mother, Theano of Crotona in that all that exists, all that is real can be distinguished from other things through enumeration. The eternal essence of number is also directly related to the harmonious coexistence of different things. This harmony can be expressed as a mathematical relationship. In these two ways, number is the cause of all things: without it we could not enumerate, delineate, and distinguish among things, and it expresses the orderly relationships among things.

II. THEANO OF CROTONA

Theano was the daugther of Brontinus, a Crotona orphic and aristocrat. She first became the pupil of Pythagoras of Samos, and later his wife. In a document attributed to a larger work by her, *On Piety*,[5] she alludes to the metaphysical concepts of imitation and participation. The text is translated by Vicki Lynn Harper:[6]

> I have learned that many of the Greeks believe Pythagoras said all things are generated from number. The very assertion poses a difficulty: How can things which do not exist even be conceived to generate? But he did not say that all things come to be from number; rather, in accordance with number – on the grounds that order in the primary sense is in number and it is by participation in order that a first and a second

> and the rest sequentially are assigned to things which are counted.

Theano is saying that when we ask what is the nature of an object, we can reply either by drawing an analogy between that object and something else, or we can define the object. According to her, Pythagoras meant to express an analogy between things and numbers. This is the concept of imitation: things are like numbers. By its participation in the universe of order and harmony, an object, whether corporeal or not, can be sequenced with all other objects and can be counted. Things can be counted in accordance with number, the primary sense of which is ordering.

The document attributed to Theano of Crotona appears to have been unknown to Aristotle who said that the Pythagoreans:[7]

> ... construct natural bodies out of numbers, things that have lightness and weight out of things that have not weight or lightness...

If we read Theano's "things" to mean "corporeal, or physical objects," as I think we must, given her use of the term "generate," she is claiming only that corporeal things do not come into existence from number itself because number is non-corporeal. Rather, it is number that enables us to distinguish one thing from another. By enumerating things as first, second, etc., we tacitly claim to be able to specify the physical parameters of the thing: it begins here, it ends there, and between the beginning and the end is one object. Thus in enumerating we also delineate objects. We can tell that something is an object because we can count it.

An apothegem attributed to Theano concerns two well-known Pythagorean doctrines: the immortality of souls, and the transmigration of souls. Theano confirms that the Pythagoreans believed in "divine justice" in the afterlife and in the transmigration of souls after death into a new body which was not necessarily human. From this apothegem, we get a picture of a process of transmigration through which harmony can be restored to the universe when a person has disrupted that harmony by violating the moral law during their lifetime. Theano connects morality with cosmology by showing why there should be no doubt about the immortality of the soul:[8]

> If the soul is not immortal, then life is truly a feast for evil-doers who die after having lived their lives so iniquitously.

In a principled, harmonious universe, everything has its own place and performs its own functions according to some law: the laws of physics, of logic, or of morality and religion. Evil or immoral actions are contrary to law, and contribute to disorder and discord. According to Theano, if the soul is not immortal, then those who contribute to disorder not only get a kind of free ride throughout life at the expense of those whom they have wronged, but they also disrupt the orderliness of the universe. If balance and harmony in the universe is to be restored, souls must be immortal. Then the immoral can restore order by accepting the punishment of being reborn as something less than a human being and by living that later life as required by the moral law.

Stobeaus quotes several apothegems by Theano which reveal Pythagorean attitudes toward women. A wife's sexual activity is to be restricted to pleasing her husband – she is not to have other lovers. In the context of marriage, chastity and virtue are not identified with abstinence. When Theano was asked how many days following sexual intercourse are required for a woman to once again be considered "pure," her reply was that if the activity was with the woman's own husband, she remains pure, but if it was with someone else, she can never again become pure.[9] When asked what duties are incumbent upon a married woman, her response is "to please her husband."[10] Theano viewed romantic love as nothing more than "the natural inclination of an empty soul."[11] These quotes can perhaps best be understood in the light of the writings of the later Pythagorean philosophers, Phintys, Theano II, Perictione, Aesara of Lucania and Perictione II. From their writings we see that Pythagorean doctrines are to be applied to personal and to family life. Women, whose special virtue is temperance, bear the responsibility for maintaining law and justice (or harmony) within the home. According to Aesara of Lucania[12] the home is a microcosm of the state. Consequently women bear a large responsibility for creating the conditions under which harmony and order, and law and justice can exist in the state. A woman who doesn't understand this is likely to contribute to

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

> to their free-born station – provided, of course, that she has enough milk to nourish a child, and is not easily overcome by her husband's entreaties to share his bed. A nurse has a great part in this which is first and prefatory to a child's whole life, i.e., nurturing with a view to raising the child well. For she will do all things well at the appropriate time. Let her offer the nipple and breast and nourishment, not on the spur of the moment, but according to due consideration. Thus will she guide the baby to health. She should not give in whenever she herself wishes to sleep, but when the newborn desires to rest; she will be no small comfort to the child. Let her not be irascible or loquacious or indiscriminate in the taking of food, but orderly and temperate and – if at all possible – not foreign but Greek. It is best to put the newborn to sleep when it has been suitably filled with milk, for then rest is sweet to the young, and such nourishment is easy to digest. If there is any other nourishment, one must give food that is as plain as possible. Hold off altogether from wine, because of its strong effect, or add it sparingly in a mixture to the evening milk. Don't continually give the child baths. A practice of infrequent baths, at a mild temperature, is better. In addition, the air should have a suitable balance of heat and cold, and the house should not be too drafty or too closed in. The water should be neither hard nor soft, and the bedclothes should be not rough but falling agreeably on the skin. In all these things nature yearns for what is fitting, not what is extravagant. These are the things it seems useful to write to you for the present: my hopes based on nursing according to plan. With the help of god, we shall provide feasible and fitting reminders concerning the child's upbringing again at a later time.

The reader may be impressed, as I was, at the extent to which this advice of temperance is carried out by Myia herself: she ends the letter with the statement that "these are the things it seems useful to write to you for the present..." There is moderation even in the giving of advice, for she promises more later on, when it will be "fitting" to remind Phyllis of other details of harmonious childrearing! This closing statement summarizes what it is that the

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

2. Late Pythagoreans: Aesata of Lucania, Phintys of Sparta, and Perictione I

MARY ELLEN WAITHE
with translations and additional commentary by
VICKI LYNN HARPER

Aesara of Lucania, Phintys of Sparta and Perictione I can be distinguished from the early Pythagorean women who were members of Pythagoras' family and the original Pythagorean cults. The late Pythagoreans probably lived no earlier than *circa* 425 B.C. and some possibly as late as *circa* 100 A.D.

I. AESARA OF LUCANIA

Only a fragment survives of Aesara of Lucania's *Book on Human Nature*, but it provides a key to understanding the philosophies of Phintys, Perictione and Theano II as well. Aesara presents a familiar and intuitive natural law theory. She says that through the activity of introspection into our own nature – specifically the nature of a human soul – we can discover not only the natural philosophic foundation for all of human law, but we can also discern the technical structure of morality, positive law, and, it may be inferred, the laws of moral psychology and of physical medicine. Aesara's natural law theory concerns laws governing three applications of moral law: individual or private morality, laws governing the moral basis of the institution of the family, and, laws governing the moral foundations of social institutions. By analyzing the nature of the soul, Aesara says, we will understand the nature of law and of justice at the individual, familial, and social levels.

A History of Women Philosophers / Volume 1, ed. by Mary Ellen Waithe
©Martinus Nijhoff Publishers, Dordrecht – Printed in the Netherlands

20 *Late Pythagoreans:*

1. *Text of* On Human Nature[1]

From *On Human Nature* by Aesara,* Pythagorean of Lucania:

> Human nature seems to me to provide a standard of law and justice both for the home and for the city. By following the tracks within himself whoever seeks will make a discovery: law is in him and justice, which is the orderly arrangement of the soul. Being threefold, it is organized in accordance with triple functions: that which effects judgment and thoughtfulness is [the mind]**, that which effects strength and ability is [high spirit],*** and that which effects love and kindliness is desire. These are all so disposed relatively to one another that the best part is in command, the most inferior is governed, and the one in between holds a middle place; it both governs and is governed.
>
> God thus contrived these things according to principle in both the outline and completion of the human dwelling place, because he intended man alone to become a recipient of law and justice, and none other of mortal animals. A composite unity of association could not come about from a single thing, nor indeed from several which are all alike. (For it is necessary, since the things to be done are different, that the parts of the soul also be different, just as in the case of the body [the organs of touch and]**** sight and hearing and taste and smell differ, for these do not all have the same affinity with everything.)
>
> Nor could such a unity come from several dissimilar things at random, but rather, from parts formed in accordance with the completion and organization and fitting together of the entire composite whole. Not only is the soul composed from several dissimilar parts, these being fashioned in conformity with the whole and complete, but in addition these are not arranged haphazardly and at random, but in accordance with rational attention.

* Αἰσάρας FP., Ἀρεσᾶ Th., Ἀρέσα Heeren.
** ὁ νόος add. Heeren.
*** ἁ θύμωσις add. Heeren.
**** ἄψιος ὄργανα καὶ add. Wachsmuth.

> For if they had an equal share of power and honor, though being themselves unequal – some inferior, some better, some in between – the association of parts throughout the soul could not have been fitted together. Or, even if they did have an unequal share, but the worse rather than the better had the greater share, there would be great folly and disorder in the soul. And even if the better had the greater and the worse the lesser, but each of these not in the proper proportion, there could not be unanimity and friendship and justice throughout the soul, since when each one is arranged in accordance with the suitable proportion, this sort of arrangement I assert to be justice.
>
> And indeed, a certain unanimity and agreement in sentiment accompanies such an arrangement. This sort would justly be called good order, whichever, due to the better part's ruling and the inferior's being ruled, should add the strength of virtue to itself. Friendship and love and kindliness, cognate and kindred, will sprout from these parts. For closely-inspecting mind persuades, desire loves, and high spirit is filled with strength; once seething with hatred, it becomes friendly to desire.
>
> Mind having fitted the pleasant together with the painful, mingling also the tense and robust with the slight and relaxed portion of the soul, each part is distributed in accordance with its kindred and suitable concern for each thing: mind closely inspecting and tracking out things, high spirit adding impetuosity and strength to what is closely inspected, and desire, being akin to affection, adapts to the mind, preserving the pleasant as its own and giving up the thoughtful to the thoughtful part of the soul. By virtue of these things the best life for man seems to me to be whenever the pleasant should be mixed with the earnest, and pleasure with virtue. Mind is able to fit these things to itself, becoming lovely through systematic education and virtue.

Aesara's soul is tripartite in structure. Its three parts are the mind, spiritedness, and desire. The mind affects judgment and thoughtfulness. Here, "thoughtfulness" should be understood in the purely analytic sense, not the affective sense. Spiritedness affects

strength and ability. Desire affects love and "kindliness." These three parts form a "composite unity of association." God intends the three parts of the soul to function together according to a rational principle, the principle of appropriate proportion. The appropriateness of the proportion of one part of the soul to another depends upon what the task at hand is, i.e., upon what Aesara calls the different things to be done. As such, the principle is not only mathematical, rational, and divine, but also functional.

2. *The Nature of Law and Justice*

What can we infer about the nature and structure of law and of justice from Aesara's analysis of the nature and structure of the soul? First, we can infer that both law and justice are products of a rational, mathematical, divine, and functional principle – that of appropriate proportion. Second, both law and justice are structurally tripartite, corresponding to the structure of the human soul. Aesara's first claim, that the principle characterizes both the structure of the soul and the nature of law and justice, is a simple one. No one of the three parts of the soul, or of law and justice dominate. For example, depending upon the nature or purpose of the law, it might invoke a weakened version of the principle upon which it is based. This occurs when considerations of the other component parts of law, namely, ability of enforcement, or the many special needs of individuals, are taken into account. Were the law informed by a principle that required it to ignore these other component parts of law, much social discord could result. According to Aesara, the principle of appropriate proportion supercedes any particular legal principle. Consider as an example the competing principles behind a "flat tax" law and an "itemized deduction" tax law. The flat tax law would be based on the principle that all should bear equally the cost of governing. The itemized deduction law is based on the principle that the law should take the special needs of individuals into account when assessing how individuals should bear the cost of government. Aesara's meta-principle, the principle of appropriate proportion, would require that we establish our tax system on whatever principle would in the long run produce the least social discord.

Aesara's second claim is that both law and justice are structural-

ly tripartite and that this structure corresponds to the structure of the human soul. Law and justice, like the mind, are thoughtful in that good law and real justice take all relevant ideas, arguments, and principles into account. Moreover, good law, and particularly, true justice are judgmental: they make decisions about matters of fact and questions of obligation and duty. These thoughtful and judgmental characteristics of law and justice correspond to the operations of Aesara's rational mind.

The strength and effectiveness of law and of the judicial system, as well as of familial rules and discipline, and personal principles and conscience, all correspond to the spirited part of Aesara's soul. Law can be a powerful deterrent and incentive. It can be powerful as an expression of the harmony and stability, the virtues and values of the individual, the family, and of the city. Law and justice, like the spirited part of the soul, are able and effective: they do in fact deter, they do in fact provide incentives, and they do in fact serve as guides to action. Law and justice stand for the values and virtues of the person, the family, and the city.

The social law, the familial law, and the personal moral law are all characterized by love, whether in the form of compassion for others, kindliness, or self-esteem. This love is analogous to that produced by the third part of Aesara's soul, desire. This affective component of law and justice is fair and is considerate of special needs and concerns. Justice is compassionate and forgiving; it is individualistic in the sense that it can take into account extenuating circumstances and reasons for non-compliance. Similarly, the harmonious family, one characterized by "a certain unanimity and agreement in sentiment" is one that is fair and considerate of the special needs of its members and is compassionate and forgiving. At the personal level, the individual who is not schizophrenic is also characterized by "a certain unanimity and agreement in sentiment." Such a person sets moral standards for herself that are in proportion to her actual abilities. She is reasonably self-forgiving and is non-obsessive about her own moral shortcomings. The social law, the familial law, and the personal moral law are all characterized by love, whether in the form of compassion for others or self-esteem, and this love is like that produced by the third part of the soul, desire.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

than others. It is not clear whether Aesara means this in the moral sense that the better part of the soul produces morally superior outcomes of deliberation, or whether she means this in the purely pragmatic sense that the better part of the soul is better suited to the functions of the soul itself. Nevertheless, the principle arranges the parts so that the best part rules. Which part is the "best part" is determined by "the things that are to be done." Different parts of the soul are best suited to different tasks. If each part of the soul had an equal "say" we would be constantly torn between acting rationally, acting on impulse, and desire-satisfaction. We would be in a constant state of unharmonious, tumultuous schizophrenia. The mind has the ability to harmonize itself with the other parts so that impulse and desire are appropriately satisfied. The mind learns to do this through experience and through the exercise of virtue which is the pursuit of the soul's own excellence.

II. PHINTYS OF SPARTA

According to Stobaeus,[2] Phintys is the daughter of Kallicrates, and is a Pythagorean. The name Kallicrates is unknown, and Thesleff[3] prefers reading "Kallikratidas." Thucydides mentions Kallikratidas, as does Plutarch.[4] Kallikratidas was an admiral who died during the battle of the Arginusae in 406 B.C. It is only the identification of Phintys as the daughter of this admiral that permits us to identify her as of Spartan nationality, and as a somewhat older contemporary of Plato. Two fragments from her book *On the Moderation of Women* have survived. These fragments incorporate the Pythagorean assumption that the natures of men and women, although having much in common, are in some essential ways, different.

1. *Text of* On the Moderation of Women, *Fragment I*[5]

> A woman must be altogether good and orderly; without excellence she would never become so. The excellence appropriate to each thing makes superior that which is receptive of it: the excellence appropriate to the eyes makes the eyes so, that appropriate to hearing, the faculty of

hearing, that appropriate to a horse, a horse, that appropriate to a man, a man. So too the excellence appropriate to a woman makes a woman excellent. The excellence most appropriate to a woman is moderation. For, on account of this virtue, she will be able to honor and love her husband.

Now, perhaps many think it is not fitting for a woman to philosophize, just as it is not fitting for her to ride horses or speak in public. But I think that some things are peculiar to a man, some to a woman, some are common to both, some belong more to a man than a woman, some more to a woman than a man. Peculiar to a man are serving in battle, political activity, and public speaking; peculiar to a woman are staying at home and indoors, and welcoming and serving her husband. But I say that courage and justice and wisdom are common to both. Excellences of the body are appropriate for both a man and a woman, likewise those of the soul. And just as it is beneficial for the body of each to be healthy, so too, it is beneficial for the soul to be healthy. The excellences of the body are health, strength, keenness of perception and beauty. Some of these are more fitting for a man to cultivate and possess, some more for a woman. For courage and wisdom are more appropriate for a man, both because of the constitution of his body and because of his strength of soul, while moderation is more appropriate for a woman.

Wherefore one must discover the nature of the woman who is trained in moderation, and make known the number and kinds of things that confer this good upon a woman. I say this comes from five things: First, from piety and reverence concerning her marriage bed; second, from decency with respect to her body; third, from the processions of those from her own household; fourth, from not indulging in mystery rites and celebrations of the festival of Cybele; fifth, from being devout and correct in her sacrifices to the divine.

Of these, that which most of all causes and preserves moderation is being incorruptible with respect to her marriage, and not getting mixed up with a strange man. For, first, a woman who thus transgresses does an injustice to the gods of her race, providing not genuine, but spurious, allies to her

house and family; she does an injustice to the natural gods by whom she swore, along with her ancestors and kin, to share in a common life and the lawful procreation of children. She also does an injustice to her fatherland, by not abiding among those who were duly appointed for her. Then she is wont to sin over and above those for whom death, the greatest of penalties, is determined, on account of the magnitude of injustice; to sin and to commit outrages for the sake of pleasure is unlawful and least deserving of mercy. The issue of all outrage is destruction.

2. *Women and Virtue*

According to Phintys, some virtues are common to both men and women, while some are unique to either gender. Courage, justice and wisdom are common virtues or excellences to both men and women, although in her opinion, courage and wisdom are "more appropriate" to men than to women. It is not clear what Phintys means by this. Perhaps by "more appropriate" she means "suits the kinds of activities men typically engage in." Phintys claims that temperance or moderation is more appropriately a woman's virtue. If by "more appropriate" she means "suits the kinds of activities women typically engage in," it is not difficult, given even a meagre acquaintance with women's history, to see what she is saying. Phintys shows why, for women, doing moral philosophy the way men do it – theorizing about what some ideal state or perfect world might be like – requires that women ignore the realities of their social situation. *Given* that the social order already *is* the way it is, she raises the question whether it is our moral responsibility to live our lives according to whichever moral theory best takes into account our special circumstances. Phintys says that given the kind of public life men lead in the marketplace and the seat of government, courage and wisdom are essential virtues for men. If those virtues are not exercised, the community will suffer violence, deceit and trickery from other cities, as well as from its own members. Given that the kind of restricted life women lead at home where they take personal responsibility for raising the males who will maintain harmony in the city and with its neighbors, temperance is an essential virtue. Without it, they

could not be patient with children, and could not give so much of their energies to caring for others.

But perhaps this is not what Phintys was suggesting. Perhaps she is suggesting that the cultivation of the virtues of justice and wisdom in the souls of women are *limited* by the social roles permitted to each. These social roles reflect a universal (to that culture) understanding that women's souls have *this* nature and men's souls have *that* nature. The society structures its roles in such a way that men have very limited opportunities to learn much about developing the virtues of women, and *vice versa*. There are undoubtedly other, equally plausible explanations for what Phintys means by the statement that particular virtues are more appropriate to members of a particular gender. But this interpretation is attractive if we recall that according to Phintys, courage, justice and wisdom are common to both men and women. Presumably, this is why it is fitting for a woman to philosophize. But generally, the normative principle of *harmonia* is to be satisfied within the context of specific social responsibilities.

3. *Women and Justice in the Home*

Phintys describes the many injustices created by a woman who is unfaithful. When she married, she took an oath, together with her parents and all her relatives. The oath was to "the gods of her race" and the gods of nature for the purposes of securing divine allies and protection for the entire extended family. Unfaithfulness jeopardizes this protection and therefore jeopardizes her entire family. In addition to the injustice she commits toward her family when she jeopardizes their divine protection, she commits a civil offense against the country. Marriage transfers the wardship of a woman from her parents to her husband. The woman violates this wardship by "not abiding among those who were duly appointed for her." This is a crime worse than those usually punishable by death. The unfaithful woman cannot hope for mercy, either, because the usual exculpatory claims (deceit, trickery, force on the part of her lover) are unavailable: her motivation to violate the law was the basest of criminal motives: pleasure.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

You have either reached a page that is unavailable for viewing or reached your viewing limit for this book.

ANCIENT WOMEN PHILOSOPHERS, 600 B.C. – 500 A.D.

This is the first volume of a set of four on the history of women in philosophy. It chronicles the contributions women have made to that most abstract of intellectual disciplines, philosophy. Translations of the aphorisms of Theano, the feminist ethical writings of Theano II, Phintys and Perictione, the socio-political theory of Aesara of Lucania and the *Sophias* of Perictione II demonstrate that women have been philosophers since *circa* 600 B.C.

A chapter on Aspasia, author of the *Epituphia* reported by Socrates in Plato's *Menexenus*, describes her role as a rhetorician. This volume challenges the view that Diotima was not a philosopher and was Plato's only fictitious character. The discussion of Hypatia's Commentaries on Diophantus and on Ptolemy belies the Suda's claim that all of her writings have perished. Chapters on Makrina's Christian philosophy and on Julia Domna's philosophic circle testify to ancient women's philosophical enterprises. A chapter describing the philosophic schools headed by Arete of Cyrene and by Asclepigenia, as well as the philosophic activities of Cleobulina of Rhodes, Hipparchia, Axiothea and Lasthenia completes the survey of ancient women's philosophical legacy.

HOWP 1

ISBN 90-247-3368-5
90000
9 789024 733682

ISBN 90-247-3348-0 (Hb)
ISBN 90-247-3368-5 (Pb)